



VITENSKAPELIG
HØYSKOLE
Norwegian School of
Theology, Religion and Society

Protecting the Potentiality of the Vulnerable

A Case Study of Centro de Atendimento e Assistência Social (CADI) as a
Faith-Based Organisation in Brazil

Etelney Silva Barbosa Junior

Supervisor

Sturla Stålsett, Dr. Theol.

Professor in Diaconal Studies, Religion and Society

MF Norwegian School of Theology, Religion and Society,

AVH5035: Thesis for Master in Religion, Society and Global Issues (60 ECTS),

Autumn 2019

Word count: 42 344



Acknowledgements

First, I want to express my gratitude to my supervisor, Professor Sturla Stålsett, for your patience, support and guidance through the entire process of this thesis.

It would never be possible to achieve this thesis without the support of CADI. Thank you, Maurício Cunha, Marcel Camargo and all the other participants who kindly provided the needed data.

I would like to thank my family and friends; I treasure your love and support. Thank you, Pedro Dulci, for the insights in the process.

My biggest most empathetic thanks goes to my wife, thank you for believing in me and supporting me in so many ways.

Ultimately, I give thanks to God in whom I live and move, and have my being.

Abstract

The purpose of this thesis is to increase our understanding of the role of Faith-Based Organisations (FBOs) in social development work in Brazil, seeing it as an instance of public theology. In particular, it addresses how the concepts of poverty, vulnerability, protection, and potentiality are understood and operationalised in one such Brazilian FBO, namely, the CADI (Centre for Service and Integral Development). The case study aims to answer the following research questions through analysis of in-depth interviews and written material, in light of existing scholarly literature on the field.

1. How are the concepts of poverty, vulnerability, protection, and potentiality understood by the participants of CADI, at different levels?
2. How does CADI exemplify the role of faith-based organisations in social development in present day Brazil?
3. Which role can a Public Theology play for interpreting these concepts?

The findings suggest the understanding of poverty in the work of CADI as multi-dimensional. Furthermore, the poor are held to have potentiality that should be protected. The study also finds that regarding vulnerability to each other as a common condition to all humans is crucial for such potentiality to thrive. Furthermore, the findings identify the emerging challenges for development endeavours in the Brazilian cultural framework and confirms the need for a public theology serving the processes of social development in the country.

Key words: Brazil, Poverty, Vulnerability, Protection, Potentiality, Faith Based-Organisation, Public Theology.

Acronyms

CADI – *Centro de Atendimento e Assistência Social* - Centre for Service and Integral Development

CRAS – *Centro de Referência de Assistência Social* – Social Assistance Reference Centre

ESV – English Standard Version

GDP – Gross Domestic Product

HDI – Human Development Index

IPEA – *Instituto de Pesquisa Econômica Aplicada* – Institute for Applied Economic Research

LOAS – *Lei Orgânica da Assistência Social* – Organic Law of Social Assistance

OPHI – Oxford Poverty & Human Development Initiative

PNAS – *Política Nacional de Assistência Social* – National Policy of Social Assistance

UN – United Nations

UNDG – United Nations Development Goals

UNDP – United Nations Development Programme

UNHCR – United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees

UNSDG – United Nations Sustainable Development Goals

Table of contents

- Acknowledgements iv
- Abstract v
- Acronyms vi
- 1. Introduction 1
 - 1.1 Personal Motivation 2
 - 1.2 Research Questions 2
 - 1.3 Theory 4
 - 1.4 Thesis Structure 5
- 2 Background Information 6
 - 2.1 Introduction 6
 - 2.2 The Faith-Based Organisation sample 6
 - 2.3 Brazil 8
 - 2.3.1 Background to the History of Brazil 9
 - 2.3.2 Religion in Brazil 10
 - 2.3.3 Poverty in Brazil 11
 - 2.3.4 Inequality in Brazil 12
- 3. Theoretical Framework 16
 - 3.1 Introduction 16
 - 3.2 Religion and Development Theory 16
 - 3.3 Faith-Based Organisation 20
 - 3.4 Perspectives on Poverty 24
 - 3.4.1 Poverty as Low Income 25
 - 3.4.2 Poverty as Multidimensional 26
 - 3.4.3 Poverty as Deprivation of Basic Capabilities 28
 - 3.5 Vulnerability 30

3.5.1	Meanings of Vulnerability	30
3.5.2	Vulnerability as Defencelessness, Insecurity and Exposure	31
3.5.3	Vulnerability as a Human Life Constituent Factor	34
3.5.4	Last remarks on Vulnerability	36
3.6	Public Theology	37
3.6.1	Theology and the Public Sphere.....	37
3.6.2	Publics of Public Theology	41
3.6.3	Public Theology and Development Thinking	42
3.6.4	Public Theology in the Bible.....	44
3.6.5	Civil Society	46
3.6.6	Ambiguities of Public Theology	48
4	Methodology	51
4.1	Field Trip and Data Sampling	51
4.2	Qualitative Interviewing.....	51
4.3	Qualitative Content Analysis	52
4.4	Research Validity and Reliability	52
4.5	Ethical Considerations and Limitations	53
5	Findings and Analysis	55
5.1	Introduction	55
5.2	How Do They Understand the Concept of Poverty?.....	55
5.2.1	Beneficiary Mothers	55
5.2.2	Staff Workers – a Social Worker and a Teacher	58
5.2.3	Local leaders	59
5.2.4	National leaders.....	65
5.3	How do they understand the concept of vulnerability?.....	72
5.3.1	Beneficiary Mothers	72

5.3.2 Staff workers – a Social worker and a Teacher.....	73
5.3.3 Local leaders	74
5.3.4 National leaders.....	77
5.4 How do they understand the concept of protection?	78
5.4.1 Beneficiary mothers	78
5.4.2 Staff workers – a Social worker and a Teacher.....	81
5.4.3 Local leaders	82
5.4.4 National leaders.....	86
5.5 How do they understand the concept of potentiality?	89
5.5.1 Beneficiary mothers	89
5.5.2 Staff workers – a Social worker and a Teacher.....	91
5.5.3 Local leaders	92
5.5.4 National leaders.....	94
6. Discussion	98
6.1 Poverty	98
6.1.1 Poverty as a multidimensional phenomenon.....	99
6.2 Vulnerability, Protection and Potentiality.....	102
6.2.1 Protecting the Potentiality of the Vulnerable	103
6.2.2 Protection and Potentiality - Hearing the Voice of the Poor.....	107
6.3 Faith-Based Organisation Typology	108
6.4 Public Theology	110
6.5 Summary	113
7. Conclusion.....	114
7.1 Main Conclusions.....	114
7.2 Suggestion for Further Research	117
References	118
Internet Sources.....	121

Appendix A: Interview Guide	124
Appendix B: Interview Quotations in Original Portuguese	125

1. Introduction

The presence and participation of religious positions in the society have been discussed as a recurring phenomenon in the last decades in academic thought. A brief look at recent history displays different events evidencing the opposite of the argument estimated by secularists. Secularisation theory preconised that religion would be regarded to the private and subjective dimension of life, and consequently, its gradual disappearance from the public sphere. Nevertheless, religious movements in smaller or larger scale are notorious in the civil society. The question with this phenomenon lays on the controversies of the incidence of religion. Among other influences, religious based movements have been resourceful in the processes to tackle poverty.

In the case of Brazil, the religious factor was often, or perhaps always present in the public sphere. Brazilian religious imaginary is marked by syntheses of the influences from beliefs (Schultz, 2008, p.30), which put forward validity and legitimacy to movements and relations in society. Therefore, faith reaches over the limits of the individual circumstances and private relationship with deity; rather, it occupies the social realms of the human experience.

In this study, I focus on the presence of faith in the effort for social development. A substantial part of the literature on religion and development covers the topic of the faith-based organisations, henceforth FBO. The development thought has recognised the FBOs' efficiency as protagonists, their influence as well as the holistic approach in their field. This form of organisation has the element of faith with respect to their origins and grounds as well as motive.

The term development is frequently used in this thesis. More than humanitarian aid in times of crises, it means a process with the scope to be sustainable as it applies to transform the lives of individuals and societies. As FBO is related to religion and development, I often will use the term faith interchanging with religion.

The organisation in the case study is the Centre for Service and Integral Development, which is a translation for *Centro de Desenvolvimento e Atendimento Integral - CADI*. CADI is a Christian FBO engaged with social development in the contexts of poverty in Brazil. It started in 1994. The organisation expanded their locations to different parts of the country, both in urban and rural areas.

Main themes emerge from the social development work of CADI. The selected ones for this thesis are poverty, vulnerability, protection and potentiality. As they stand out as current concerns in the daily reality of the life of the poor people in Brazil, I discuss their incidence and relevance for the participants of CADI in the light of theories on development, poverty, vulnerability and a public theology. In doing so, this thesis will provide new and useful knowledge for other scholars researching the ways for tackling poverty and how FBOs can contribute to the development in Brazil.

1.1 Personal Motivation

Attention to the field of faith and development has been emerging as an important subject in the sphere of study in the last decades. In the theoretical chapter, I give an overview of how this issue has been evolving, and several contributions have appeared. I understand that a holistic approach, considering the material and spiritual dimensions of the human experience, reflects better the reality for the benefit of furthering development studies.

I worked with a Christian FBO for several years in Brazil. This experience allowed me to know people, make friends, spend time at poor homes in communities which are exposed to social risks in the country. Many of them are of great encouragement as we share our faith together.

I understand that the Christian communities, individuals or groups, are called to serve the society in the whole counsel of God, if we really take seriously the words of Christ “You are the salt of the earth” and “You are the light of the world” in the Gospel of Matthew 5:13-14¹.

1.2 Research Questions

In this thesis, I seek to further understanding and knowledge of how Christian FBOs can employ the concepts of poverty, vulnerability, protection and potentiality to improve their practices for social transformation. While development policies can still be at odds with the religious factor, I see that the relationship between them can be improved as public theology is arising being a voice concerning the religious impact in the public sphere.

¹ All the Bible quotations in the thesis are from English Standard Version - ESV

CADI affirms in its presentation:

CADI is a coalition of Christian organisations that potentialize dreams and vocations for social transformation. We aim to be reference in actions of transformation, acting primarily to protect infancy, adolescence, and the family. Our coalition share the same vision, mission, values and methodologies for social intervention.

As a coalition we have a Christin belief and we understand the social development is part of the whole purposes of God in his redemptive action. The poor is the reason for our organisation to be. Our discourse, position and actions honour the poor in their struggles, yearnings and intrinsic dignity² (my translation).

CADI mission statement as it reads in the second article of their bylaws:

It is the mission of the Association: to accelerate social initiatives, provide assistance, promote access to rights as well as facilitate the integral development of people and families in context of social vulnerability, promoting transformation³ (my translation).

The concern with poverty, vulnerability, protection and potentiality emerge from these statements as important elements for CADI's social initiatives. These are key terms for this thesis. I aim to understand what those terms mean in practice and how they are interpreted by those engaged with CADI, in light of their life experience and Christian faith. Hence, I will consider the following research questions as I present the findings of my analyses discussed in the light of the existing theories.

² <https://cadi.org.br/quem-somos/>

CADI é uma coalizão de organizações cristãs que potencializam sonhos e vocações para a transformação social. Buscamos ser referência em ações transformadores, atuando prioritariamente na proteção à infância, à adolescência, e à família. Nossa coalizão partilha da mesma visão, valores e metodologias de intervenção social. Enquanto coalizão temos uma confessionalidade cristã e entendemos que o desenvolvimento social é parte dos plenos desígnios de Deus em sua ação redentora. O pobre é a razão de ser da nossa Organização. Nosso discurso, posicionamento e ações honram o pobre em suas lutas, anseios e em sua dignidade intrínseca.

³ Artigo 2º - Constitui-se como missão da Associação: Acelerar iniciativas sociais, prestar assistência, promover o acesso aos direitos e facilitar o desenvolvimento integral de pessoas e famílias em contexto de vulnerabilidade social, gerando transformação.

1. How are the concepts of poverty, vulnerability, protection, and potentiality understood by the participants of CADI, at different levels?
2. How does CADI exemplify the role of faith-based organisations in social development in present day Brazil?
3. Which role can a Public Theology play for interpreting these concepts?

1.3 Theory

Different theories on development and poverty began to emerge in academic studies which were more concerned with a people-centred development idea. An important shift in the way to approach development happened fruit of the work of Amartya Sen in *Development as Freedom* (1999) moving development assessment to a more centred in the own people's perspective as well as expounding the phenomenon of poverty. The multidimensional approach to poverty has come from the research of the Oxford Poverty & Human Development (OPHI).

In this vein, several pieces of research have been occurring in the last decades concerning the presence of FBOs in the development effort. Jeffrey Haynes in *Religion and Development: Conflict of Cooperation* (2007) led the way, followed by Gerald Clarke and Michael Jennings in *Development, Civil Society and FBO* (2008); Séverine Deneulin and Masooda Bano in the book *Religion in Development: Rewriting the Secular Script* (2009); and Matthew Clarke *Handbook of Research on Development and Religion* (2013), among other authors used in lesser extent.

The theories on vulnerability are led by the light of the Institute for Applied Economic Research in Brazil; Martin Prowse in his article *Towards a clearer understanding of vulnerability in relation to chronic poverty* (2003); and Judith Butler in *Frames of War, When is Life Grievable?* (2016). While the first delineates the vulnerability more or less as defencelessness, insecurity and exposure, the later transforms the concept giving a new meaning as an asset to be protected for life in society.

The theories on public theology are led mainly by the voices of David Tracy, in *The Analogical Imagination* (1981); Kjetil Fretheim, in *Interruption and Imaginations: Public Theology in times of crisis* (2016); and Rudolf von Sinner in *The Diaconal Church* (2019). Using their

theories, I assessed how can public theology contribute in relation to the public influence of faith, its processes and possibilities. These led to an interesting discussion in relation with the views of the responders.

1.4 Thesis Structure

The thesis is divided into seven chapters, including this introductory chapter. Chapter two provides the background for the thesis, placing the work of CADI in the context of Brazil with the challenges to tackle poverty in the country. Chapter three provides a theoretical framework of existing theories that are relevant to the analysis and discussion of the findings in the task to answer the research questions. Chapter four follows up with the methodology applied for data collection, transcriptions, undertaken ethical considerations, limitations for the researcher, ending with reliability and validity for this study. Chapter five presents the key findings obtained from the data, followed by analysis in the light of the theories presented. Chapter six contains the discussions with claims obtained from the relationship between the backgrounds, the theories presented, and the presented findings aiming to answer the research questions. The conclusion brings together the claims from the answers of the research questions that surround the thesis and provide suggestions for the ways to overcome challenges.

2 Background Information

2.1 Introduction

In this chapter of Backgrounds, I want to give an overview of the sample organisation for this research which is CADI. We aim to explain what CADI stands for, as well as, have an overview of the work of CADI in the field of social development with the context of poverty in Brazil, and how it has expanded and is recognised by civil society. I will also give some information on their structure and values and some figures for the outcomes of their endeavours over the country.

In the second part, I will present backgrounds about Brazil, the question of poverty in the country, presenting a short summary of the historical flow of Brazil. In the following subsection, I will give some notions on the social figures on the population of Brazil, followed by religiosity therein. Further on, some results on the latest report by IBGE – the Brazilian Institute of Geography and Statistics will be presented together with some affirmations provided by another report launched by the organisation Christian Aid which also does development work in the context of poverty in Brazil. Their report calls attention to the problem of inequality and how it not only perpetuates poverty, but rather jeopardises the efforts to tackle poverty, as it is conferred.

2.2 The Faith-Based Organisation sample

The organisation chosen for this research is CADI. CADI is an acronym in Portuguese for *Centro de Atendimento e Desenvolvimento Integral*, which means Centre for Service and Integral Development. As it is fixed in the founding bylaws of CADI, it is a legal entity, a civil organisation with assistance and cultural character, and it is also a non-profit in terms of the Brazilian legislation.

The work of CADI started in 1994, in Fazenda Rio Grande, a suburb borough in the state capital city of Paraná, a state in the South region of Brazil. In this first stage, after a communitarian diagnostic, they begin to run a football school and recreation activities oriented to youngsters and their families in a situation of poverty and social risk.

With time, it got to be known as a social movement. Also, different activities began to be done in the areas of education, health, sports, arts, culture, occupation courses, entrepreneurship, inclusive production and citizenship formation as it is informed in CADI strategic plan 2018 – 2023.

As the organisation grew, they expanded to different states in Brazil. New branches were founded. Today CADI has got nine different assistance unities through 7 states in the country, spread in 3 different regions, the Northeast, Southeast and South of Brazil. In 2012, the need for a national office raised, so CADI Brazil became a coalition of 11 organisations that share the same vision, mission, core values and methodology of social assistance. The national office is the headquarter offering consulting, technical quality, missional entrepreneurship coaching, Advocacy, and different courses for the organisation members of the coalition and consulting to different organisations, companies and religious institutions⁴.

Since 2017, it has been growing as well with partners in Asia and Africa⁵. It functions as an umbrella covering different smaller organisations members as they work together for the social development in their different locations and local challenges.

The vision statement of CADI is “to be a referential of excellency as a coalition of Christian organisations acting in actions for transformation”⁶ (my translation).

CADI introduces itself on their webpage as a coalition of Christian organisations aiming to potentialize dreams and vocations for social transformation. They understand social development as part of God’s purposes in his redemptive actions. CADI seeks to be a reference in transformational actions, acting primarily to protect infancy, adolescence and the family⁷. The poor in their intrinsic dignity, struggles and yearning are the reason for CADI to exist. They discourse and actions aim to honour the poor⁸.

⁴ <https://cadi.org.br/servicos/>

⁵ <http://cadi.org.br/quem-somos/>.

⁶ Ibid.

“Ser referencial de excelência como coalizão de organizações cristãs que atuam em ações transformadoras”

⁷ <https://cadi.org.br/quem-somos/>

⁸ Ibid.

The core values of CADI are: “Signalling the Kingdom of God; Commitment to the poor and vulnerable; Integrity; Transformational relationships; Family integration; and, Excellency”⁹ (my translation).

The yearly report by CADI in 2018 shows that 6.340 people were served by the activities of the organisation. It is estimated that 1.588 attended the centres of CADI weekly, 80% are children and adolescents, and 15.730 services were offered. The report also emphasised the commitment of CADI to the Sustainable Development Goals fixed by the UN¹⁰ They are directly (3) Good health and well-being; (4) Quality education; (5) Gender equality; (8) Decent work and economic growth; (16) Peace, justice and strong institutions; and (17) Partnerships for the goals. As their main scope is to work in the context of poverty, they are also committed to goal number 1, which is No Poverty.¹¹

In 2019, CADI was listed, for the second time, as one of the 100 best NGOs in the criteria of efficiency, management quality, transparency and good administration *Instituto Doar*¹². Every year, this institute assesses and awards different NGOs in the country. This recognition is an instrument for the promotion of the organisation, reaching a broad range in the public sphere in Brazil. Besides this recognition, CADI seems to be well received in the communities they are present and to run a successful work in the field of development in Brazil, as we are going to see later in the chapter with the answers for the participants of the interviews.

2.3 Brazil

The focus for this research is the work of development in the context of Brazil, more specifically the FBO CADI and their perceptions from the context where they are located, in poor communities. In order to understand better the context, I present here an overview of the history, religiosity, poverty and other aspects of Brazil.

⁹ <https://cadi.org.br/quem-somos/>

“Sinalização do Reino de Deus; Compromisso com o pobre e vulnerável; Integridade; Relacionamentos transformadores; Integração familiar; e, excelência”

¹⁰ <https://www.un.org/sustainabledevelopment/sustainable-development-goals/>.

¹¹ <https://cadi.org.br/>

¹² <https://cadi.org.br/cadi-brasil-esta-entre-as-100-melhores-ongs-do-brasil-pelo-instituto-doar/>

2.3.1 Background to the History of Brazil

Many people have known Brazil for the country's love for football; some may even joke “football, a religion”. Certainly, because of the passion demonstrated towards the sport. Far beyond being the country of the football, Brazil is complex and *sui generis* as nation.

Brazil is a former colony of Portugal. The colonisation developed in the midst of conflicts and different interests and forces. In the history of colonisation there are figures such as visionaries, missionaries, martyrs, evangelists, mystics, fortune seekers, among many other characters (González and González, 2008, p.xi). The Brazilian theologian Robinson Cavalcante utters that “Brazil is born under the cross and the sword” (Cavalcanti, 2011, p.19) (my translation)¹³. The encounter of Amerindians and Europeans, mentioned above, were marked with conflicts and religiosity. The first registered mass in Brazil was held on 26 April 1500. The European expansion towards the lands to be colonies were followed by the slave trade. In Brazil, both Indigenous and African populations were subjects to the slave trade. Brazil imported from Africa more slaves than any other country, as well as in a longer period. Brazil has got today the largest black population outside Africa today¹⁴. Slavery is one of the worst tragedies of Brazil and involves serious consequences of racial bigotry in society today.

In 1822, Brazil had its independence having an imperial govern till 1889, when after a military coup, Brazil became to be a Republic. No structural and systematic change actually happened for the society in the transitions from colony to an independent empire, and, further, from empire to republic, rather “fundamental social and economic continuity” kept going on. Despite of improvements, the country still perpetuates the social dynamics that often nurture injustice and poverty (Ibid.).

Brazil had a period under military dictatorship from 1964 to 1985. The official name of the country is the Federative Republic of Brazil. The Constitution promulgated in 1988, also known as *Constituição Cidadã* – Civic Constitution, was a hallmark on the road to consolidate democracy in the country. Nevertheless, the implementation of the provisions and mechanisms of the Federal Constitution to all citizens is a challenge still to be met. The young and fragile

¹³ “O Brasil nasce sob a cruz e a espada”.

¹⁴ <https://www.ufjf.br/ladem/2010/01/24/negros-do-mundo/>.

democracy is observed to struggle to settle in Brazil today. Thus, it is evident the disillusion with the slog and slowness of democratic consolidations that reaches the ordinary daily life facing the huge challenges of Brazilian society and even more the antidemocratic threats active in the society. The invigoration of the civil democratic state in Brazil cannot be taken for granted, and unfortunately, it is yet not beyond the reach of any anti-democratic claims and reactions. Certainly, it is challenged by the economic inequality as well as economic stagnation so present in Brazilian society. (Freston, 2008, p.4).

2.3.2 Religion in Brazil

Brazil has got the largest Roman Catholic population in the world today. Also, the Roman Catholic Church is the biggest religious institution in the country¹⁵ According to the research by the Pew Research Center in 2013, it is estimated 123 million Catholics in Brazil, which makes a majority of the population. Being Catholic is relatively natural in Brazil. Despite the fact that there is no official religion in Brazil, the Catholic Church is profoundly embroiled in the way the culture, beliefs as well as institutions are perceived in Brazil. It plays a significant role in the public sphere in the country¹⁶.

A phenomenon has been overserved in the last decades, an expressive increasing number of citizens that define themselves as Evangelicals, about 20% of the population (Sinner, 2012, p.16). The report from the Brazilian Institute of Geography and Statistics – IBGE – last official census run in 2010, shows that the group has been facing a fast-growing phenomenon recently. According to this IBGE census, they have reached the mark of 22.2% of the population¹⁷. Together with the increasing in numbers, their public appearance is evidenced too, mainly because of the Pentecostal and New Pentecostal branch, "being highly practicing and fast-growing, predominantly lower class, and organised in a plethora of nationally created denominations" (Freston, 2008, p.15).

¹⁵ <https://www.pewforum.org/2013/07/18/brazils-changing-religious-landscape/>.

¹⁶ <https://rlp.hds.harvard.edu/faq/catholic-church-brazil>

¹⁷ <https://agenciadenoticias.ibge.gov.br/agencia-sala-de-imprensa/2013-agencia-de-noticias/releases/14244-asi-censo-2010-numero-de-catolicos-cai-e-aumenta-o-de-evangelicos-espiritas-e-sem-religiao>

Other religions had also been growing in the last decades as it shows the 2010 national census. The Afro-Brazilian religions such as *Candomblé* and Umbanda; Spiritisms and the other global religions such as Islam and Buddhism had shown an increase of adherents too as they represent 5% of the population¹⁸.

2.3.3 Poverty in Brazil

The number 1 priority of the UN Sustainable Development Goals is to “end poverty and in all its forms everywhere”. According to the UN, extreme poverty and the struggles caused by it is lived by more than 700 million people in the world. Despite some achievements in the fight against poverty being observed, the “growing inequality is detrimental to economic growth and undermines social cohesion, increasing political and social tensions”¹⁹.

According to the World Bank report on the economies of the world in 2018, Brazil is the 9th position²⁰. It is, in fact, a rich economy comparing to the other economies in Latin America. Despite such numbers, the reality of poverty has always been present in Brazil. Indeed, recently the situation has been aggravating, as we are going to show bellow.

The World Bank points out that Brazil had experienced social and economic advancement in the period of 2003 to 2014. In these years, it is counted that 29 million people left poverty. And inequality, which is one of the worst problems and challenges in the country, had a significant decline together with poverty in that period. The numbers provided by the World Bank show that "the income level of the poorest 40% of the population increase by an average of 7.1% (in real terms)" in the 11 years from 2003 to 2014. On the other hand, taking the population as a whole, the increase was of 4.4%. This was a different phenomenon, comparing to the usual rates. Nevertheless, such improvements to reduce poverty and inequality in the following year after 2014, seem to be stagnated.²¹

The last report by IBGE, on the numbers on conditions of life, inequality and poverty in Brazil, shows the updated scenario to 2019, confirming the overview by the World Bank above

¹⁸ <https://www.pewforum.org/2013/07/18/brazils-changing-religious-landscape/>

¹⁹ <https://www.un.org/sustainabledevelopment/poverty/>

²⁰ <https://databank.worldbank.org/data/download/GDP.pdf>

²¹ <https://www.worldbank.org/en/country/brazil/overview>

mentioned. On the 6th of November, IBGE launched the result of the research affirming that “extreme poverty affects 13.5 million persons and hits highest levels in seven years”²². Using the data basis from 2018, this number signifies 6.5% of the whole population of the country living with less than 1.9 dollars a day which is the poverty line defined by the World Bank.

It is at least a great paradox the reality of such a rich country with such a high number of population in the situation of poverty. The data comes from an indicator used by IBGE to analyse the social factors in Brazil, the SIS (Summary of Social Indicators). In fact, the report highlights the pressing need for “public policies to fight extreme poverty, because it reaches a more vulnerable group and with more reduced conditions”²³. Another highlight brought by this research is the geographical distribution of poverty. The states in the Northeast are the ones with almost half of the population below the poverty line, while the South region is on the other extreme.

2.3.4 Inequality in Brazil

Despite the importance of economic measurement of poverty, the problem of poverty is far more complex. In a society like Brazil, it is related to several factors. It is indeed a multidimensional issue; violence, lack of health and access to education, among other factors are major problems in the context of poverty. Further, these factors are constantly in the news, in a frame of tragedies related to suffering, death, mainly in the context of poverty where the most vulnerable groups of the population are.

Multidimensional elements of poverty are clear in its manifestation. The referred report by IBGE shows that that earnings of households are unbalanced. The Afro-descendant and darker-skinned represent 72.7% of the population under the poverty line; besides this, the women in this group represent the majority below poverty line. This last official report shows clearly that there is a racial and gender-based manifestation of poverty²⁴.

²²<https://agenciadenoticias.ibge.gov.br/en/agencia-news/2184-news-agency/news/25895-extreme-poverty-affects-13-5-million-persons-and-hits-highest-level-in-seven-years>

²³ Ibid.

²⁴ Ibid.

Further on, the report shows that the majority of the population below the poverty line do not have access to water supply from a general system, nor appropriate sewerage disposal, nor rubbish collection services. The problem of lack of adequate sanitation as well as adequate housing is addressed in the report²⁵.

The reality of poverty in Brazil goes in together with the flow of the historical line of the country, marked with differences and conflicts since the beginning of the meeting with the Amerindians, Africans and Europeans. Despite the rich cultural mosaic this meeting created in the country, it was forged with conflicts, racism, violence for different interests.

As it is claimed by the report *The Real Brazil: The inequality behind the statistics* by the organisation Christian Aid, “inequality is the major challenge to development efforts”²⁶. The challenge in the case of Brazil, in the indicative figures as well as most of the policies to deal with the problem of poverty is that the problem of inequality, when it is address, comes only in terms of economic inequality, not dealing with the boarder social arrangements that often nurse inequality in various dimensions. Indeed, the problem of inequality is observed even in the context of high GDP (Sen, 1999, p.87–90). The assumption that economic growth is fundamental for development is proved, however, in instances like Brazilian, economic growth alone does not deal with the mechanisms that foment inequality, and consequently poverty²⁷.

As is it spelt out by the report of Christian Aid:

With democratic institution still in the process of consolidation, Brazil has the peculiar characteristic of being a country of average income that stands out because of its recent economic dynamism. Nevertheless, instead of seeing a substantial reduction of inequality, it has shown considerable resilience. It is therefore a paradigmatic case for other developing countries, since in spite of the fact that, in theory, the objective condition for addressing it are in place,

²⁵ Ibid.

²⁶ <https://www.christianaid.org.uk/sites/default/files/2017-08/the-real-brazil-may-2012.pdf>.

²⁷ Ibid.

inequality appear in new guises, at least to those who keep track of more disaggregated indicators and are willing to look at it.²⁸

In the point, if inequality is tackled not only by economic improvements, but even more by political changes, social and cultural reforms. There are more cultural patterns that are engrafted in the society that demands a reformation, if inequality is to be addressed and deal with, in order to afford an efficient and lasting development.²⁹

The report launched by the UN in 2019 about Human Development Index (HDI), also demonstrates that the level of inequality of Brazil is the second highest in the world, below only Qatar in this list. It also points that while the poorest 40% of the population holds about 10.6% of the income share, the 10% richest part of the population holds 41.9% of the income share, and 28.3% of income share is held by the richest 1% of the population. The UN document also warns that 6.2% of the population is vulnerable to multidimensional poverty, numbers that follow the trend of the research of the IBGE. Both reports present the tendency to an increase in the evolution of inequality in Brazil. Regarding the HDI, despite the fact that Brazil improved a bit from 2017 to 2018, It went down one position. It holds now the 79th place out of the 189 nations in the HDI list by the UN. Norway ranks in the first position in the HDI. This index spells out the challenges that Brazil has regarding access to education and health, highlighting the poignant need in those areas for the infancy³⁰.

Historically the actions taken by the state in Brazil were addressed to prioritise more economic concerns that social concerns in general. This trend is a key element to understand the economic growth while sustainable social development seems to be slow. Inequality of race, gender, education, employment access, to name a few, are part of the mechanism and are taken for granted, therefore neglected in many discussions of the processes of development. For the organisation Christian Aid, this neglect is a key element for the inefficiency of the social development programmes. Historical, cultural, and political backgrounds are to be taken

²⁸ Ibid.

²⁹ Ibid.

³⁰ <http://hdr.undp.org/sites/default/files/hdr2019.pdf>

seriously together with the economic dimension which usually is prioritised in detriment of the other subjects.³¹

2.3 Conclusion remarks

In *Vozes do Bolsa Família*, published in Brazil in 2014, Walquiria Rego and Alessandro Pinzani argue that “the poor in Brazil live continually under in a strain: on the one hand, they are excluded and humiliated by part of an economical and legal system that undermine them; on the other hand, they receive the appeal to see themselves as part of this same system, e so, they respect their rules, as well as social and legal norms”³² (Rego and Pinzani, 2014, p.39) (my translation). This tension is observed in Brazil when the poor are often portrayed as lazy, irresponsible, useless, the only cause of their own situation. Having been labelled in such a way they are excluded from the society and at the same time bonded to behave and committed member of thereof. This tension is interspersed in the Brazilian society, which is taken for granted whilst it is systematic and relational (ibid., p.39–41).

In the context of challenges and paradoxes for the social development in Brazil, there are several organisations, religious and non-religious, engaged with social development with the populations in high vulnerability, poverty and social risk.

³¹ <https://www.christianaid.org.uk/sites/default/files/2017-08/the-real-brazil-may-2012.pdf>.

³² “Os pobres no Brasil vivem continuamente em uma tensão: por um lado, são excluídos e humilhados por parte de um sistema econômico e legal que os prejudica; por outro, recebem o apelo a se considerarem parte do mesmo sistema e, assim, respeitarem suas regras e normas sociais e legais.”

3. Theoretical Framework

3.1 Introduction

This chapter provides the theoretical framework for the topic in question. The aim is to place the thesis in the context of the debate about development, FBOs, poverty, vulnerability and public theology in relation to the work of CADI.

I will start by reviewing how the development thought has been evolving and the presence of religion in the perceptions of development. Secondly, a theoretical approach on FBO, its processes and impact in development and the types of them. The third part touches the phenomenon of poverty, followed by the term vulnerability. The final part is about public theology, its processes in the civil society as well the challenges and ambiguities implicit in it.

3.2 Religion and Development Theory

The presence and influence of religion in the processes of development are diverse and show a range of examples and characteristics. As it is pointed by the Séverine Deneulin and Masooda Bano in their work *Religion in Development: Rewriting the secular script*; “if this relationship is mapped across time, space and religious tradition, the combination of possible connections becomes almost limitless”. A vast range regarding religion and development is observed (Deneulin and Bano, 2009, p.1).

The role of religion have been, however, absent from the thinking and theory of development in academia in general and in the policies. Part of this absence is grounded on the view that development and secularisation of societies go together as it was predicted by the classic social theory. In this sense the most a society is modernised, the most it becomes secular. Therefore, the role of religion would be constrained to the private and subjective sphere of individuals, and consequently eliminated from the public sphere as it would fade away eventually (Deneulin and Bano, 2009, p.52-53).

Despite of the different theories that somehow approach the concept of development, it was only after the Second World War that a development thinking came to the forestage as a study field on its own. That does not mean there was not at some level efforts to improve lives from poverty. However, it is a recent phenomenon the take on development as a prominent position

in the arena of international political priorities. As pointed by Matthew Clarke, the inauguration speech of the American President Truman in 1949 is “largely recognized as the starting point of the international commitment to improving the lives of the poor” (Clarke, 2013, p.2). This phenomenon does not come to pass only perchance; there is a historical framework that caused so to happen.

One of the political reasons pointed is that the political salience the development theory gained its ground on the “focus on a ‘Third World’ caught between the competing appeals of a capitalist ‘First World’ and a communist ‘Second World’ and the very different paths of development they offered up as alternatives”. In this sense, the so-called developing countries found themselves in the middle ground of the pressures caused by the Cold War and implications of each side of thereof approaches and policies (Payne and Phillips, 2010, p.56).

While both sides defended their own proposal and different approaches on development, the understanding of the goal was to reach modernisation. “The goal of development for both theories was still economic growth, but the means of development was now a choice between Marxist or capitalist economics”. In the case of the Western World, modernization would mean somehow westernisation, as development was understood as the size of the economy of the country. Traditional values or cultures of the poor societies would need to be reshaped into a western market system, they would be seen as hindrances to modernity and consequently not conducting to economic growth (Myers, 2011, p.27-28).

Séverine Deneulin and Carole Rakodi indicate that the “belief in the capacity of governments to deliver prosperity and wellbeing” together with the “confidence that economic policies could deliver economic stability, growth and prosperity” contributed for the perception of religion as a constraint to modernisation hence irrelevant in the whole development discourse. The association with the “long history of religious competition for dominance and state control in Europe had led to a preference for church-state separation”. Thus, such neglect of religion relation to development either in policies and academic works are more a related to “historical and cultural processes in the colonizing countries than the reality in the newly independent countries” (Deneulin and Rakodi, 2011, p.45).

The historical economical based approach was put into question facing its incapacity to deliver growth, welfare and prosperity for societies on its one. A special issue of the journal World

Development with the title 'Religion and Development' was issued in 1980. This publication is a milestone in the development discourse as it represents one of the first referential to the relevance of religion therein (Clarke, 2012, p.6). The shift was important in the direction of development from the perspective of the poor, even including their religious attitude as well. (Deneulin and Rokodi, 2011, p.45).

The reality of religion in the lives of the people in the developing world and in the majority of the developed countries too had put into question the assumption for development studies "that secularization is a universal, desirable, and irreversible trend". Thus, the development studies need to engage with the worldview of religions to be able to understand the construction of "social, economic, and political" views and behaviour related to the peoples' faith framework (Ibid.). The results that proved that economic growth does not necessarily imply a reduction of poverty created a discontentment with the secularisation effort.

An important shift in the way to approach and measure development happened in the 1990s. Fruit of the work of the development economist Amartya Sen. The proposal was to move the development assessment from only focusing on the GDP to another index more centred in the people themselves. Therefore, the result would also include the Human Development Index. "HDI added life expectancy as an indicator for health and literacy as an indicator for knowledge and education to GDP as a measure of standard of living" (Myers, 2011, p.28).

Amartya Sen proposed that development can be seen "as a process of expanding the real freedoms that people enjoy". He argues over the argument that "development requires the removal of major sources of unfreedom: poverty as tyranny, poor economic opportunities as well as systematic social deprivation, neglect of public facilities as well as intolerance or overactivity of repressive states" (Sen, 1999, p.3). Sen sees freedom "not only as the primary ends of development" but as well as its main means, thus he brings up the sorts of "rights and opportunities that are tool to help the "general capability of a person". As it is framed by Sen, they are: (1) Political freedoms; (2) Economic facilities; (3) Social opportunities; (4) Transparency guarantees; (5) Protective security (Ibid., p. 10). Now the understanding of capabilities are related to what people are able to do or to choose as Sen is bringing the argument that the well-being of humans "needs to be understood as people having the capability", or

freedom in his given meaning, “to seek functionings in their world that the people themselves deem valuable” (Myers, 2011, p.30).

An important advance with this shift is the fact that the understanding of development sees the economy not as an end itself but one more in the midst of other means of development. Its rule is more incidental also. This new way takes the understanding and pursuit of development also from the poor and is a remarkable shift. This transformation gave room for the new focus on the role of religion in the development thought.

Another important moment in the field of development was the project *Voices of the Poor*. This project was launched in the early 2000s by the World Bank. It consists of 3 books with the findings of their research. These three books are “based on an unprecedented effort to gather the views, experiences, and aspirations of more than 60.000 poor men and women from 60 countries” (Narayan et al., 2000, p.IX). The findings of this project brought about the inexorable reality that not only the material aspect of life but also relational or social as well as psychological and spiritual factors are pivotal to development theory, therefore a more holistic approach came to the reflexion not only on development but poverty as well (Myers, 2011, p.31–32).

As part of the change in the context that made the shift in development studies possible, is the recognition that religion is present in the public discourse, consequently in the public sphere so as politics. Habermas argues that religious traditions as well as communities of faith have got quite a new political role in the last thirty years, this new relevance was unexpected. While his former view supported that religion would play a role mostly in private life. Habermas’ post-secular theory stands for the understanding of the re-entrance of religion into the public sphere (Habermas, 2006, p.1).

In the article *Revising Religion: Development Studies Thirty Years On*, Deneulin and Rakodi argue that there are three trends related to the historical transformations in the context of development. The first of them is the religious resurgence. They claim that “the success of political parties that claim explicit allegiance to religious principles in gaining political power in some countries, especially Iran, alarmed Western countries”. This resurgence has contributed to “broader changes in the global geo-political context and the transformation of international relations” (Deneulin and Rakodi, 2011, p.46).

Secondly, is the relevance of religion for people's lives and identities. This importance of religion in people's lives is continued and evident, especially in developing countries, but noticed in developed ones too. This trend is difficult to be assessed straightforward, since the understanding of what religion is and what it means to be religious differ so much. It can differ at high or low levels and from people to people. Nevertheless, it is a trend once folk usually interpret the world around them and discern life in the light of their beliefs (Ibid.,). The effect of religion as an instrument that creates a base for social as well as political mobilisation cannot be neglected.

Finally, the third trend is related to the phenomenon of non-governmental organisations, and specifically in this present case, the FBOs. This fact is associated with the downsizing and limitation of the state to provide well-being. The frustration with the state's inability to meet the expectations in development gave space for many organisations, either secular or faith-based ones. The political force of the religions can be perceived at the local level as well as in international dimensions. They affect governments in different countries. "Social justice is central to the teaching of many religions" (Ibid., p.48). This dimension of religion in the public sphere will be considered further on in this thesis, and the importance and work of FBOs are one of the focus of this work.

3.3 Faith-Based Organisation

Initially, it is necessary to highlight that historically religious organisations and communities have a long engagement with the work of development, even from before the development thought in academia had been developed. Deneulin and Rakodi argue that "religious bodies have always been associated with educational provision" which is an aspect of development. Care for orphans, for instance, have also been done, in the course of time, by "religiously based charitable giving". They also claim that "Christian mission activity during the colonial period was (for a variety of motives) accompanied by welfare activities" (Deneulin and Rakodi, 2011, p.48).

The trust in the capacity of the governments to deliver the means for the well-being in the society and the confidence in the economic policies to prompt the way for prosperity and economic stability made the religious factor to be neglected in the field of development studies

as well as in the policies of development. However, their failure to provide security, prosperity and well-being diffidence, as well as the pressure to downsize the state, in the decade of the 1980s, together with the actual limitation of a government, led to the renewal of the reliance on the non-state providers. (Ibid., p.47-48). In this absence, an open room for religious institutions were broadened. They have, therefore, stepped in as providers. In the same direction argue Tara Hefferan, Julie Adkins and Laurie Occhipinti as they point that the FBOs “have proliferated, often filling the gaps born of the state neglect and retraction by designing and delivering social services and development programming”. Furthermore, they argue that “as governments divest themselves of social spending as part of a neoliberal agenda, FBOs may pick up the pieces, operate in the margins, where governments services leave off.” (Hefferan, Adkins and Acchipinti, 2009, p.1-2).

While some FBOs see themselves in the work of filling the gaps, as mentioned in the previous paragraph, other FBOs do not operate in these ways, not even see themselves in this position. There are also several FBOs that run their work positioning themselves actively in resistance and denouncing the policies as well as priorities that create social struggles such as poverty, inequality, warfare, suffering and so on (Hefferan et al, 2009, p.2). Deneulin and Radoki spell out that “The role of religious organizations as civil society actors has to be reckoned with, not only in the delivery of social services but also in advocacy”. The influence of the FBOs can be either conservative or radical. Their prominence has been seen in societies. The authors also claim that the theme of social justice is present in many religions. In their turn, they seem to deeply affect the movements in society (Deneulin and Radoki, 2011, p.48).

Gerald Clarke and Michael Jennings use the term FBO “in reference to any organization that derives inspiration and guidance for its activities from the teachings and principles of the faith or from a particular interpretation or school of thought within the faith” (Clarke, 2008, p.6).

The UN High Commissioner for Refugees launched a note under the title *On Faith-Based Organizations, Local Faith Communities and Faith Leaders* in 2014. According to this research the term FBO applies to “describe a broad range of organizations influenced by faith. They include religious and religion-based organizations/groups/networks; communities belonging to a place of religious worship specializes religious institutions and religious social services agencies; and registered or unregistered non-profit institutions that have a religious character

or mission.”³³. The same research claims that FBOs are present in the list of the top ten implementing partners of the UNHCR.

According to Hefferan et al. since 2001, with the creation of the Office of Faith-based and Community Initiatives in the United States, the meaning of “the term FBO has been expanded to include a wide range of organizations, which may or may not be linked to congregations but do have an element of religiosity”. They also state that by FBO, a lot of things can be meant. Some may focus on “evangelizing and converting the populations with whom they work; others engage faith only insofar as it motivates the individuals who provide services within the organizations” (Hefferan et al. 2009, p.7). There is a vast range from simple charity to meet the immediate need to promoting relationships between humans and so on. FBOs can be “essential conduits of information, resources, and culture between the global north and south” (Ibid., p.1).

Jeffrey Haynes points to the fact that FBOs are widely noted as “one of the driving forces working to effect improved development, political and social agendas” (Haynes, 2007, p.46). In the Sub-Saharan Africa, “FBOs provide at least 40% of health services” according to World Health studies in 2007. Another instance, in the same direction, is seen in Malawi and Zambia where about “a third of the national health services” is provided with the contribution of Christian health services. In other countries in Africa between 40% and 50%, and in India 10% (Deneulin and Rakodi, 2011, p.48).

Haynes raises the question of the relation between FBOs, secular organisations and governments. While the important role of FBOs in development is recognised, on the other hand, others claim that religion can lead to complications as well as strife since religious issues can be divisive (Haynes, 2007, p.46). He also provides claims of recognised aspects of the role of FBOs. In his own words: FBOs “are an important part of civil society whose engagement can help achieve increased tolerance, social cohesion and understanding; FBOs “have a key role in providing education and achieving local and global justice, gender equality, and action for non-violent resolutions to conflict.” (Ibid., p.48).

³³ <https://www.unhcr.org/en-au/539ef28b9.pdf>

Clarke and Jennings see the growth and proliferation of FBOs in different contexts, hence FBOs are situated in a “complex set of actors in development context”. In order to apprehend better the range of FBOs, in their work they bring about the contexts for FBOs limiting to the organisations which are concerned with: (1) “public policy debates and associated political contests concerned with national and international development” (2) social and political processes that impact positively or negatively on the poor”, and the last on (3) “direct efforts to support, represent or engage with the poor” (Clarke, 2008, p.24-25). It is important to mark that this list is not conclusive but gives an idea and clarifying the context for the FBO to be identified.

Clarke also has two typologies to categorise somehow the FBOs. These typologies are important as they help to understand better the nature of a FBO, and the scope of their work. The first one is a five folded typology; Despite of being broad. It is related the organisational contexts, and the variety of impacts that FBOs can provide.

Here follows his first typology (Clarke, 2008, p.25)

- (1) Faith-based representative organizations or apex bodies which rule on doctrinal matters, govern the faithful and represent them through engagement with the state and other actors.
- (2) Faith-based charitable or development organizations which mobilize the faithful in support of the poor and other social groups, and which fund or manage programmes which tackle poverty and social exclusion.
- (3) Faith-based and socio-political organizations which interpret and deploy faith as political construct, organizing and mobilizing social groups on the basis of faith identities but in pursuit of broader political objectives or, alternatively, promote faith as a social-cultural construct, as a means of uniting disparate social groups on the basis of faith-bases cultural identities.
- (4) Faith-based missionary organizations which speak key faith messages beyond the faithful, by actively promoting the faith and seeking converts to it, or by supporting and engaging with other faith communities on the basis of key faith principles.
- (5) Faith-based radical, illegal or terrorist organizations which promote radical or militant forms of faith identity, engage in illegal practices on the basis of faith beliefs or engage in armed struggles or violent acts justified on the grounds of faith.

The width of this typology is quite large, and certainly, an organization can straddle to more than one category.

The second typology developed by Clarke relates more to the way faith is deployed by the FBO regarding their work. It has four variables that are quoted here:

- (1) **Passive** - the faith is subsidiary “to broader humanitarian principles as a motivation for action and in mobilizing staff and supporters and play a secondary role to humanitarian considerations in identifying, helping or working with beneficiaries and partners.”
- (2) **Active** – the faith “provides an important and explicit motivation for action and in mobilizing staff and supporters. It plays a direct role in identifying, helping or working with beneficiaries and partners, although there is no overt discrimination against non-believers and the organization supports multi-faith cooperation.”
- (3) **Persuasive** – the faith “provides an important and explicit motivation for action and in mobilizing staff and supporters. It plays a significant role in identifying, helping or working with beneficiaries and partners and provides the dominant basis for engagement. It aims to bring new converts to the faith, or to advance the interests of the faith”
- (4) **Exclusive** – the faith “provides the principal or overriding motivation for action and in mobilizing staff and supporters. It provides the principal or sole consideration in identifying beneficiaries. Social and political engagement is rooted in the faith, or a branch of the faith, and it is often militant or violent and/or directed against one of more rival faiths”
(Ibid., p.33).

In general, organisations place themselves in one of these variables. Both typologies mentioned are important for this thesis and will help to clarify the understanding of the role and practices of CADI as a faith-based organisation in the context of development in Brazil.

3.4 Perspectives on Poverty

Poverty is one of the most important terms for development endeavours. It seems that the meaning and understanding of poverty is taken for granted, once it is quite spread and familiar in the public discourse. Nevertheless, there is a serious risk to just get used to the expression and to see it as a far abstraction. Far from being an abstract concept, poverty is related to human beings with names, stories, families, feeling, needs as any other. All in all, poverty reaches out lives of real peoples. Such abstraction can be damaging since it can result in a distance e eventually denial (Meyers, 2011, p.105-106). Therefore, it is important to not simply get it as an abstract term, rather, an actual reality related and affecting the humankind as it is, in fact, a vast, challenging present problem to the work of transformational development organisations.

Why is it important to define poverty for this thesis? Such a definition will help to format the way to comprehend the work of CADI as a FBO in contact with poverty and its effects straight in their fronts and day-to-day activities.

Debates on poverty and its causes are vast and have been observed in the public arena for a longer time than development theory itself. The notion of poverty is long present in the scope of religions. In general, the main religions had and have always approached the theme in one or other way in their institutions, practices, and activities (Clarke, 2013, p.7).

In this section, we will give a few approaches to the definition of poverty. The aim here is not to give a concluded list of definitions. Poverty is such a complex theme. I aim to give some grounds for understanding better the need and relevance of a development work of the sake of the humankind and human dignity.

3.4.1 Poverty as Low Income

The perspective of poverty based on low income is called monetary poverty by the definition of the World Bank. In the report *Piecing together the poverty puzzle*, launched by the World Bank in 2018, monetary poverty is defined as a person “deprived if the household consumption or income per person per day falls below the International Poverty Line” (IPL). This measure line is put up by the World Bank. According to the report by the World Bank, since 2011 the IPL is considered US\$1.90 by the World Bank (Jolliffe and Lugo, 2018, p.164).

It is certainly quite important and necessary to understand poverty in terms of income and consumption conditions, “defining poverty on the basis of income makes intuitive sense. In modern economies, money gets us access to goods and services, and income is the acquisition of money” (Volf and McAnnally-Linz, 2016, p.70). It is a tool of measurement which makes it possible to be objective, as well as easy to measure from an economic perspective beside making the work of tracing poverty somehow easier. Another advantage is also the possibility it gives of working with comparisons, data analysis, and so on.

Despite those advantages and importance, measuring poverty based on economy has its disadvantages. One of them is that limiting the definition and approach in just income terms is insufficient to demonstrate a thorough and deep definition of poverty, since poverty affects further on several aspects of human life and societies. Here lies the problem, the fact that the dimensions of human life go further than just the capability of being a consumer and above this, that way is not even how the poor themselves comprehend their own situation in poverty.

Seeing poverty within the terms of insufficient income is probably the only way most people have somehow been trained to infer their concept of poverty. Increasing income is observed as an important policy and must be developed; however, taking poverty only on monetary terms can miss a lot. This also causes the fact that the remedy for it is also limited, in its turn, only as income increase. By contrast, it is morally adequate to conceptualise it more broadly, therefore go beyond the income enhancement approach (Bailey, 2010, p.1-2).

3.4.2 Poverty as Multidimensional

As the development theory has been evolving towards a more holistic approach so has the understanding of poverty too. Séverine Deneulin and Masooda Bano argue that “the gradual understanding of poverty as a multidimensional phenomenon also constitutes a shift. (Deneulin and Bano, 2009, p.43). It reassures the multi-facets of poverty and its various dimensions. This effort gives more room for considering as well as apprehending the perspective the emerge from the experiences of poor peoples in different places and contexts in the globe. Such understanding is consistent with the shift that the development thinking underwent as it is mentioned in the specific chapter thereof. This study corroborates the understanding that poverty restricted to only income is an incomplete view (Thacker, 2017, p.35).

An initiative by the Department of International Development of the Oxford University, the Oxford Poverty & Human Development Initiative (OPHI) is a centre for economic research and policy established in 2007³⁴. It highlights that the monetary-based approach to conceptualise poverty can miss a lot. They understand the monetary aspect as an important indicator; however, no single indicator can provide a thorough comprehension of the various dimensions of poverty³⁵. For this reason, the need to comprehend poverty as a multidimensional phenomenon. OPHI gives their definition for multidimensional poverty on their webpage as it follows in their own words:

Multidimensional poverty encompasses the various deprivations experienced by poor people in their daily lives – such as poor health, lack of education,

³⁴ <https://ophi.org.uk/about/>

³⁵ <https://ophi.org.uk/policy/multidimensional-poverty-index/>

inadequate living standards, disempowerment, poor quality of work, the threat of violence, and living in areas that are environmentally hazardous, among others.

A multidimensional measure of poverty can incorporate a range of indicators that capture the complexity of this phenomena in order to inform policies aimed at reducing poverty and deprivation in a country. Depending on the context of a country and the purpose of the measure, different indicators can be chosen to reflect the needs and priorities of a nation, as well as its constituent regions, districts, provinces, etc.³⁶

The OPHI seems to defend that it is necessary to incorporate several indicators to be able, then, to apprehend the complexity of poverty, so the appropriate policies and measures to tackle it take into consideration the factors of the numerous contexts from countries to countries, regions, districts or areas.³⁷

Dan Banik also spells out that poverty is a multidimensional concept. The reason for a vast range of dimensions is grounded on the complexity of the phenomenon of poverty. While low income is one of the major indicators, nevertheless it is only one in the range of several. “The lives of the poor are characterised by deprivation and the lack of entitlements to food, health, education, environmental protection and other security provision and political influence” (Banik, 2006, p. 11). Further, he argues that “there are also great disparities across countries and regions in terms of income poverty and standard living”. For this reason, poverty entails a variety of meanings from needs such as “lack of material goods and services; limited resources, low standard of living, lack of basic security (e.g. vulnerability to social risks), inequality, exclusion, and dependency”. Hence poverty is associated with “multiple deprivation” together with “socially unacceptable hardship” (Ibid., p.11).

In the same direction Paul Hopper appoints that the nature of poverty is multidimensional; In his own words regarding defining poverty, he states that “it follows that its different aspects

³⁶ Ibid.

³⁷ Ibid.

affect various population groups in different ways”. The poor are heterogeneous (Hopper, 2012, p.18). Still in the framework of multidimensional poverty, Hopper also points that poverty can be defined in absolute, relative and extreme terms:

- (1) Absolute poverty: “describes a condition where incomes are so low that even a minimum standard of nutrition, shelter and personal necessities cannot be maintained”. (World bank in 1975 in Hopper, 2012, p.18)
- (2) Relative poverty: “refers to people who do not enjoy a sense of well-being and/or are materially disadvantaged compared to other living in the same society”. In other words, the inadequacy of standards of a certain specific society, therefore relative (Hopper, 2012, p.18).
- (3) Extreme poverty: According to the World Bank refers to people living under US\$1.90 per day. This reference is based on the current international poverty line (Jolliffe & Lugo, 2018, p. 164). A decline in the extreme poverty numbers had been happening; however, since 2015, this decline is stagnated.³⁸

3.4.3 Poverty as Deprivation of Basic Capabilities

In *Development as Freedom*, Sen argues that “poverty must be seen as the deprivation of basic capabilities rather than merely as lowness of incomes, which is the standard criterion of identification of poverty” (Sen, 1999, p.76). Sen certainly does not imply that the monetary aspect of poverty should be ignored, on the contrary, he stands that it is a variable element; therefore, the impact of it is “contingent and conditional”. The low income affects the capability in different ways and impacts in relation to different communities, families, even different persons, therefore it is a variable. The understanding of poverty as lowness of income is, in its turn, related to an understanding of poverty as capability inadequacy (Ibid., p.88-89). In this sense, income is considered as an important means of capability. Income lowness is related to poverty, however, is not the core of the problem of poverty, rather a means into capability. The connection is explained by Sen, “since enhanced capabilities in leading a life would tend, typically to expand a person’s ability to be more productive and earn a higher income, we would

³⁸ <https://www.worldbank.org/en/topic/poverty/overview>

also expect a connection going from capability improvement to greater earning power”. He also furthers the argument clarifying that “better basic education and health care improve the quality of life directly; they also increase a person’s ability to earn an income and be free of income poverty as well. The more inclusive the reach of basic education and health care, the more likely it is that even the potentially poor would have a better chance of overcoming penury” (Ibid., p.90).

Sen brings about the definition of poverty in relation to the capability inadequacy. Capability refers to “the implications of focusing directly on the substantive freedoms of the individuals involved, and identified a general approach that concentrates on the capabilities of people to do things – and the freedom lead lives – that they have reason to value” (Sen, 1999, p.85). The capabilities approach takes into consideration various other variables and analyse, measure and inform policies to deal with the phenomena of poverty in the light of the deprivation peoples suffers in the various variables. Capability deprivation, therefore, reaches all these dimensions. Sen also argues that economic inequality must take into consideration all the variables. Economic inequality is broader than only income inequality which is, in fact, only one aspect of the that. (Ibid., p.108).

Paul Hopper argues that “the patterns of global poverty and inequality have become increasingly complex” in the last decades. He, therefore, proposes that the two conceptions, which are poverty and inequality, are by nature interrelated. Several different studies on poverty and inequality have been proving the case of such complexity and that, even though the inequality between nations has shown some decrease, on the other hand, inequality within the countries has increased in the last decades. Hopper claims that the phenomenon of globalisation is related to this domestic inequality increase. “From a global perspective, all of this is leading to a blurring of the developing and developed worlds” (Hopper, 2012, p.16-17). He also points examples of countries like China, Russia, Sweden, the United Kingdom and the United States, to name a few where internal inequalities have increased. An important instance is also what Hopper calls “urbanization of poverty”, given the notorious example of Rio de Janeiro. Brazil has shown notably levels of inequality that “undermine attempts at poverty reduction (Ibid., p. 16). As inequality is directly related to poverty, it is also far more than mere differentiation in wealth and income. It reaches the dimensions of divergences in capability to access education, health services, political participation, to name a few (Hopper, 2012, p.19).

Hopper corroborates the idea by Amartya Sen that “poverty is the deprivation of basic capabilities rather than merely low income”. The term capability is the substantive, as it is explained by the latter scholar in a less formal way, “freedom to achieve various lifestyles” (Sen, 1999, p.75).

As it can be inferred from the human development theory, “inequalities of opportunity are precisely the problem”, in the words by Payne and Phillips. “There is no universal entitlement or access to such good as welfare and education” to give an example. Therefore, the recalling of the formulation of Amartya Sen, “no equitable distribution of freedoms or the possibility for achieving them” is naturally manifested in different environments (Payne and Phillips, 2010, p.162).

3.5 Vulnerability

In this section, I will discuss theoretical perspectives on the concept of vulnerability.

According to the Oxford English Dictionary, the word vulnerable means: “exposed to the risk of being attacked or harmed, either physically or emotionally”. This adjective has the same root as the noun vulnerability. This definition, as mere as is may look like, perhaps contains a hint of a notion of either internal conditions or external circumstances related to the reality of vulnerability (Have, 2014, p.19).

The term vulnerability is used in various different ways in the development literature. Despite been a quite common term in the development language, its use can be vague. Not rarely, it is used to replace the language poor or poverty, as vulnerable and vulnerability serve as convenient substitutes respectively (Chambers, 1989, p.1), however there is more to it as this sub-chapter will explain.

3.5.1 Meanings of Vulnerability

As well as the concept of poverty and development, a comprehension of the concept of vulnerability can be polysemic. The pursuit to fathom this important term here, is grounded on its use with the purpose to broaden the understanding of the social contexts and situations often viewed as poverty, since connections between poverty and vulnerability are often highlighted

in the literature concerning thereof. Thus, the reason behind this section is grounded on the task to expand the notion of the phenomenon of poverty, and how the participants of the research perceive its interconnections with the reality of vulnerability, bearing in mind that poverty is multidimensional reality.

3.5.2 Vulnerability as Defencelessness, Insecurity and Exposure

In *Editorial Introduction: Vulnerability, Coping and Policy*, Robert Chamber provides the following definition for vulnerability in the context of development work: “Vulnerability is not the same as poverty. It means not lack or want, but defencelessness, insecurity, and exposure to risk, shocks and stress” (Chambers, 1989, p.1). In other words, in the common stereotype, it might be confused with poverty; however, it is a mistake to take it as a synonym for poor. Nonetheless, there are profound and significant relations between vulnerability and poverty, and for this reason it is important to have a clear notion of their distinct significances.

In the context of public policies of welfare in Brazil, vulnerability and social risk are often found in the development work and policies for poverty. It is advised by the public administration that the term vulnerability is used by the social agents in the language of the public administration policies. The Ministry of Citizenship is the federal Ministry that coordinates social assistance policies in Brazil³⁹. This Ministry holds the comments for the annotated Organic Law of Social Assistance (*Lei Orgânica de Assistência Social – LOAS Anotada*⁴⁰) on its documents. The comments for the 2nd article for this law explain that the term ‘*carentes*’, which translates needy or poor in Portuguese, is to be replaced by the expression ‘in situation of vulnerability and social risk. It reads

the word ‘*carentes*’, expressed in the item II of the article commented is disused⁴¹, so the Public Administration has been applying, in practice and in its documents related to the policies of

³⁹ <http://cidadania.gov.br>

⁴⁰ https://www.mds.gov.br/webarquivos/publicacao/assistencia_social/Normativas/LoasAnotada.pdf

⁴¹ The notion of the term ‘disuse’ is related to ‘misuse’ which caused the term not to be used as much anymore.

social assistance, the expression ‘in situation of vulnerability and social risk, instead of that one.’⁴² (my translation)

Certainly, the meaning of words takes different significances and heaviness in different languages. But the term vulnerability in English is rather quite similar to the significance in Portuguese.

In Brazil, the Institute for Applied Economic Research (IPEA – *Instituto de Pesquisa Econômica Aplicada*) established and Social Vulnerability Index (IVS – *Índice de Vulnerabilidade Social*)⁴³, together with other partners institutions. “IPEA is a public institution that provides technical support to the federal government with regard to public policies”⁴⁴ in the country. Stem from a conception of vulnerability, this index is compounded by 16 social, economic indices related to 3 dimensions such as access to infrastructure; human asset; and, work and income. This Index helps to orient public polices and understand the realities in all the municipalities of Brazil. IVS is a technical synthetic basis to support the development work in the country.

Martin Prowse points that the notion of “risk and vulnerability have been rediscovered as key features” regarding poverty and policy attention (Devereux in Prowse, 2003, p.4). He also refers that “vulnerability reduction is increasingly being seen as a central aspect or rural development policy” (Farrington in Prowse, 2003, p.4). In the development theory, vulnerability in relation to poverty is, in part, related to the study of hazards and disasters to which people can be exposed to. However, this notion grounded only on exposure to hazards and disasters can encourage an understanding of vulnerable people as “passive and non-responsive”, even more, “it appears to emphasise weakness, a lack of agency and, an inability to cope” (Prowse, 2003, p.6).

Prowse discusses in *Towards a clearer understanding of vulnerability in relation to chronic poverty*, the several uses of the term vulnerability in the context of the scope of the work of the

⁴² A palavra ‘carentes’, expressa no inciso II do artigo em comento, encontra-se em desuso, tendo a Administração Pública empregado, na prática e nos documentos relacionados à política de assistência social, a expressão “em situação de vulnerabilidade e risco social, em substituição àquela.

⁴³ <http://ivs.ipea.gov.br/index.php/pt/>

⁴⁴ <http://www.ipea.gov.br/portal/>

Chronic Poverty Research Centre in the United Kingdom. The author considers the implications of the multiple significance of the term vulnerability (Ibid., p.7). His article affirms that increased attention has been given to the concept of vulnerability. This increase, on the other hand, also displays the fact that the reality of vulnerability is highly difficult to be captured. (Ibid., p.21).

In relation to poverty, Prowse highlights three tendencies present in the studies to the notion of vulnerability. Some works refer to vulnerability as susceptibility to poverty. This approach leans towards the assumption of vulnerability as a cause that leads to poverty, therefore, vulnerability in the sense of being vulnerable to poverty. The focus here is on the context of what Prowse calls the “transient poor” in opposition to those ones already in poverty, which he calls “the chronically poor”. He explains that “the transient poor are both the ‘churning poor’ who occasionally dip into poverty due to an extreme decline in income” (Prowse, 2003, p.7). Rather, it seems that this aspect of vulnerability “has been used to describe the potential for people to enter into poverty”. In this sense, it seems that it is affirmed as only a condition of the people that are not in poverty, missing then those who are already in poverty (Ibid.,).

Another notion put forth is “vulnerability as a symptom of poverty”. This second use is related to the poor being vulnerable to shocks (ibid., p.8). This notion goes closer to the definition provided by Robert Chambers, mentioned above when he asserted the vulnerable ones as exposed to “risk, shock and stress”.

The third trend is to describe vulnerability as one of the multiple dimensions of poverty. It is seen, therefore, as one of the indicators to be considered in the processes of analysing poverty such as “health, education, credit, participation in the political process, security and dignity” (Ibid., p.9). This notion also captures vulnerability in a broader sense than just economic income levels. It is then related to the view shown by the World Bank standards for poverty as well as The Oxford Poverty & Human Development Initiative, which I allude to in the poverty theoretical chapter. Here stands also the notion of vulnerability as an important facet of the experience of poverty.

3.5.3 Vulnerability as a Human Life Constituent Factor

Another theoretical approach to vulnerability interprets it as a constituent aspect of life. In *Frames of War, when life is grievable?*, Judith Butler suggests a different significance for vulnerability. She presents that human life is vulnerable, in addition, vulnerability is an ontological factor in the human experience, therefore it must be protected. In that sense the question raised is what is apprehended as life, or taken as life? It seems to exist this gap making a division in what lives are really regarded as lives and what lives are not apprehended as lives. Butler affirms that “specific lives cannot be apprehended as injured or lost if they are not first apprehended as living” (Butler, 2016, p.1). One of the tragedies of poverty lies exactly in its quite harmful effect of anonymising lives, human lives, therefore depriving individual to be apprehended as grievable lives.

These lives are deprived not only of any voice, rather, they are taken as faceless and so no aesthetic aspect is attributed to such lives. This reality seems to be caused, among other reasons, by the distance taken to the poor, even to the extension that results in denial. In this way, an ontological question is raised concerning what life is. Who the beings regarded as lives are, and, on the other hand, the beings regarded not as lives (Ibid., p.5-7). Such reality is observed in Brazilian society, for instance, and it manifests this fact very well grounded in the whole problem of poverty therein. This society is tremendously divided in a historical and systemic social gap so rooted that it is just taken as natural as it was explained in the background section about Brazil.

Here, it seems that denying a person the value of life is a way to dehumanise the human. There is a problem to be met which is whether the apprehension or recognition of what is a life to be cared for coincides with ethical and equalitarian judgements. Who will be regarded as persons? Judith Butler points out that the ways to recognition must be based on an apprehension of the preciousness and precariousness of life itself (Ibid., p.13). The philosopher argues that precariousness is coexistent with the whole life of a person, even more that “grievability is a presupposition for the life that matters”. The fact that people live in a social context implies that life is precarious; in other words, “one’s life is always in some sense in the hand of others. It implies exposure both to those we know and to those we don’t know; a dependency on people

we know, or barely know, or know not at all” (Ibid., p.14). There is, therefore, certain exposure as well as dependency of others which means relations and reciprocity.

The philosopher argues that the experience of human beings as bodies is a social experience. She postulates that the very persistence of the bodies “depends upon social conditions and institutions”. This condition brings us to the precariousness which “implies living socially, that is, the fact that one’s life is always in some sense in the hands of the other. It implies exposure both to those we know and to those we not know; a dependency on people we know, or barely know, or know not at all” (Ibid.). The exposure and dependency are related to the vulnerability which is shared by people. This idea is related to the responsibility with each other since the structure of the body is essentially social. The context for the human experience is marked with precarity, which a reality manifested in the fact that humans can be wounded, and this situation of precarity demands a responsiveness and must be tackled, on the other hand, the precariousness of the human experience must be acknowledged in the other. The scope of one’s responsibility towards the other is related to the precarity and the precariousness therein (Ibid., p.33,35-36). Precarity which is related to poverty, violence, injustice and different contingencies persons can be exposed to, must be tackled. On the other hand, precariousness remits to the ontological state, it is inevitable. Recognising the precariousness in the other, is a way of even recognising one as a life. Precarity is to be eliminated, it is situational, making life less possible or, in some unfortunate instances, not possible at all (Ibid., p.1-3).

In a different direction to the secularisation theory, religiosity has been proved persistent in the human experience, and even more present in the context of vulnerability and personal risks. Pippa Norris and Ronald Inglehart spell out that “there is no question that the secularization thesis need updating. It is obvious that religion has not disappeared from the world, nor does it seem like to do so” (Norris and Inglehart, 2011, p.4). They further their argument bringing about the relationship between the phenomena of religiosity and vulnerability. In their own words: “we believe that the importance of religiosity persists most strongly among vulnerable populations, especially those living in poorer nations, facing personal survival-threatening risks” (Ibid.). On the one hand, as the authors claim the “process of secularization - the systematic erosion of religious practices, values, and beliefs – has occurred most clearly among the most prosperous social sectors living in affluent and secure post-industrial nations”, whilst, on the other hand the “feelings of vulnerability to physical, societal, and personal risk are a key

factor driving religiosity” (Ibid. p.4-5). In the same flow proves the reality to the ones in vulnerability and precariousness as a result of the denial of living lives, or greivable lives that can be counted and considered as so. It is also observed that “the experience of exposure, insecurity, and vulnerability – in a word, experiences of life as precarious – tend to increase the significance of religiosity and faith to people” (Stålsett, 2018, p.320). In other words, in situations of precariousness in life, as well as the implications of risk and vulnerability are means that cause people to be engaged in faith experiences. The professor in diaconal studies, religion and society, Sturla Stålsett argues, in line with the proposal by Butler that “vulnerability should not be seen as a weakness to be removed, rather as a value, as an asset, to be protected” (Ibid., p.320-321). In this theoretical approach, vulnerability is comprehended as a constituent factor of human life, it is inevitable, even further a common asset to be protected.

3.5.4 Last remarks on Vulnerability

Vulnerability is a complex notion. Its concept has been applied to different contexts and systems. Nevertheless, it plays an important role to understand poverty, and, in the specific case of this research to clarify the importance of the work of CADI with the populations in a situation of poverty in Brazil.

From a Christian perspective, the success of Christianity in its early stage facing the severe opposition from the Roman Empire in the first centuries, is an example marked by its vulnerability. It is even claimed as the victory of the crucified one. The aporia lies in the fact that for it to succeed it must go for the experience of vulnerability. This paradox is also observed in many other aspects of life. Perhaps the challenge is to give acknowledgement to the vulnerable ones, once the humans “are all living precarious live”. This reality does not thwart the fact that human lives are precious; on the contrary, they are at the same stance vulnerable and precious.

It is also construed that vulnerability is a general feature of the human condition, as it is for mentioned, in this sense it is, therefore, a characteristic shared by humankind. The human experience is marked by fragility, contingencies, and limits. On the other hand, vulnerability also expresses the fact that some people are exposed to different conditions and situations, either social or natural, that makes some more vulnerable than other ones. The exposure to hazardous

conditions for some people cannot be disregarded, on the contrary, it demands special attention and care, either preventing or remedying, therefore enabling the vulnerable to bring about their potential as human beings.

3.6 Public Theology

As observed in different stages in the history of Christianity, the contributions in the field of the Christian thought and action in the civil society can be vast, rich and ambiguous. The public presence of Christianity not only influenced the civil government but shaped and created a meaningful platform for a system of thoughts and approaches regarding the presence of movements in the civil society.

As CADI presents themselves grounded in a Christian faith, we aim to investigate how they can be an example in the scope of a practical public theology. Faith is a key factor for the work of CADI, namely, the Christian faith. In this sense, we aim to see how a public theology can be useful to understand better the work of CADI in light with the data provided by the responders of the interviews. It is also clear that CADI takes the social development work as part of God's counsel; in other words, God's plan for his action. Another theological term observed in the interviews and books by Maurício Cunha is the expression "redemptive". It seems that God is in action on a redemptive way, and CADI sees the role they play in social development submitted to this redemptive motion. This language suggests theological significance, and we want to see later on how it functions in the context of the work of CADI.

3.6.1 Theology and the Public Sphere

The aim of this section is to provide the contributions from a few scholars on the relevance of theology in the public sphere and the processes in civil society.

Max Stackhouse, in *Public Theology and Political Economy*, develops notions and answers for this question. He argues:

Since the Enlightenment, many matters of religion, ethics, values, and meaning seem to have been relegated to the private, personal, and "subjective" spheres of life, quite removed from the public, social, and "objective" patterns of living.

Indeed, some of the best social scientists writing today have noted that in this shift we may have lost something indispensable to the survival of civilization in the long run (Stackhouse, 1991, p.ix).

This quoting offers the notion that while questions which are, incidentally, part of the theological studies, such as religion, ethics, values, and meaning are relegated to the private sphere; they are, in fact, notated with public relevance. He relates this neglecting phenomenon to the Enlightenment and expresses the risk of the consequences for the survival of society warned by social scientists.

In *God and Globalization*, volume 4, Stackhouse explains the fact that “much of religious language is metaphorical, symbolic, mythic and poetic in ways that are not always understood immediately on first hearing”. However, he argues the fact that “there is a logic to these modes of discourse”. He claims that often religious language is not only carried on but, in some level, utilised as well as present in daily life practices by communities of faith. In the vision of Stackhouse, they inform “into distinctive and practices and in publicly accessible institutions”. The denial of such features in relation to the public sphere, in “both ideational-symbolic and social-institutional” he adds, is an ideal definition of religion which does not fit the reality of most religions. In Stackhouse's words: “No wonder religion seems so incomprehensible to some: their projection system generically distorts what it claims to portray” (Stackhouse, 2007, p.97).

Still, in relation to the strains between the secularisation and the public character of theology, the Pastor and Professor at Superior School of Theology in Brazil, Rudolf von Sinner expresses that “the privatisation of faith really happened in large scale, however the preeminent churches as public law institutions (as in Germany and Switzerland) still have got a strong voice in controversial issues”⁴⁵ (Sinner, 2011, p.12) (my translation). He continues the idea arguing that “the secularisation happened only partially; the religious influence in the public sphere did not fade away, it even increased in some cases.”⁴⁶ (Ibid.) (my translation). Sinner also says that the notion of Public Theology is still little used in the Brazilian context; nevertheless, it is a key

⁴⁵ a privatização da fé realmente aconteceu em grande escala, mas as principais igrejas como instituições de direito público (como na Alemanha e na Suíça) ainda têm voz forte em questões controversas.

⁴⁶ A secularização ocorreu apenas parcialmente; a influência religiosa na esfera pública não desapareceu e até mesmo aumento em alguns casos.

concept to the development of an adequate debate for the challenges for the democracy in the country in the current times (Ibid.).

The clarity to the fact that “theological ideas play a quite decisive role in social life” has become increasingly claimed by Stackhouse (Stackhouse, 1991, p.ix). In the same direction goes the Jürgen Moltmann, who also presents the argument. Reinforcing the public relevance of theology, he affirms that “there is no Christian identity without public relevance, and no public relevance without theology’s Christian identity, since for Christ’s sake theology is kingdom-of-God theology, while on the other hand kingdom-of-God theology gets lost in the clouds of utopia unless it is based on the person and history of Christ, and unfolded out of the experiences of his Spirit” (Moltmann, 1999, p. 1). Moltmann argues the matter of theology in respect to the modern world, exploring the reality of economy, politics, ecology and market, naming a few. The public life experience and how a Christ centred theology has much to speak to society. He argues towards the evident publicness of theology, and the conditions of possibility for a Christian public witness in secular modern times (Ibid.).

Max Stackhouse also brings the notion of the interaction that theology plays in the context of the social setting when the understanding of Christian stewardship towards the interaction framework of theological concerns with different “contexts around the globe”. He argues that stewardship can be a connecting term between a social perspective and public theology. Referring that stewardship “reflects a practice of appointing particularly reliable workers to be wardens (...) These wardens, living under the “word” of the “lord” of the manor, were to become trustworthy custodians of those resources that were indispensable to the life and the well-being of the whole community. They were to lovingly and prudently care for that which they had authority.” (Stackhouse, 1991, p. xiii).

David Tracy gives examples of the influences of theological ideas on the public discourse. In *The Analogical Imagination*, He argues how religious ideas have functioned as basilar factors in the society in the United States, for instance. Tracy mentions: “If one recalls the role of the Calvinist understanding of covenant in its contributions to the American Constitution, if one recalls the theological principles of Martin Luther King’s struggle in the civil rights movement, one will realize how religious symbolic resources have in fact functioned as important factors in American society” (Tracy, 1981, p.13).

In the same book, David Tracy argues that a vast range of the discipline of theology. The claims that the generic term theology is manifested as fundamental, systematic and practical. Indeed, there are different classifications for theology from different authors. Tracy, nevertheless, expresses that each of them, indeed, are “determined by a relentless drive to genuine publicness”. And here is the interest for this research the publicness of the fundamental aspect of theology in relation to the practical aspect thereof.

William Schweiker writes about the movement observed in the church bodies that “signalled an awaking of the churches to fundamental changes in the world” (Schweiker, 2000, p. 105). He refers, in his chapter, to the changes that globalisation entails, as well as the challenges that theology faces in the perception of it. Schweiker gives one example on the problem of world poverty. This example of the demands in face of poverty is a key factor for my research. He argues that “the fact of world poverty raises profound questions of distributive justice” (Ibid.). This conception of distributive justice is present on the biblical narrative and it seems to be a hallmark for the work of CADI, as we are going to explore later.

Another voice of Public Theology is the professor of Ethics and Diaconal Studies at MF Norwegian School of Theology, Religion and Society, Kjetil Fretheim. He argues that religion has got an important relevance in the public discourse. The professor brings about the question of “How can reflection on a God who has created the universe not be public?”. He also argues that “the public character of Christian faith is evident not only in its many public expressions in terms of rituals, church institutions, Christian social work etc. It also has solid biblical foundations” (Fretheim, 2016, p.33). Fretheim affirms the importance in the public manifestation of Christianity and its entities and institutions but calls the attention to the biblical narrative, which is a foundational element to Christianity. He also causes a stir, in his book, underlining how public theology can model a Christian engagement towards the several issues and challenges that contemporary society faces today. He highlights that “post-modern irony and relativism cannot take away the pain and suffering in this time of multiple crises”. He calls for the responsiveness of Christianity and the role of public theology for such times (Ibid., p.26). He argues that important features of Christian theology are its public relevance and influence.

Christianity holds in its elemental theology that the divine is not the world. Therefore, it is necessary to make differentiations. On the other hand, any reality that is transcendent, that is, by its turn, worth attending to, must have significance and implications to what and how we do and think on earth. Stackhouse argues religions agree on this that “the eternal is relevant to history; the absolute is pertinent to the relative; the ideal modifies the material” (Stackhouse, 1991, p.x).

3.6.2 Publics of Public Theology

Public Theology has different publics. For the purposes of this thesis, it is important to understand the notion of its addressees. In further analysis, this will be important in order to investigate how the work of CADI is placed in relation to the categories provided.

David Tracy argues that it is necessary to understand the groups to which public theology refers. This demand becomes imperative as a consequence of the need to display “the public status of all theology”. He raises the question to “whom does the theologian attempt to address in theological discourse” (Tracy, 1981, p.3). David Tracy affirms, therefore, that there are three different publics for public theology, as he proposes they are the society, the academy and the church (Ibid., p.6).

The first public he presents is “the public of society”. In light of the previous section about public theology and the public sphere, one can infer that certainly the society can be taken into one of the addressees of public theology. The term society is quite generic. Tracy makes his point by affirming that “the word society seems preferable to the other natural choice of culture. Within this field, he attributes three realms to the term society. “The technoeconomic realm, the realm of polity and the realm of culture”. These are taken as constitute dimensions of society, in its significance coined by social scientists as it is claimed by Tracy (Ibid., p.6-8).

The second public for public theology is the academy. According to Tracy, it is in the academic context that most of the study concerning theology takes place in the framework of its various methods and demands. He also explains that theology, as an academic discipline, can be an instrument to encourage the public relevance within the scope of its “own internal demand”. The demand for theology is public. Therefore, it is here that theology puts on its great feature of publicness (Ibid., p.14-21).

The third reference public for public theology argued by Tracy is the Church. He argues, accordingly, that the theologian must speak to the church. Unlike other intellectual disciplines, theology must converse explicitly with the church. Besides the intuitional aspect of the church, he argues that the church sociologically is a relational, a “voluntary association and one public for every theology (Ibid., p.21).

Tracy also expresses the interchangeable nature of these publics as well as the influences of the context in which a theology is developed. Here public theology is also embedded with traces of contextualising elements. He argues that “in every case, the church will serve as at least one public for all theological work”, while further follows that “in most cases, both church and the world will also be understood as properly theological realities” (Ibid., p.27).

3.6.3 Public Theology and Development Thinking

Séverine Deneulin, in her work *Christianity and International Development*, outlines three major features of the Christian perspective on international development. Her work looks at development policies from the perspective of people and their freedom to live good lives. Deneulin points a few features concerning the Christian view on development efforts. Those features are (1) “Human dignity and the inseparability of the material and spiritual dimensions of human life”; (2) “Humans are called to live in communion with each other and with God, therefore human dignity is inseparable from solidarity and concern for the good of all”; and, (3) “Human actions are marked by sin, therefore the struggles for justice and human dignity are inseparable from conversion to God” (Deneulin, in Clarke, 2013, p.52).

Deneulin spells out that the presence of religion in the development is inescapable. However, there are serious challenges and sometimes even conflicts. For instance, she shows in her own words, “a Christian anthropological vision of the human is at odds with a secular anthropology. For the former, being human is being open to God, and the exercise of freedom is set within that horizon. For the latter, being human is to exercise freedom and reason without God”. She argues that development from a Christian perspective does not detach the material dimension of life to the spiritual one. Therefore, she suggests that engaging with different points of view are of “paramount importance when engaging in international development (Ibid., p.64).

She argues that the Christian belief in a God as “a communion of three persons, the Father, Son and Holy Spirit” has a consequence of the “human well-being will reflect an analogous communion”, grounded in theological claim that the humans were created in the image of God, according to the biblical narrative. The common good is based on the communitarian approach. She explains that “the good of each person depends on the good of their communion, which in turns depends on the good of each person”. The notion of the common good is a key factor in the Christian perspective on the field of international development. For the author, the principle of the common good is attached to the notion of solidarity and responsibility from which freedom is bound (Ibid., p.59).

Despite the fact that she is not a theologian, the characteristics she points out have profound theological assertions. In the case, they are specifically from the Christian perspective. She considers that the Christian belief is not a homogeneous movement; distinct perceptions are taking on the list of features she provided. He argues that “the Christian religion is therefore characterized by heterogeneity, for different members have diverse interpretations of these core beliefs”. However, she claims that these tenets are at the core of a Christian notion (Ibid., p.51).

Deneulin also explores the doctrine of sin in the world, and its necessary implications for the worldly affairs from a Christian perspective. She makes the link between this reality to the discourse of transformation and hope in the development work. She points out the notion that poverty and injustice, for instance, are a result of sin (Ibid., p.62). She also argues that “a Christian perspective on international development does not reduce development to a material project of changing structures”, it goes further to the notion that “development is integral”. In her own words: “establishing structures more conducive for people to live well has to be accompanied by moral transformation, by a ‘change of heart’. Development is also about people being more Christ-like.” (Ibid., p.63).

Another factor which is pointed out by the author on the Christian perspective for development is that “economic, social, political or technological means are not sufficient to promote development”. Since there is injustice has to do with the reality of sin, she spells out that “development cannot be reduced to a man-made enterprise. It is also a journey of conversion, of coming back to God” (Ibid., p.63).

Further on, Deneulin, describe also the notion of solidarity and responsibility. She explains the idea of the “analogous communion” extracted from the belief of the Trinity. This image is also used by Jürgen Moltmann as grounds for discourse for public theology. Relating to the trinitarian communion, Deneulin argues that since “humans have been created in the image of God. As a consequence, they believe that human well-being will reflect an analogous communion. The good of each person depends on the good of their communion (...) the common good is another key feature of a Christian perspective on international development” (ibid., p.59).

As the explanation on the Christian basis for international development is unfolded by the author, it is clear on how the academic public for public theology lay hold of theological notions providing the interrelations of a theology which is public to other fields of studies.

3.6.4 Public Theology in the Bible

As mentioned, the notion of a theological framework that addresses the public space is not only evident in the external expressions of Christianity but also grounded in the Biblical literature. Kjetil Fretheim argues that “public character of the Christian faith” has also got solid biblical foundations. Fretheim explains his claim, exemplifying from the narrative of the Old Testament to the New Testament.

The proposition of God creator of everything as the merism in the narrative of the book of Genesis writes: “God created heavens and earth”, the book also describes the giving of life to “creatures according to their kinds – livestock and creeping things and beasts of the earth” (Genesis 1, ESV), and he made the humans in his own image. Fretheim argues that this notion is a “key element to the biblical narrative”. The account of the creation is “paralleled by God’s love for his people” (Fretheim, 2016, p.33).

As the narrative of the Old Testament unfolds, God is revealed as concerned with the suffering of his people and loving them in his actions. In the book of Exodus, the narrative shows the involvement of God with his people and with their suffering. The text of Exodus 3, 7b-8a reads: “I have surely seen the affliction of my people who are in Egypt and have heard their cry because of their taskmasters. I know their sufferings, and I have come down to deliver them out of the hand of the Egyptians and to bring them up out of that land to a good and broad land, a

land flowing with milk and honey”. This text seems to address themes as affliction, slavery, pain, and deliverance with the divine movement to “come down to deliver”.

The concern with the affairs of the world is also made explicit in the poetic and prophetic writings. The themes of public theology are vast and inexhaustible. For the scope of the work of CADI, the theme of justice is very important as a type of public theology. Provisions for the ones in the situation of vulnerability and social risk are observed in the Old Testament writings. Nicholas Wolterstorff argues that “A striking feature of how the Old Testament writers talk about justice is the frequency with which they connect justice, both primary and rectifying, with the treatment of widows, orphans, residents aliens, and the poor” (Wolterstorff, 2008, p.75).

The prophets in the Old Testament also brought to the surface denunciations against, not only injustice, but political authorities that would pervert the right and justice. Leaders were called to repent and turn away in their actions from unfair laws and policies. An example is from the words of the prophet Isaiah 10,1-2: Woe to those who decree iniquitous decrees, and the writers who keep writing oppression, to turn aside the needy from justice and to rob the poor of my people of their right, that widows may be their spoil, and that they may make the fatherless their prey.

In the context of the New Testament, the teachings by Jesus in the gospel of Luke 10, 27 relates to the relationship of the person not only towards God, but the social relationships towards the other. The account of Luke reads “you shall love the Lord your God with all your heart and with all your soul and with all your strength and with all your mind, and your neighbour as yourself” (Luke 10, 27). This passage is often remembered by Christians as the story of the good Samaritan. It has inspired mercy ministries throughout generations. Still in the account of the gospels, it is important to remember that even the enemy is to be a target for Jesus’ follower’s love.

The other writings of the New Testament by the apostles also addresses the relations towards social life, the state, and so on, in the context of the Romanian society. The apostle Paul addresses non-believers explaining how God is not detached from the world. The writings of the book of Acts for this event unfolds “he himself gives to all mankind life and breath and everything” (Acts 17,25).

Fretheim, referring to the extent of the public character of biblical writing, explains that “indeed, love and justice are closely related”. He also argues that “the Christian faith, and by extension Christian theology, concerns the world and call us to seek the welfare of the city and well-being of the whole creation. It is, and must, be of public relevance” (Fretheim, 2016, p.33).

Since faith and theology do not confined to the private sphere but have implications and relevance in the wider society, it is also important to see a few theoretical inputs on the conception of civil society since it is the context for public theology and the work of the FBO in study.

3.6.5 Civil Society

In the present case the FBO in study is CADI. The work of CADI is placed in the context of the range of what is defined as civil society. Later on, we will see the interrelations of the work of CADI as a result of a public theology practice in society. Therefore, it is important to understand what the conception of civil society comprises.

Jürgen Habermas points that the civil society comprises in its core “a network of associations that institutionalizes problem-solving discourses on questions of general interest inside the framework of organized public sphere”. About the institutional aspect of the civil society, he also sustains that it is comprised by “nongovernmental and noneconomic connections and voluntary associations that anchor the communication structures of the public sphere in the society component of the lifeworld” (Habermas, 1996, p.367).

The UN defines civil society as the “third sector in a society, along with the sector of government and business”. This is a broad definition including society and the state⁴⁷.

There are different perspectives of civil society from a Christian theological point of view. John Coleman points that in both Catholic and Protestant notions “society is build up from the bottommost units of the family and associational life into towns, cities, and provinces, and, finally, a federal commonwealth” (Coleman, 2008, p.42).

⁴⁷ <https://www.un.org/en/sections/resources-different-audiences/civil-society/>

The Catechism of the Catholic Church displays the following in the § 1884:

God has not willed to reserve to himself all exercise of power. He entrusts to every creature the functions it is capable of performing, according to the capacities of its own nature. This mode of governance ought to be followed in social life. The way God acts in governing the world, which bears witness to such great regard for human freedom, should inspire the wisdom of those who govern human communities. They should behave as ministers of divine providence.⁴⁸

This is called the principle of the subsidiarity present in the Catholic Social Thought. From this approach, different institutions make different and at the same time, essential contributions to the common good. This thought brings about the basic principles of human dignity and solidarity in the arena of society. Also, the “social relations bear deep theological significance. Human sociability and interdependence reflect nothing less than the divine life of the Trinity”, therefore, “man is created in the image of a relational God”. (Schindler, 2008, p.121).

The Catholic doctrine offers the notion of a base that relate the individuals, the civil society and the state in the framework of the principle of subsidiarity. This principle “holds that there are functions to each of the agents in the social ontology, and those agents should be given the liberty to fulfil those functions so as to promote full human development” (Ibid., 2008, p.123). Here the human is entrusted with the capacity to perform according to the capacity of one’s own nature. The bonds of human solidarity are observed in agents such as family, church, or other associations as well as the relations among themselves are a matter of creational order and as well as right.

Another contribution to understand civil society comes from a Protestant Reformational Philosophy perspective. Whist the Catholic social thought applies the principle of Subsidiarity, the Reformational thought applies the principle of the Sphere Sovereignty. This social principle was coined by Abraham Kuyper in the nineteenth century. Jonathan Chaplin states that sphere sovereignty, in the context of the social thought, refers to “the qualitative different authorities of social institutions such as family, church, school, union, and so on, deriving from their

⁴⁸ http://www.vatican.va/archive/ENG0015/___P6G.HTM

unique, created nature and purpose, and their resultant right to independence from intrusive state control”. These social institutions act in the range of their intended purpose, nevertheless they are also entitled with categories that transverse their typology (Chaplin, 2008, p.72,75).

Chaplin also remarks that in order to understand civil society it is important to perceive the phenomenon called social pluralism. In his own words, he refers to social pluralism as “the network of independent social institutions, communities, associations, and relationships which stand between the individual and the state” (Ibid., p.69).

In this approach, civil society is perceived as “the social relationships and associations found between the individual and the state, ranging from the family, neighbourhood, and church to the school, trade union, and charitable organization” (Schindler, 2008, p.1) and so on. Such small areas of memberships and interactions might go from local dimensions to global dimensions in the range of the public sphere. In this sense “local processes affect the global level, and global processes affect the local level”. Those interactions are dynamic and “*glocal*” (Fretheim, 2016, p.22).

3.6.6 Ambiguities of Public Theology

Rudolf von Sinner points out that everyday life is “characterized by the coexistence of good and evil”. This notion, for instance, is very clear in Brazilian imaginary. Different ways are laid hand to detail with this ambiguous reality such as eschatological escapism, moralistic legalism as it is pointed by Sinner (Sinner, 2019, p.181).

Sinner spells out the proposal of “seen ourselves and the other as being *simul justi et peccatores*” which means both justified and sinners. The Latin expression is a theological proposition coined by the reformer Martin Luther (Luther, 1972, p.260). It is used by Sinner to explain the ambiguity of the reality of life experience. According to Sinner, some may take this notion as very pessimistic. However, it is just a realistic theological proposition and can be used in the context of public theology, even rather a practical public theology in the complexity of society. He clarifies: “I do not think this is a pessimistic vision, as some might think but rather realistic”. Sinner also warns in the light of the proposition, “for Christians, there is always the mistrust before human beings, as much of ourselves as of others, given our awareness of the power of sin. Knowing this, but not falling into despair because of our trust in God, we are able

to endure ambiguity, a lack of clarity (...) this is why we are able to persevere.” (Sinner, 2019, p.182).

It seems that the proposal is not to be naïve in facing the contradictions of the public theology facing the demands of the world today in a pluralistic society. Instead of utopia or triumphalism; or despair and indifference, an attitude of being realistic facing the contemporary challenges for public theology in the public sphere. In the case of this study, in the concerns of FBO and development work.

Kjetil Fretheim also explain the ambiguous features of public theology. He calls the attention to “themes or principles” in the framework of public theology, arguing that they not only relate to each other but overlap too. I mention here three of them that will help to analyse and work on arguments for this research (Fretheim, 2016, p.53).

The first argument, outlines by Fretheim, is “the qualitative distinction between God’s salvation and all human efforts.” In this sense, the redemptive work of God is achieved by Christ. It is “totally the work of God. God’s redemption is a gift, pure and simple” while the humans are the receptors of the gift (Ibid.). The second theme is “the paradox of the human race”, despite the fact of the humans being created at God’s image, in their fallen condition, humans “are irretrievably committed to find something other than God to fasten their hearts. This is the inescapable sin of our lives.” (Ibid. p.54). The third theme is the historical paradox. The assertion that the kingdom has come but is still coming in prospection to the future on its totality. In the words of Fretheim, “Although Jesus proclaimed that the Kingdom of God had arrived (Luke 17:21), he also warned that it is not of this world (John 18:36)”. The author explains that, according to these narratives, “we live in a time between the first coming of the Kingdom, and its coming in its fullness sometime in the future.”

David Tracy relates these arguments holding out that “The Christian focus on the event of Jesus Christ discloses the always-already, not-yet reality of grace” which seems to overlap the ambiguities in the framework of public theology. Tracy emphasises on the need for conversations and “self-exposure to and in the contemporary” society, and its situations. He also claims that this self-exposure, required from public theology, is “a condition for the possibility of authentic conversation in our day” (Tracy, 1981, p.446).

Christianity as “a religion which includes as its paradigmatic focal meaning the always-already, not-yet event of the grace of Jesus Christ, a religion which includes within itself the additional focal meaning of manifestation, proclamation and prophetic action, should be willing to enter into the conversation among the religions which the emerging future of a global humanity demands” (Ibid., p.450).

4 Methodology

This chapter will illuminate readers as to the processes applied to compose this thesis. I chose to conduct qualitative interviews and content analysis. As I was interested in furthering knowledge in the phenomenon of faith in the processes of civil society in Brazil, I chose to do a case study of the institution CADI, based on their faith-based nature as well as influence in different part of the country.

4.1 Field Trip and Data Sampling

As part of my research I spent four weeks in Brazil in April 2019, in the cities of São Paulo, Curitiba and Fazenda Rio Grande. During this time I met and interviewed nine people, engaged with the work of CADI at some level. The interviews were done during the national leaders gathering and general assembly, as well as the visit to CADI Fazenda Rio Grande, where I was hosted in the home of one of the interviewees. I also attended the conference of CADI, which is open to the broader public.

The participants were selected to represent diversity in geographical range, including urban and rural context; different roles in the organisational structure of CADI, from grassroots to national leadership; as well as representing both genders. Two of the responders had the experience of being assisted by CADI in childhood and are now working for the organisation themselves, which are participants C and D. The selection was done in this way to, as far as possible, reach a diversification of views and a broader range of experiences.

The nine people interviewed, five women and four men, come from four different states in Brazil and three different regions. Two from the Northeast, from Aratuba in Ceará and Cabo de Santo Agostinho in Pernambuco; One from the Southeast, Rio de Janeiro; and, four from the South, from Fazenda Rio Grande in Paraná. And also, two National leaders, one based in the Nacional office in Curitiba, and the other from São Paulo.

4.2 Qualitative Interviewing

The main data collection in this thesis was done through qualitative interviewing, and more specifically, through the unstructured interview. The unstructured approach has some interview

guide, but the style is usually informal, and the sequencing of topics will vary among responders (Bryman, 2012, p.404). In line with this, the interviews held, had an informal tone and resembled conversation in style, which is a form that fits well the cultural context of Brazil.

Moreover, such approach of “Keeping structure to a minimum is supposed to enhance the opportunity of genuinely revealing the perspectives of the people you are studying” (Bryman, 2012, p.403), thus, favourable considering the purposes of this thesis in investigating the authentic views of the participants.

The interviews were recorded using an audio recorder and stored on my personal computer in an encrypted folder. Later the recorded interviews were transcribed and translated from Portuguese to English by me.

4.3 Qualitative Content Analysis

I also collected data by studying different documents and books important to CADI’s work and existence. I read and analysed CADI’s bylaws as well as their yearly report of 2018.

The two books *The Kingdom among us* (my translation of *O Reino entre nós*) by Maurício Cunha and Beth Wood and *The Kingdom of God and the Social Transformation* (my translation of *O Reino de Deus e a Transformação Social*) by Maurício Cunha are part of the formational training for staff, volunteers and social agents as well as the public discourse of CADI. Thus, I considered it invaluable to analyse these in order to gain insight for this thesis.

I used qualitative content analysis as described in Bryman (2012, p.557) to analyse all the transcriptions and the documents.

4.4 Research Validity and Reliability

Validity is an important criterion for the research to hold up to academic standards (Bryman, 2012).

External validity is “concerned with the question whether the result of a study can be generalized beyond the specific research context” (Bryman, 2012, p.47). Despite the fact that one might argue it is impossible to prove any generalisation in a case study, one could still argue

that the case in focus fulfil the criteria to be *an exemplifying case*. That is a case which exemplifies a “broader category of which it is a member” (Ibid., p.70). CADI is a coalition of affiliated organisations that spans over far areas of Brazil marked by cultural, ethnical and economical differences as well as distinct historical backgrounds. Brazil is a vast and diverse country and each region has their specific peculiarities. Even the climate can vary. Since the participants were selected to represent this diversity, I would claim that across a similar social setting, one could expect similar results.

On a note of faith, the responders represent members of different denominations from Anglican Church, The Roman Catholic Church, Baptist Church, Presbyterian and an Independent Charismatic Church.

Internal validity is concerned “whether there is good match between researchers’ observations and the theoretical ideas they develop” (Ibid., 2012, p.390). In this sense, internal validity has been aimed for in this study by choosing a theoretical framework relevant to the field of interest and letting this framework inform the questions asked as well as the analysis. Furthermore, a comparison between the finding and the theoretical framework might further the strength of the validity of this study.

4.5 Ethical Considerations and Limitations

One of the challenges in this research has been the translations. The interviews were run in an informal environment where the conversations were held more or less following the flow of the interview guide. As the interviews were originally in Portuguese; therefore, the quotes are translations into English. Every translation is somehow a version; thus, it can lose a bit of the verblancy of the conversations in the original language. For this reason, the appendix with the original vernacular were applied every time the interviewees are quoted.

Conversations about personal points of view, life stories and beliefs must be approached with sensitivity and ethical attitude. Apart from the National Leaders, all the participants were anonymised. Before being interviewed they received the information letter and signed voluntarily the consent form according to the regulations of the Norwegian Centre for Research Data from which I gained approval to conduct this research.

I had not met any of the responders before the field trip, nor had any contact. I was aware of the importance of conducting a position as an objective researcher, though complete objectiveness is hardly possible for any researcher. Sharing the same Christian faith, and my past experience from similar context with a FBO in development work, I applied extra care not to let my own views influence.

In the following chapter I will present the findings and analysis of the data collected.

5 Findings and Analysis

5.1 Introduction

In this chapter, I want to provide the reader with an insight into the findings of this work. I explore the ways in which the participants of the research have informed the concepts proposed in the context of their own experience. In addition to the interviews, I also explore relevant material published about the view of CADI.

I divide the participants into 4 different groups. They are (1) two mothers, that are beneficiaries, volunteers and have their children participating in CADI activities; (2) two staff workers at CADI Fazenda Rio Grande, a teacher and a social worker; (3) three local leaders from different locations of CADI in three different states; and, (4) two national leaders.

The chapter is structured around the findings from the questions of the key themes. The first sub-chapter focuses on answers given about understanding of the concept of poverty. The second part collects the answers regarding their understanding of vulnerability, followed by the fourth and fifth sub-subchapters with the answers given about protection and potentiality, respectively. All this in the context of the experience and beliefs of the participants. In addition, there are all inputs from the books by the participant Maurício Cunha, the national president of CADI.

5.2 How Do They Understand the Concept of Poverty?

In this section, I explore responses by the interviewees regarding the concept of poverty in the context of CADI's work.

5.2.1 Beneficiary Mothers

Both of the mothers interviewed are involved with the work of CADI in the location of Fazenda Rio Grande. They shared on how they got to know CADI and started participating, one of them heard from another person about the workshops CADI offered and enrolled her grandchildren. The other one knew CADI when she was invited to come to Nova Vida Church which used to hold their services in the premises of CADI.

For the effects of this research, we call these mothers as participant A and participant B. Participant A is actually a grandmother of three boys that attend the activities of CADI. Her daughter is the mother of the three boys; however, they live with and are raised by the grandmother and the step-grandfather. This is a reality common to several families in Brazil today, especially in needy communities.

Participant A did not give a conceptual answer per se when she was asked about poverty. She expressed, however, different forms of poverty she perceives to operate in the neighbourhood. As she was affirming that there is very much poverty in the neighbourhood, she also mentioned different dimensions of poverty such as health poverty, spiritual poverty and the problem of drugs. In her own words:

There is poverty for sure. Poverty that I say is poverty, like, of health, there are many people who are poor in spirit, to be honest with you, there are many, you know. There are also drugs, poverty of drugs ... It is a very serious problem.ⁱ

(Participant A).

She exemplifies that they do not have a health centre in the area that works 24 hours, as it works only during daytime. If one has a health emergency during the night, one has to go to another part of the city. She also claims that it is difficult to go to another part of the city if you need health care when the local one is closed.

There is not a 24 hours health centre here, but it is needed very much this side here. There is one but it is on the other side.ⁱⁱ

(Participant A).

When questioned about the concept of poverty, Participant B informed that certainly economic poverty is reality, and it must be taken into serious consideration. She expressed that there are cases that require special intervention, for instance, when there is a situation of lack of food for a household. This demands special and prompt responsiveness of CADI to protect the children and even their families. Economic poverty is somehow an understanding which is taken for granted. There is no much controversy when approaching poverty as a lack of income. The argumentation gets hold on the question that the poverty phenomenon range is far broader than

low or no income at all. The Participant calls attention to the fact that each case must be analysed with care. She expressed the notion that there is poverty beyond only the concept of economic poverty. In the lines ahead, Participant B went on to say that the lack of basic needs like food, as well as other deprivations or situations, are symptoms of poverty too. As she describes in her answer to this question:

We have the question of the poverty, which is lack of resources in fact, lack of money, lack of food. We have got many children assisted by CADI, that really need support for basic food ... there are cases that we must give. We also forward them to CRAS⁴⁹, so that through the Social Assistance the family will be assisted.

But there is also the poverty of children that has everything, they have car, arrive here in a 'big car', but they don't have a present father, a present mother, sometimes even having both at home. So, this child is depressive, this child is sad. They arrive here at CADI and can't even look at us, or talk to us ... It is not even the lack of money that will determine whether the child is happy or not, whether she is vulnerable or not, for me there are types of vulnerability, types of poverty, you know. Sometimes, you have everything, but the soul is poor.

For me there are different dimensions. I can't just say since you live in a small house, or in a humble house that you are poor. Sometimes you are much richer than me, richer in joy.ⁱⁱⁱ

(Participant B).

In these samples, we can see the two elements at play. Not only they see poverty as lack of money per se, which is directly monetary poverty, but they understand poverty in other areas of life such as health, security, exposure to drug abuse, emotional and spiritual poverty dimensions. She also mentioned "lack of resources" which refers to the notion as poverty as lack of assets. It can also be inferred that there are aspects of poverty that are not tackled with

⁴⁹ CRAS (*Centro de Referência de Assistência Social*) stands for Social Assistance Reference Centre. It is a public entity. The definition given on the web page of the Citizenship Ministry states that "is the entrance door for the Social Assistance. It is a public place, located primarily in areas of major social vulnerability, where the assistance in social services are offered, with the scope of strengthening the conviviality with the family and with the society" (<http://mds.gov.br/assuntos/assistencia-social/unidades-de-atendimento/cras>).

mere monetary capacity; on the contrary, these other aspects manifest in spite of monetary capacity.

Another concern in the answers refers to the depression, poverty in the soul, even spiritual poverty. I, therefore, suggest that this understanding converges to the theoretical approach that understands poverty as a multidimensional phenomenon. They also include the emotional and spiritual dimensions of poverty, as well as lack of assets.

5.2.2 Staff Workers – a Social Worker and a Teacher

The second group are two staff workers from CADI Fazenda Rio Grande. They are here called Participant C and Participant D. Both shared how they and their families were served by CADI when they were children, how they came to convert and becoming members of the local church that started in the premises of CADI.

Participant C expressed the following about poverty:

I understand poverty as the lack of something, lack of food, lack of housing, of finding the basic need of oneself. I see that poverty is found in all the areas of the life of a person, I think that there are many, in quotes, rich ones that are poor, poor in spirit, in their soul, in their get-together with other people, you know, so for me the concept of poverty is a bit broader than the physical need.

We find here many people that are poor in their integral life, you know, physically, of the material needs, but also their spirit. People which arrive here completely destroyed and we manage, from the groups, from the answers that are in the Bible, to show them that they can rebuild themselves again, you know.^{iv}

(Participant C).

Participant D shared regarding his own view on poverty:

Today, CADI is attending children, most of them, in vulnerability, like, umm, financial, and it is not only financial when we talk of poverty, but it is poverty in general. In various dimensions since there are children, for instance, that do not even give valour to their own lives. So, this is a poverty of, I believe even, of teaching, at certain part, but the child does not value her own life. I mean that many things were not empowered to

the living that they have already had. So, the spiritual aspect as well as the financial aspect have their influence, but sometimes the children became spiritually poor, financially, or even emotionally as consequence of what the child has been suffering in their lives, or even lack of something ... but when one speaks about poverty, one speaks of this whole.^v

(Participant D).

In the midst of the conceptualisations of poverty, it is noted that three participants so far mentioned the idea of poverty of spirit, poverty in their spirit, the spiritually poor, and poor in their soul. It outstands the fact that the people involved in the work of CADI see spirituality as an aspect to be considered in the debates and efforts regarding poverty. This concern overlays with the theoretical approach that brings the reality of poverty and development thinking in a holistic way to understand human beings and their needs.

A relation can be noted between the spiritual dimension of poverty with the report, *Voices of the poor*, when it is a landmark in the poverty debate that takes in consideration the spiritual dimension thereof. This idea goes in the direction of the theory of multi-dimensional poverty and comes to the surface since the international development effort takes into consideration the perspective of the people in the context of poverty.

Another relation that can be inferred is that, as mentioned before, the organisation CADI is grounded in a Christian framework of values. It is interesting to perceive these participants' concern about the occurrence of spiritual poverty in their community.

5.2.3 Local leaders

The participants of this third group are local leaders that come from different centres of CADI which form the national coalition. For the scope of this research, I call them Participant E, Participant F, and Participant G.

About her understanding of poverty, Participant E provided the following answer:

When I started working with the children from church, my look was always towards the one who was more unprotected, more vulnerable, the one that, in my understanding, needed better care. When I started working with the children in our community, even

with the church, and observed the context of the family that I had, poor, but with some stability. And I saw so many children that were poor, like me, but had not any stability in the family ... in a vulnerable context, in a context of drugs.

Now I looked to the one that was at the side, the one that no one would look at. Children on the streets, you know, those invisible children that no one sees, so these children I started to see. The question of the poor, it is not just the financial poverty, it is poverty in the terms of vulnerability, poor in the way that one demands special care, demands a special look, demands care.^{vi}

(Participant E).

Participant E relates poverty to a vulnerable context, which can be deciphered as a background or situation for a person, in the case of CADI, for the youngsters in a context that demands responsiveness in a more prompt and special way, since they are unprotected from the problem of the domestic environment and the community around. She also remarks about the children that are despised, in her own words “the invisible children that no one sees”. This relates to the argument of the facelessness of poverty which dehumanise persons, or, makes lives as ungreivable lives. The informant also remarks that the social context in CADI Maré is in an urban situation. Complex of Maré is one of the most famous violent neighbourhoods in Brazil. Participant E share that it is formed by 17 different communities in the suburb of the city of Rio de Janeiro. She relates:

We work there at Complex of Maré, in Morro do Timbau. One of the 17 communities of Complex of Maré. In these communities, there live about 150 thousand inhabitants. Only Morro do Timbau has got about 7 and a half thousand inhabitants.

... we live in a context where there are 17 communities, being that at a certain point there is a division of commands. From here to there is Comando Vermelho⁵⁰, and from here from there where our community is, it is the Terceiro Comando⁵¹. We have violence because of the war of these factions that move throughout the years, sometimes, they overtake a certain community, so there is such a fight for the territory. Very violent, for example, when you see the border between these two communities, the houses there,

⁵⁰ *Comando Vermelho* (Red Command) – a criminal organisation in Brazil.

⁵¹ *Terceiro Comando* (The Third Command) – a criminal organisation in Brazil.

have you ever seen a Swiss cheese? They are all, the houses, all bullet pierced. They are heavy weapon, you know, rifle. The community, the part of Morro do Timbau that are on this side, where is the border of the hill. The shots from this rival community reaches the houses over the hill. ^{vii}

(Participant E).

Complex of Maré is often on the news in Brazil, for its extreme violence exposure, related to the problem of drug gangs' clashes.

Participant F is also from an urban context, in another state of Brazil. His centre is CADI Guaibú, located in the suburb of Recife in Pernambuco. Participant F is the president of CADI Guaibú. He is also a minister at the local Anglican Church where their centre is hosted.

He expounds his understanding of poverty in the following lines.

We can reflect on poverty in its various dimensions. But in more technical concept, it means to be deprived of the minimal conditions for quality of life. Therefore, poverty is related not only to the economic question, but as well culture, access to formation to education, health and the diverse ways it manifests. Even if the child has completed their studies in the elementary school, for instance, but if they don't have access to other good that can place them in protection, security, and quality of life, they are under the reach of poverty.

Economic poverty is, of course, one of the most serious, since it deprives the child, the adolescent from food, health, education and to have a life with quality. ^{viii}

(Participant F).

The next participant is from another state in the Northeast. CADI has got a branch affiliated to the national coalition in the district of Aratuba in the state of Ceará. Before she and her husband moved to this part of the country, they had lived in São Paulo. She is a social worker and the husband a physician. The couple has somehow always been involved with development work in the context of poverty. Either in the urban context of São Paulo or, as now, in the interior or countryside context where CADI Aratuba is located. Participant G is the interviewee that illustrates most her own view on poverty, giving several situations and examples.

Responding to the question on the understanding of poverty Participant G relates:

The reality of poverty, umm, the *sertanejo* is not a poor like the one in São Paulo or in Rio de Janeiro or in Minas Gerais. This is a part of poverty different than São Paulo, in São Paulo, people just become street living people.

He has got a little track of land, even though, it does not rain often, he has got the support of *Bolsa Família*⁵², and other supports from the government. But the main income in *Sertão* is the retirement pension of the elderly folk, just to tell you what I see poverty is. It is the greatest source of income.

The only constant source of income is the elderly population. The old ones that have not died yet. However, as they are a very united family, the elderly, they always help their children, even though, or they move all together in the same track of land, or side by side. So, it is a help besides *Bolsa Família* support, they plant. They are not, as people say, that the Northeaster is lazy. They suffer in the land, he is friendly, he is a person that adjust himself to anything, and he works.

But he doesn't have the things ... there is no more medical supplies as before. Health services is a problem.^{ix}

(Participant G).

The participant gives a clear vision of the differences between how poverty is perceived in the big cities, and she mentions the people of São Paulo, Rio de Janeiro or even Minas Gerais. These are the most populated states of Brazil, where the largest cities are too. She makes a comparison of the poverty in the big urban areas vis-à-vis poverty in the context of the countryside. The participant narrates her personal experience working in the urban context of a big city in Brazil and now in the hinterland.

The expression *sertanejo* is a Portuguese term in Brazil to refer to the person that lives in *sertão*. It has its profound meaning in the context of Brazil, even a political significance too. It brings the connotation to the populations that live in the hinterland, here in the Northeast interior. There are considerable differences in communities in the urban context vis-à-vis the ones in the countryside. The culture, lifestyle, social connections are different. *Sertão* is the name for those

⁵² <http://mds.gov.br/assuntos/bolsa-familia/o-que-e>

Bolsa Família is a programme by the federal government to tackle poverty and inequality in Brazil, based on three main pillars: income distribution; access to rights; and interaction with other social programmes.

regions which are isolated, and whist *sertanejo* is referred are the inhabitant of *Sertão*. The populations from these parts of the country endure isolation and lack good and regular access to different services such as education, health, job stability, to name a few. Usually, poverty in some dimension is connoted when the term *sertanejo* is used, albeit it means, in general, country folk for *sertanejo* and countryside for *sertão*. This differentiation is crucial to the understanding of the interconnection between their comprehension of poverty or vulnerability that we will get back to later.

Another situation which is elucidated in these lines by Participant G is the fact that the main source of income is the retirement pension that the elderly people have got. This eludes to the very serious situation of lack of economic development in the region. Throughout the years, this has been a drastic ascertainment in less developed parts of Brazil, where a lack of opportunities for young populations is present. A level of dependency on the parents, even when their children are already adults can be apprehended in the words of the interviewee. The parents are, in general words, generous to help and support their offspring since they do not have access to much opportunities to grow in emancipation. This reality overlays with the theoretical approach of dependency, reduced capabilities or no capabilities at all, which is related to the “freedom to achieve various lifestyles”, as it is illustrated by the economist Sen Amartya. The multidimensional aspect of poverty promotes the lack of job opportunities caused by economic, political factors that reinforce the dependency, thus stagnation.

In the previous lines, Participant G also mentions the problem that poverty affects the medical supplying and health services in the region. Lack of health assistance is a situation raised thereof. She argues clearly that ‘health service is a problem’.

Together with the opinion of Participant G, most of the informants have shown concern on the range of poverty which is often related to the trifold policies: health, education and security. These elements, alongside with other important ones, are prescribed in the Federal Constitution of Brazil in the 6th article⁵³. They are supposed, in the Constitution's terms, to be guaranteed by the state. Nevertheless, it is constantly a concern in the day-to-day life of Brazilians that do not have the access to health, education and security fully guaranteed by the state policies. This

⁵³ http://www.planalto.gov.br/ccivil_03/Constituicao/Constituicao.htm

neglect is clearly an unconstitutional behaviour of the public administration. It seems that the participants related the lack of good health assistance, access to education and lack of security, tight to their concept of poverty, or at least the environment of poverty in Brazil.

The further lines from Participant G portrait the concern that links poverty and the lack of those element.

The poverty, there is in the question of health, education which is very bad. The part of security is a poverty, I see this too. Security is very difficult, as PCC⁵⁴ is in Aratuba (...) they take people out of their houses by force. The mayor can do nothing. They asked for prayers. Many people are killed if they do not move. They are starting to dominate there, hiding themselves there.

The poor suffers because they are stolen. The poor, poor poor, they tied the old lady and man, nick their money that was in the drawer, and steal the television and the things. It is something I see as poverty too, lack of security.^x

(Participant G)

As Participant G describes with more details her perception of poverty, she gives more examples that might be detected in their work context:

...there is a poverty that even though they have *Bolsa Família*, the money is spent wrongly, receive clothes and throw them away, don't wash them because of laziness, this I believe it is a result of malnutrition, I don't think that it is just the result of character, only few cases it is, the malnutrition creates many other problems.

...there are drugs together with PCC, drug came strongly, and really get the people even in poor places.^{xi}

(Participant G)

The problem of violence was clear in the words of most of the informants. What calls the attention more specifically related to the question of violence is the presence of criminal organisations not only in the urban environment but in the countryside too. These organisations are known and feared in Brazil for the problem of the trafficking of drugs and their violent

⁵⁴ *Primeiro Comando da Capital* (The First Command of the Capital) – Brazil largest criminal organisation

moves. Participant E, which works in the urban context of Rio de Janeiro, expressed their exposure to violence provoked by them as well as Participant G, which works in a very different region, *Sertão* in the Northeast, where the local countryside population are exposed to the violence from the criminal organisations too.

5.2.4 National leaders

The first participant of this group is Marcel Camargo. He introduced himself as a missionary working with the third sector. He shares his time working with another organisation of the third sector in São Paulo and with CADI in the coordination for strategic partnerships and innovations. He is a social scientist, and in his own words at the beginning of the interview, he stated: ‘my academic passion field is the relation between religion and society’.

The second participant of this group is Maurício Cunha. He holds the position of one of the founders and, currently, the president of CADI Brazil. Maurício is an agronomic engineer and has got a master’s degree in Social Anthropology. He is doing now his doctorate in Public Policies in the Federal University of Paraná. Indeed, Maurício is the idealiser of CADI since de beginning and has been working with the organisation since it exists.

Both Marcel Camargo and Maurício Cunha mentioned that they are missionaries, members and associated with a local church and sent by them too.

When he was questioned about his understanding of poverty, Marcel gave different elements to understand poverty. I want to start with a line which is considered quite significant for the work of CADI and for this research.

Whoever believes that the greatest expression of God in the universe came through a poor family, a then single women pregnant in a chauvinist society run by the Greco Roman empire; and God chose the silliest way to manifest himself in History that would be through a child. We have to understand that the reason for us [CADI] to be is the poor, because God became human in the poverty. So, there is this something godly in the poor population. We learn more from God when serving the poor.^{xii}

(Marcel Camargo).

This participant expresses that there is something godly in the context of poverty. This opens up a theological perspective related to the concept of poverty. Furthermore, in the context of Brazil, ‘something godly’ can mean something special, precious, worth of pursuing, a value. In this sense, the poor populations have something to teach whoever that interact with them.

Maurício Cunha and Beth Wood, in *The Kingdom among us*, point to the fact that the work of community development should be done based of the principle of identification. They explore the example of the ministry of Jesus and Paul in which “they identified themselves with the people to whom they ministered to”⁵⁵ (my translation) (Cunha and Wood, 2019, p.111). They further explain in the book that part of this principle is the attitude of an apprentice. There is here a theological and teaching potential which the ones in the situation of poverty have to teach. Several times the Bible uses the terms poor and needy in reference to a state of crucial need for deliverance and being teachable too.

In a socially stratified society as is the Brazilian one, this attitude is somehow disturbing and challenges the idea of “it comes from top to bottom”⁵⁶ so entrenched in the culture thereof. It is actually the other way around. The poor have a lot to teach from their own stories, overcomes and struggles. In the claim reinforced by Cunha and Wood in their book, “we believe that our role is not only to respect the poor, but also to admire them. It is wonderful to minister to a people whom we admire,” (my translation) also “we incur in the risk of missing the whole point if we think we have nothing to receive from the them.”⁵⁷ (my translation)(Cunha and Wood, 2019, p.112).

So, in light of what is just presented, one can infer that these leaders see a great source of godliness and possibilities to learn from the poor populations in the work of CADI. This finding relates to the theoretical ascertainment that serving the ones whom the world despises is an act of God’s mercy to the servant. It also refers to the idea of a servant King, which is developed through the narratives of the Bible, both in the OT and NT.

⁵⁵ “se identificar com o povo a quem ministrava”

⁵⁶ “Vem de cima para baixo”

⁵⁷ “Cremos que o nosso papel está não apenas em respeitá-los, mas também em admirá-los. É maravilhoso ministrar a um povo que admiramos. Corremos o risco de perder tudo isso se achamos que não temos nada a receber deles”.

Marcel relates:

The poor has some to teach about the Kingdom, the poor and meek are relevant in the history of God for the universe, not the powerful ones, full of glory ... We want to work in this vision of the world, learn with them.^{xiii}

(Marcel Camargo).

These lines resonate to the potentiality of the poor and the idea that they can do a lot to help to improve and build a better society. This is related to the words by Participant B when she explained the significance of the following statement by CADI: “the poor is the reason for our organisation to be”, she said: “for me, it means that CADI is here to really show that the poor is not so poor, like, there are people that say, they are poor, miserable. It is not like that”^{xiv}.

In the light of the idea from these lines from Participant B, Marcel and Maurício, I suggest that there is clear support for the approach in that the poor have a potential of mutuality, and the development worker has the opportunity to learn together with all people in the context of development work. This is grounded on the development approach from the perspective of the people, instead of coming from top to bottom.

Cunha and Wood claim that “we desperately need the poor in our lives. Against the common thinking, the poor are an example for us, and not the contrary”, they argue to the direction that this is one of the “paradoxes of the kingdom of God”⁵⁸ (my translation) (Cunha and Wood, 2019, p.39).

It is essential and relevant in this context to observe that these findings are grounded in a Christian worldview. The participants make clear that their approach operates under a framework based on the Christian faith.

The Christian faith operates as a broad framework. It is our background.

Remember that our conversation stems from the perspective that Christianity is a worldview through which we access the problem of poverty and its consequences, through the worldview of Christianity.^{xv}

⁵⁸ “Precisamos desesperadamente dos pobres nas nossas vidas. Contrariando o pensamento comum, os pobres servem de exemplo pra nós, e não o oposto”.

(Marcel Camargo).

It is also possible to infer from the words of the Maurício that he uses biblical grounds to reach this aspect on his understanding of the causes of poverty. Maurício Cunha presents in one of his books the several terms to signify poverty in the Bible, both from the Old Testament and the New Testament. These different terms are used to give various dimensions to the concept of poverty.

Maurício Cunha suggests that different significances demand different approaches which can be, i.e. easier to more difficult, or immediate assistance to different services. These include giving food, goods, support, education, first aid and health treatment, exhortation, corrections, encouragement, security and a long list of other things, even to promote restitution or advocacy.

Cunha also says that poverty is a complex concept, however, exactly for the reason because it is addressed emphatically in the Bible, he understands that poverty in the Brazilian context demands an attitude of responsiveness from the church. In fact, He argues that Jesus Christ expressed clearly that he would also be found when ministering among the poor in Mathew 5:31-46.

Another finding is grounded in a theological perception of poverty presented by both Marcel and Maurício. They both argue that poverty is a direct result of a breach of the relationship concerning the original intentions of God for the whole of the creation. The two participants brought about this same perspective when they elicited that poverty is an outcome of the fall, in the Christian perspective which is provided in the narrative of the Bible in the book of Genesis chapter 3. This taught is developed over the idea that the original counsel and purpose of God in creation would have provisions for the person as a whole as well as all humankind.

This observation has to be approached from a perspective grounded in a Christian worldview since participants make clear that their approach operates under a framework based on the Christian faith.

Marcel mentioned the following:

...poverty is a direct outworking of a breach of relationship concerning the original plans of God for the whole of the creation”^{xvi}.

(Marcel Camargo)

Maurício related when describing so in his answer to the question:

We exist to act in contexts of physical and material poverty, because we understand that this has to do, again, with the whole counsel of God, we understand poverty as an outcome of the fall. It was not the original purpose of creation, ontologically, of the creational order. The question of the poor, we see as one of the purposes of God even in the creation that would be provision for everyone ... as it says in Genesis 1 and 2, 'you shall have them for food'. Even after the establishment of Israel, it is there, so 'there would be no poor among you'.^{xvii}

(Maurício Cunha)

The previous lines show a theological logic for understanding the origins of poverty; the Christian approach that the creation and the harmony in it would provide for humanity as another part of the creation. This perception overlays with a theological perception of creation and how the solution for it is. In the Christian narrative, a redemption for the creation since it is corrupted by the original sin.

The terms creation, fall and redemption, are theological concepts. Maurício Cunha supports that since the fall affected all the dimensions of creation; therefore, the way for the creation to be redeemed is through the gospel. He writes that "we work firmly rooted in the belief that the arrival of the kingdom transforms realities furthermore than provokes mystic and individuals experiences, also that church is the only organism able to minister to the integral needs of the man, that the gospel is the power that comes from above to the transformation of individual, community and nations"⁵⁹ (my translation) (Cunha, 2018, p.13).

It seems paradoxical since the reality of poverty has its origins in the biblical notion of fall and as a breach of the relationship between humanity and God. On the other hand, the poor are now

⁵⁹ Trabalhamos firmemente arraigados na crença de que a chegada do reino transforma realidades muito mais do que povoca experiências místicas e individuais, de que a igreja é o único organismo capaz de ministrar às necessidades integrais do homem, e de que o evangelho é o poder que vem do Alto para a transformação de indivíduos, comunidades e nações.

the instrument for learning and even meeting God in their context of need and poverty. This points to the idea that the redemption is then greater than the fall. Even in the hard situation of poverty, God can be found.

Finally, Marcel also expressed his view that goes towards the understanding of poverty as a multidimensional phenomenon. When he was explaining the basic ideas of the work of CADI with poverty, he stated in his lines:

We are quite aligned with the idea of the reality do the multidimensional poverty, which is a notion that the Brazilian, somehow operates, poverty is multidimensional. It has aesthetics, social, psychological and economic expressions. Therefore, we can undertake actions to confront poverty through the perspective of the aesthetics: What are the effects of aesthetics poverty? What are the cultural effects? Etc. For this reason CADI undertake actions with the art, in the culture, etc.^{xviii}
(Marcel Camargo).

It is also observed from his words that the Brazilian, in a certain level, operates this broader take on poverty instead of seeing it as only a low-income factor. This converges with most of the other informants' quotations and the multidimensional understanding of poverty. He even informs that Brazilians "somehow operates" the concept of multidimensional poverty. It gives room to the challenge in the Brazilian society that poverty, is more than just low income, rather a systematic phenomenon in the country which makes it a complicated matter which does not admit an easy solution.

In general terms, the theme of poverty is listed in the Federal Constitution of Brazil, in the 3th article, III, as one of the Fundamental objectives of the Republic. Therefore, one of the constitutional pillars of the federate state, is to "eradicate poverty and the marginalisation and reduce the social and regional inequalities" in Brazil. This has to be seen and acted upon under the multidimensional approach toward poverty which manifests with objective and subjective aspects influencing the populations capabilities. The third article of the Constitution of Brazil is marked by these objective and subjective aspects as well as the multidimensional

understanding of poverty.⁶⁰ In these terms, CADI seems to be in line with the constitutional premise in their endeavour to advance the development work with poor communities in Brazil.

Another observation is that the Anglican minister made clear in his lines that CADI does not proselytise, even though the activities happen in the venue of the Anglican parish. Most of the other informants seem to be quite enthusiastic about the strong links to the Christian faith. In fact, three of the participants became members of the local church as a consequence of their involvement with the activity of CADI.

Most of the participants made clear their understanding of poverty in economic terms. However, they also emphasised that poverty has different dimensions. They presented it in a way that I suggest that poverty can be apprehended in objective and subjective factors. I suggest based on my findings, that the concept of poverty, as understood by the research participants, goes further than just monetary poverty. In this sense, the conceptualisation of poverty as a multidimensional phenomenon is reassured in these lines. As it is appointed in a previous chapter, a more complete approach to deal with poverty produced the conceptualisation by the OPHI of multidimensional poverty. The OPHI definition of poverty “encompasses the various deprivations experienced by poor people in their daily lives”. These deprivations, among others, are listed by OPHI as “poor health, lack of education, inadequate living standards (...), threat of violence”⁶¹. All the participants present the underlying theme of these categories.

When the theories on the development thinking and the processes on how it evolved are put together with the theoretical approaches of poverty and the realities proposed in the data we have; it is notorious the theme of the various dimensions of poverty. This argument also is related to what the notorious Amartya Sen argues that poverty must be seen as deprivations of basic capabilities, and here I take the broader sense of these capabilities, rather than just the traditional criteria of level of income. As argued before, Amartya Sen recognises, however, that low income is one of the main causes of poverty, since it can be a crucial cause for “deprivation of basic capabilities” (Sen, 1999, p.75). Therefore, it cannot be neglected.

⁶⁰ http://www.planalto.gov.br/ccivil_03/Constituicao/Constituicao.htm

⁶¹ <https://ophi.org.uk/policy/multidimensional-poverty-index/>

Besides the income factor, there are other objective factors that shape a definition of poverty. In the case of Brazil, for instance, the social and economic class, ethnicity, age, among others. In the subjective factors there are ethic aspects, freedom to choose a career and the ways to live, freedom of being not persecuted, oppressed, fear of violence and empowerment (Rego and Pinzani, 2014, p.158-160). These factors are somehow alluded by the informants and even interconnected between the answers given by the participants.

In this subchapter, I have presented the findings and the research from the data collected through the interviews, books and CADI page on the internet. I emphasised recurring themes addressed in their accounts as well as the nuances that came to light when they were overlaid with the theoretical perspectives on poverty.

In the following section, I proceed to the responses given about the concept of vulnerability.

5.3 How do they understand the concept of vulnerability?

In this part, I want to analyse the lines from the informants about their understanding of the concept of vulnerability.

5.3.1 Beneficiary Mothers

Here follow the words of Participant A about the topic of vulnerability:

Ah, yes, they are vulnerable. These days, CADI telephoned to the police since there was a man showing out his parts to the children. So, there is always this or that. We, when are standing and one passes by to ask for information, we know already. So, there is this concern. It is very risky to go walking outside during the evening ... Now, there are classes for adults just there in the evening. There is always a number of guys smoking marijuana, you know, like crack, so the police vehicle is often driving by, there and here, you know, during the evening. And then, when is really night, the guys shout, you know, make noise on the streets, through things, rubbish on the streets, so the police must often be there around.^{xix}

(Participant A).

The other informant, Participant B says:

Vulnerability, so, it is to be vulnerable, for me to be vulnerable to various types of situations. Vulnerability has to do with the lack of care, with the neglect, with children that, sometimes, are all day long on streets because the parents have to go working. Others, the parents do not want to look after, since sometimes they can but do not do it, so, it has to do with to be at the mercy of, you know. To be at the mercy of what are here in the neighbourhood, drugs, violence, there were gangs ... we know that there is a gang of the messing up around that come to do mess, even in the schools. So, it is like, to be at the exposure of these, careless, many instances from the parents, careless from the society.^{xx}

(Participant B).

In the lines from these both informants, we can see that they are concerned with the exposure to the gangs, groups of people that mess around in the neighbourhood — the risk for the children and adults during the day and even more in the evening. Participant A mentions the instance of a man in the neighbourhood showing his parts to children at streets, and that the police were called to act. Participant B addresses the situation to be at the mercy of the neglect either from the parents or the larger group of the society. These informants see those situations as instances of vulnerability.

5.3.2 Staff workers – a Social worker and a Teacher.

In response to the question on the concept of vulnerability, Participant C expresses:

Vulnerability is someone to be vulnerable to something, isn't it? To me it is this, so, here we have many children that are vulnerable in relation to their own families, for example. In relation to the violence they suffer within their own homes. In relation to the lack of food, lack of care, you know. It is within their own homes that they are vulnerable. Since the child and adolescent, they do not have complete responsibility on their own, you know, so, it is obvious, then that the lack of care for them there, for me, it makes them vulnerable that way. All this violence that we see around here.^{xxi}

(Participant C)

Participant D relates:

Vulnerability, in our context, is the child be exposed to whatever the society is offering. To be vulnerable in the sense of being surrounded with violence, sometimes, this is even from inside their own house. [To be] vulnerable to have to deal with the drug dealer; if I want to have a future so I will sell this for me to have an easy money; [to be] surrounded in this risk by drugs, weapons, so often facing risks. So, we work trying to influence the children and prevent them from being so vulnerable, even the ones we do not see since they are hidden.^{xxii}

(Participant D).

Perhaps because of the difficult environment at home during childhood, this informant shared her own experience in her childhood when she had to stay quite some part of the day at CADI. She identified herself as a vulnerable child at that point. Participant C affirmed so:

... they allowed me to stay because they understood that at that time, I was also a vulnerable child, you know. For, even that I had conditions of having a cool life, I didn't have physical needs at home, but my parents were away from me, so I had this vulnerability also that I wasn't being taken care of all the time.^{xxiii}

(Participant C)

So far, the informants relate vulnerability to being exposed to some kind of risk. Participant A informs the external risks or concerns for the vulnerable, having the arena of vulnerability outside one's own house. On the other hand, Participant B, C and D expressed their view of vulnerability focusing in the domestic context, within the houses, even provoked by the attitude of one's own parents. They also show that the external of the home reaches vulnerability too.

It is notorious the affirmation that the parents' attitude or neglect is a situation to be considered as a vulnerability for their children. Such ascertainment is, somehow, a paradox since the parents should be the providers of care and not neglect.

5.3.3 Local leaders

The first lines I present here are from Participant E from CADI Maré, in Rio de Janeiro.

We did 300 home visits and visits to commercial places of work, you know, authorised traders in the community. So, we visited public agencies, other projects. We asked the community what they wanted for one more social project there. So, in November 2015,

we have the research results, and so, to face the major problem in our community that was vulnerability of children and adolescents.^{xxiv}

(Participant E).

In the same context of exemplifying how this vulnerability happens in practice in their community, Participant E exemplified:

So, can you imagine, a child, that had 53 days without school during the school year. So, imagine, the child didn't go to school today because there was a confront, and in the following day, they go, but how is this child in the classroom, you know. There is already a child which is compromised emotionally, cognitively, so this affects even the cognitive development of this child.

We have the problem of drug trafficking, for instance, there is a drug dealer spot just in front of CADI. This is just the problem of the bullet shooting between the gangs, besides this, there is the question when the police come, you know, when the police come there, there is confront too, more deaths, innocent people die.

So, the result of that research oriented us to act towards tackling this vulnerability, because of the drug trafficking, violence.^{xxv}

(Participant E).

The next informant, Participant F work in a suburb of a big city, in a similar urban context as Participant E. He shared:

We work the theme of vulnerability when we want the child and the adolescent to reflect if they are exposed or not to a situation that compromise their own wellbeing. Usually, vulnerability is related to the idea that this will never happen to you, for example, a burglary, a sexual violence, an infection with HIV, a pregnancy. When the child has this mentality that these can never happen to themselves, the show that they are vulnerable. We all can at some point be victims of a rape, a burglary, a stray bullet, a harassment by a drug dealer. So, no one is free of being affected by this type of violence ... also the environment problems, climate change, all these questions, either natural or not, put us in a situation of vulnerability.^{xxvi}

(Participant F).

These statements point to the reality of vulnerability for each individual, either youngsters or adults, at some level. All are somehow vulnerable. Another theme touched by the informants is that of sexual violence. It seems that vulnerability also is seen as a factor with various dimensions. According to Participant F, the notion of taking it for granted to not be in risk of any harm is in itself a situation that makes one vulnerable. The notion that everyone is vulnerable in some way starts to be seen by these lines, and perhaps here there is a relation to the approach on vulnerability as a constituent factor of the human condition as presented in the theory chapter.

Participant G relates:

The vulnerability is that the person, once in the poverty, I see that way, they enter even more in the poverty as they can't leave because of the mindset, because of malnutrition, the mindset has not developed, the emotional hasn't developed. It can either be they can't develop, they don't know how to spend their money, when they have some, don't know how to buy things, run business ... the problem of mental illness, many stances of mental illness ... it is the factors of risk, you know, who are in these factors of risk; the children, women, mothers, I would say the elderly since there are children that rob their own parents ... also the pregnant ones, the teenagers. Social risk, I think they are vulnerable.

But all the folks that are exposed to the factors of risk are vulnerable, you know.

So, a family that is improving financially, the husband starts drinking alcohol, he is vulnerable, you know. So, there are definitions, but I see this way.^{xxvii}

(Participant G).

These lines give an idea of a relationship of social risks to vulnerability. Participant F alludes that everyone is somehow at the mercy of vulnerability while Participant G alludes to it more as a consequence of poverty. Participant G also warns that only the fact that one sees self as immune to consequences of any turn of events, either from direct human action or consequences of environmental problem is a vulnerable person. It seems that these last two informants understand vulnerability in a bit different way. Nevertheless, the interconnection between poverty and vulnerability and the mentality when one sees oneself not susceptible to risks is a common notion to both informants.

5.3.4 National leaders

In this following part, we have the responses from Marcel Camargo and Maurício Cunha for the question on the theme of vulnerability.

Marcel describes:

Vulnerability is a technical notion; it is the risk that the communities are exposed in relation to the outcomes of poverty.^{xxviii}

(Marcel Camargo).

In this sense, vulnerability is related to the social risk to which populations can be exposed. The Federal Government Ministry of Social Assistance in Brazil has been using the term vulnerable to address the former term *carente*. This term has a broad significance such as poor, needy, disadvantaged, precarious. Despite being a reality present in Brazil, it is a negative term that is now replaced by vulnerable, or “in situation of vulnerability or social risk”⁶².

Maurício, in his turn:

So, in fact, to be frank, we don't have a concept published that are in our formation on the website. Vulnerability is related to the exposure to risk, you know, it is a previous stage to the risk per se.

Vulnerability is a broader concept than poverty for me, since you can have, for instance, an adolescent that is millionaire that is vulnerable in various respects, to abusive relationships, affective lack. So, when we are speaking in territories of vulnerability, we are talking about territories where people are exposed to have rights violated, suffer violence, suffer deprivations, you know, vulnerability has to do with this, this greater probability of suffering the effects of violation of rights and deprivation in all respects. To be a child and adolescent in Brazil today, regardless the social condition is to be in a vulnerability situation, it doesn't matter the level, that is why the range of the concept of vulnerability is over the question of income. For me it is more extensive than poverty.^{xxix}

⁶² https://www.mds.gov.br/webarquivos/publicacao/assistencia_social/Normativas/LoasAnotada.pdf

(Maurício Cunha).

The concept of vulnerability is interchangeably perceived by the informants as exposure to risks, or, even social risks. The notion of being exposed to risk is a common threat in the lines of the participant. They diverge, however, when some points that vulnerability is regarded only for the poor and aggravated according to the poverty level. On the other hand, other informants see that vulnerability ranges broadly to any person layering with the theory on vulnerability as a constitute condition of the human being.

Both Marcel and Maurício add the notion on vulnerability aligned with the understanding of the use of national policies of social assistance, under the auspices of LOAS (Organic Law of Social Assistance) and the regulations for the organisations in this sector in Brazil.

The interconnection between poverty and vulnerability is also observed in the light of the lines from the participants. This interconnection is an element that this research aims to analyse in the context of the work of CADI.

5.4 How do they understand the concept of protection?

5.4.1 Beneficiary mothers

Participant A' three grandchildren do not live with their mother, who is Participant A's daughter. Participant A held the provisory custody of the children so far in April 2019. They had a situation that the father took the children to stay with him, unexpectedly, and not following the legal protocol. Besides the bureaucratic concerns, they were exposed to difficult domestic situations with alcohol abuse and other of the sort. She had to ask the public childcare service to be able to have the kids back with her. When she was asked about her view of protection in relation to the work of CADI, she told the story of how the social worker at CADI helped her reach the public services.

I wrote to [CADI social worker]⁶³, for goodness sake, please, I need to talk to you ... then, I with faith in God, praying, asking God that [CADI social worker] helped me at that time that I was desperate ... asking for a solution. Then she [CADI social worker]

⁶³ [CADI social worker] – here she named the social worker, I replaced her name with brackets to anonymise it.

drove to me, dear one, early in the morning, took the car and drove me to the police station, as it was closed, we went to the childcare office. Then the man there asked me to calm down, I brought their documentation, whatever I had that the judge had given me e all, so, I went there, and the worker helped me a lot, she also comes here often.^{xxx}

(Participant A)

Participant A did not give a conceptualisation of protection *per se* in her answer; however, she went straightforward to share this example when asked on her understanding of protection in the context of the work of CADI. It is interesting to observe how she relates her own experience at the organisation as an example to illustrate protection.

Participant B answered:

First, protection for us is like what we have been doing. It is showing to the children that there is a safe place, that CADI is a safe haven for them. It is a place where they can talk, a place where they can share their plight and problems.

So, they can talk, they can ask for help.

For them to be free to speak, ask for help, and be also taught where, who they can ask for help, since several times they don't know.

The Childcare service that is a partner with CADI, we work also in a net where they can go to ask for help.^{xxxii}

(Participant B).

This informant expresses that CADI is a place where the children, which is their main target public, can approach and share their situations. As mentioned in the chapter on the background situation for the populations in poverty in Brazil, people are exposed to several risks to their own integrity. This can be in domestic environments, within the homes as well as in external environments. Usually, it takes a while for youngsters to be able to speak to others on what is going on when abuses of different sorts are happening to them. This is dangerous since the perpetrators sometimes might be the ones who are supposed to be the protectors. As mentioned in another stage, CADI is part of the official “Network of Protection” (*Rede de Proteção*). This is a network of public agencies like the police, childcare service, schools, social centres of reference, for instance; as well as private and third sector entities, like CADI. The Network of Protection is part of the National Policy of Social Assistance (*PNAS – Política Nacional de*

Assistência Social)⁶⁴. CADI has several situations when they report to the childcare services or the police according to the specificity of the cases.

Participant B's also brought about the need for CADI to protect the children in the case of physical and sexual abuse. In her own words, she answered:

... teaching them, that they can protect themselves, we have a specific theme ... this is Claves⁶⁵. So, the public and private parts, how the child can defend themselves.

We work with the adults too. There are cases of mothers, you know, that we have got to give help. We must teach too, you know. There was a case of a mother that we had to talk to, instruct till she reported to police and made a police report, so the husband would be removed from home because he would abuse physically not only the children, but the mother too.

He was removed from home, then he realised he was losing ... he asked for help. He knew our pastors because she was a member in our church. He was taken into a rehab centre and is mended even today.^{xxxii}

(Participant B).

In light of what Participant B has answered for the protection question, it can be inferred that they have the notion that protection is especially related to physical and sexual abuse. In these samples, they express the notion of the need for protection in a specific case, usually related to the domestic environment and the importance of having an available place to find help. There is a clear notion of Protection happening when they have a safe place where they can share their struggles and problems. For this reason, CADI inhabits a role of great importance in partnership with the public policy for protection through the "Network of Protection".

We have now seen the answers of two mothers who are not only beneficiaries but also volunteers at CADI. The next section will present the responses by a teacher and a social worker in one of the centres of CADI.

⁶⁴ http://www.mds.gov.br/webarquivos/publicacao/assistencia_social/Normativas/PNAS2004.pdf

⁶⁵ Claves Brazil is a programme with the proposal of working the promotion of good treating and prevention of mistreatment and sexual violence in the infancy and adolescence (my translation from Claves Brazil - <http://www.clavesbrasil.org/claves-brasil/>)

5.4.2 Staff workers – a Social worker and a Teacher

We start this part with the lines from Participant C on the understanding of protection.

Protection, I understand protection as you set a person free, or encircle them with the due care, you know, I see that way. So, seeing what CADI Fazenda Rio Grande act today, I perceive that our fight is to protect the children and the adolescents and to ensure their rights. I think that when we can ensure these rights, informing them, letting them know their rights and duties, we are protecting, because they will know where to go and what to say.

So, for me, protection is that, it is when you inform, when you also fight against what it is putting the child in a situation of risk. So, for me, protection is this, to encircle them of all that we can.^{xxxiii}

(Participant C).

These lines highlight the notion of protection as encircling one with the due care or due rights. This notion is also extracted from the language of the public policies for the citizens, specifically here, the minors. Also, the notion of knowing the rights and ensuring the rights of the youngsters is clear, in Participant C's lines which is a social worker. She also makes clear that protection reaches the field of the fight against what is putting the child in the situation of risks.

Another allusion that Participant C does in relation to protection is that the organisation CADI is part of the public policy that is called Net of Protection (*Rede de Proteção*) in Brazil. Her lines follow:

We have got a partnership with the net of protection, you know, so, as I need to give referrals. We won't be able to attend everyone ... the assistance policy describes that we must be in the Network of Protection, because we need one another to solve the problems. Only one public entity won't solve everything.^{xxxiv}

(Participant C)

Several different public agencies and entities like schools, the police, childcare service, health centres among others together with third sector organisations such as CADI are part of the net of protection following the national social assistance policies.

Participant D answered the question on protection on what the childcare service procedure might be, his lines go this way:

Protection is to choose difficult choices even in this matter of removing the child from their own family because the family has been negligent, or the family has caused something to the child.^{xxxv}

(Participant D).

In a more experiential note, he puts it this way:

So, protection is when you put yourself in risk for a life ... putting this way, to protect a child, a teenager, a life itself.^{xxxvi}

(Participant D).

His view is expressed in two factors; first, the procedure that the childcare service can do, if the case demands it, to remove the children exposed to neglect or risk at their homes. CADI, itself, cannot do this, only the childcare service which has public legal authority to take such measures, as part of the government system. However, CADI is a means since it is a partner of the Network of Protection. In second, he words the need that sometimes one have to take positions that might be risky for the agent in order to protect the children. CADI has faced incidents when they have to take a stand for the welfare of the youngsters, in partnership with the childcare service.

5.4.3 Local leaders

In this part, I present the answers of the local leaders to the question regarding the concept of protection and their perception of protection in the context of CADI. The comments that follow are from the third group of participants. It is important to recall that Participant E and Participant F come from programmes located in big cities, while Participant G is in the countryside context.

On protection Participant E answered:

It is a look that we have to each child, you receive many children like ... I like to recognise each one of them. And this protection, this look is the look that brings

protection, you know, I see there where there is vulnerability, where there is a demand in what we can contribute for this child, this family to be protected.^{xxxvii}

(Participant E).

This informant makes the relationship between vulnerability and protection. Where there is vulnerability, there is a demand that can be responded with protection. Since vulnerability is an integrant part of the human experience, it is for everyone. She mentions the child and their families. It seems that this brings about the complexity and ambiguity of vulnerability. It seems to be two sides of a coin. While injustices, violence, poverty must be worked with to be eliminated, there is great power in the love, solidarity, responsibility in the factor of vulnerability.

Further on, Participant E mentioned, still in the context of protection:

Last year, we started a group called *Maré Jovem* which is a group of young adults and adolescents, where we would bring some issues and we started looking to our community, we realised, at that point, a very vulnerable community that is there, called Maclaren. It was an old shipyard, and it is a community under a bridge, very very poor. So, we realised, we know it is an occupation and that it would not be able to help to build houses as it is a provisory area ... and so, we managed to get water tank donations ... that was the least we could do for those people and treat them with some dignity. About 100 people lived there, the water came through a pipe that is very close to the sewage drain ... the same water that washed the feet, do the dishes is the one they'd drink.

Today CADI, it has a methodology call Polis Network (*Rede Polis*) which focus on public policies. A work that we can apply with our young adults and adolescents.^{xxxviii}

(Participant E).

From these lines, we can infer her notion that protection is related to, at some level, a service to be provided to people in risk, as the example of this situation. CADI also applies Polis Network where people have the opportunity to be not only receptors but agents for better access to rights, flourishing life and well-being.

It seems that there is not only harm in the context of vulnerability, but also the potential for agency, and the organisation aims to encourage that. Thus, vulnerability is not only a ground for love and solidarity but also for agency and flourishing.

These sorts of occupation where people just start living in areas without infrastructure are common to happen in the urban areas of big cities in Brazil. She expresses that special care is demanded, this is only possible with a sense of solidarity and responsiveness, instead of the neglect.

Participant F expresses his opinion of protection in relation to risks created even by the own community wherein they live:

All the effort of CADI is also towards get the child protected to the risks that the own society, they own community impose on them. Even if they are natural risks like flooding, risk of fire, collapse of damns. So, they should be safe, in condition having the risks minimised.

Protection, either in the question of communitarian violence or in the question of the environment, plus in the situation of malnutrition ... so, the children, to them must be offered the best conditions in the spaces where they go.

Also, protection regards security. We work the socialisation with the child, their nutrition that must be the healthiest possible ... usually, the most commercial food in the shops don't have quality, there is an excess of elements which are bad for health, we work food safety with them, so they can start like making the option for what is healthy. We have this food safety teaching where we work food preparation and handling as well as storage.^{xxxix}

(Participant F).

It is notable in the lines of Participant F, the concern with different elements like social situations, community, environment situations as well as nutrition situations. These are factors that affect their area in the suburb of Recife straightforwardly. Gaibú, which is located in Cabo de Santo Agostinho is in the area of one of the biggest and busiest harbours in the Northeast of

Brazil. For years, this has been causing impacts in the local communities. Protection, therefore, is related to the effects of these urban operations.

The notions from both Participant E and Participant F on protection have connections with the outcomes of the urban environment in the metropolises in Brazil.

The third informant of this group, as mentioned before, comes from a different context. Participant G works in a countryside ambience. Her lines answering the question about her understanding of protection expresses more domestic concerns as she gave examples:

The protection is like, uhm, if the child is at their place, they can sometimes, be raped, abused, something that usually the father, uncle, grandfather, cousin. It is domestic.

Another about protection is, beating you know, the husband beats the wife, aggression ...we don't have in our area but at CRAS, I've seen many cases.

Elderly people that need to be protected, there at my CRAS, since it is Sertão, I'm only saying as we don't have much elderly folk at Pindoba, it is younger there, it is a small village, the children take their parent's money.

So, we really must protect. We report, but I am often concerned with these reports ... I tell you; I don't trust the childcare service sometimes. I have worked at CRAS.^{x1}

(Participant G).

This informant gave examples of situations that elicit her view when protection is a need to be met. She emphasised the domestic environment where abuses of different levels and serious consequences are unfolded.

First, she elicited the question of physical and sexual abuse against children, even by family members, then the physical abuse usually perpetrated by the spouse against women, followed by children stealing from their own parents all in a context of a small village in the countryside. Perhaps this has a relation to the fact that the public services such as childcare agency can be inefficient to protect the ones who need protection in the domestic context. Participant G expressed her scepticism that reporting to authorities will be useful to safeguard the victims. This concern shows that there are cracks in the protection policies in the background of

participant G. The Network of Protection is inefficient. It seems that it is less efficient in rural areas.

Here, it is also important to highlight that CRAS, mentioned above, is one of the public entities in charge of the social assistance in the local neighbourhoods throughout the country. It is part of the Network of Protection policy. The concern of Participant G regarding the efficiency of these public entities contrasts the approach that Participant B and Participant C hold on the Net of Protection. It seems that different participants have a different experience on the efficiency of the public authorities and policies in these different locations.

5.4.4 National leaders

When Marcel Camargo was asked about his understanding of protection, he expressed:

Protection is more like a technical notion in the field of the social assistance in which we operate.

The government typifies in the public policies regulatory benchmark of the assistance the notion of protection, of making sure the access to the rights. This all is in the theoretical framework of CADI that results in our concrete actions. For instance, our organisation has a policy for child protection, the volunteer is working with CADI, the one has to sign a commitment with the Brazilian legislation regarding the rights of the children and the adolescents. This is a practical measure to make sure that whoever access the children, know that they have specific rights. So, it is a technical notion.^{xli}

(Marcel Camargo)

Marcel makes clear that CADI is under the public policies, under the laws of the Social Assistance in Brazil. Since CADI, like many other organisations, participates in the Network of Protection, it must follow the regulations by the government. They would not even be allowed to run their work if not under auspices of the legislation and regulations. Protection is a usual term in the norms of social assistance in the country.

In the same sense, he also elicited the idea that protection is related to the applying of preventive measures. The following lines given by him were:

The notion of protection, that is a technical notion, here it is applied the preventive and protective notions. Protective is when the right was already violated, so I have to ensure that the violence does not happen to that person, family or community. So, this a technical notion for protection of the children, for example.

Then, I have measures to ensure that the violation to the rights won't happen.

CADI intends to be an organisation that protects, create safe environments for the child, adolescent and the community. It is in this terms that we discuss protection. Perhaps the difference here is that here we do that from the notion of the character of God to each child, adolescent and community.^{xliii}

(Marcel Camargo).

From these lines, we can infer the idea of protective measures and preventive measures in the face of hazards of rights being violated. The question lays on the fact the stance for protection can be before or after any violation of rights or, even harm happens. This notion is present in the juridical framework of Brazil with the idea of distributive justice when the right and assistance is promoted, and on the other hand, rectifying justice; correcting and even punish the perpetrator of a violation. The concept of justice extends to the realm of prevention and retribution to be able to make jus fulfilled (Wolterstorff, 2008, p.69-70). Despite of this, it seems by all the other informants that protection comes before and encloses preventing and repairing in different situations.

The second informant of the group of national leaders, Maurício Cunha, when was asked about protection in the context of the work of CADI answered:

For example, we have got methodologies for prevention of abuse and violence where the child gets to know their rights. This is one of the methodologies that CADI uses. We have got a policy of protection of childhood, in our centres, where the child, the workers have to know this policy, do not expose the child to risky behaviours and situations. For instance, the child not to stay over at a teacher's place, a sponsored child not to receive visits from the sponsor without the mediation of our staff, they can be paedophile, many questions.

Also, to strengthen the family capacities, in the protection of their children, some centres work with income generation, for example. The question of protection is not our strongest feature, but some centres work with it, you know.

The question of protection, the empowering of children and adolescents, for instance, in the monitoring of services and public policies.^{xliii}

(Maurício Cunha).

Maurício, in the same way of Marcel, brings about the notion of protection related to prevention. He also gives the example that empowering families to generate income, can be a way to manage protection as this would intensify their capacities. It seems that there is an interconnection with the idea of capabilities by Amartya Sen, as discussed in the theory chapter. Maurício also recognises the struggle in the concern of protection and that it is not the strongest feature of CADI.

It seems that both Marcel and Maurício relate the notion of protection to measures of policies of protection within the field of ensuring rights, either with restorative or preventive measures.

To be aware of the rights pointed out by the participants as well as a way to protect. As it is spelt out in the background subchapter about Brazil, the question to be conscious of rights and understand them can be related to the problem of poverty in Brazil together with injustices which manifest even naturally as it is taken for granted in a systematic and problematic society framework in Brazil.

Maurício also relates the methodology *Letra Viva* in which they do a Bible reading and studying in a conversation group to protection too. He related:

Usually, these conversation groups where we extract from the Bible, elements that will foment for a transformation of a life with empowerment, with the creation of protective capacities for a family from the text of the scripture too. It does not have a proselytist concern, but it gives biblical principles to the community.^{xliv}

(Maurício Cunha).

This participant relates the notion of protection to methodologies that CADI uses in their work. He mentions the methodology *Letra Viva*, when they extract from the Bible elements of the narrative which can foment transformation of the life, empowerment and protection for families. Maurício spells out that *Letra Viva* does not have a proselytist concern even though it presents Biblical tenets.

5.5 How do they understand the concept of potentiality?

In this section, I will analyse the responses given by the interviewees regarding the question of what they understand about potentiality in the context of the work of CADI.

The approach we have to this section is also grounded on the notion that potentiality is straightforward connected to the notion of empowering. These terms have the same root and will interconnect throughout the analyses.

5.5.1 Beneficiary mothers

When asked about her understanding of potentiality in the context of the work of CADI, both Participant A and Participant B expressed that their children have great potential and talent.

Participant A brought the example of her grandchildren skills to sing and that she wishes CADI had a singing workshop. Her lines went:

They have potentiality, now that I said, if there was singing here for them, that would be great because they sing very well ... they are very intelligent, you know. Of course, the child is like that, they always have a bit of stubbornness, each one has their own way, as [the social worker] said: each of them has got a way to deal, you know, own way. So, we have to focus on that then, and try to understand them, you know.^{xlv}
(Participant A).

Participant B also brought about an example she judged would illustrate potentiality:

It is easier to give you a specific situation, there was a situation of a boy that was going awful at school with a learning deficit, bad behaviour, he would not adjust to any workshop here, then he started doing robotics workshop. He started doing robotics, and

started to realize, started working with various things, and improving. His behaviour improved at school, at home. So, like, the education was now better ... he started helping at home too, dealing with things, assemble and fix things, you know, showing him, and he was very intelligent, very intelligent. So, we'd show him that he could be different than his father, than what the environment around him would show.^{xlvi}
(Participant B).

In these lines, Participant B expressed the potentiality enclosed in the example of this lad. He was struggling at home, at school and at CADI centre. However, their work helped him to develop his skills. In this case, the tool was through the robotic classes. She also pointed the context of his house that the boy could see that he could be different from his father, perhaps here there is a situation of bad parenting by the father, which can often take place in these contexts in Brazil. Participant B also elicited that the child was quite industrious in dealing with the robotic parts, assembling and fixing thing as he could.

These two participants, A and B, responded to the question on potentiality, expounding the examples of children and their abilities. In the light of their potential, CADI could, through its ministry, help them to develop giving the children grounds, environments and opportunities for their talents to flourish.

The national president of CADI, Maurício Cunha relates in his lines with these examples when he explained about empowering:

Empowering means to ascribe power, you know, to accredit potential, to make the most of the potential of these children. What we perceive like, many of these children. I mean mainly the children and teenagers who are our main focus, we can see the whole potential for a full life, a whole development, for a profession, for example, but they don't have the opportunity to explore such potential. I mean flourishing indeed."^{xlvii}
(Maurício Cunha).

Their notion alludes the fact that usually the youngsters have a latent potential, but it is necessary to work it out and give the appropriate opportunity for it to flourish.

I also included the lines from the national leader Maurício here, in relation to the mothers' lines. Maurício recognises the great potential, however lack of empowering to flourish. Besides, he also sees himself as a beneficiary in the context of his work (Cunha, 2019, p.113).

5.5.2 Staff workers – a Social worker and a Teacher

The first informant in this group is Participant C. She shared regarding the notion of potentiality:

Potentiality for me, is when a person realises the best they have, or what they have to offer, or something that they didn't know but develop, for me it is the potential. But here, I suppose that the potential of CADI is to develop these people. Develop in the sense, for example, the children we have got here, they don't know that they are good at sports when they come, so we want to develop their potential in this. Some will develop the potential, will really outstand at sports, but others will not. I think our role here in developing, i.e., to open the way for these children, isn't it, and for these mothers that participate here too. So that they find themselves and realise, you know.”^{xlviii}
(Participant C).

She also followed this notion of hidden, latent potential to be put forward into the conditions of possibility to be developed. The lines by Participant C have a relation to the lines of Participant D when the latter explains:

Potentiality is something that is always kept in the heart of many people within themselves. And if they don't know how to awake it ... so it is for CADI to awaken potentialities, it is something very essential.^{xlix}
(Participant D).

It seems, by the quotes of the participants that potentiality is something latent that is there within people's structure that need to be awakened. It seems that the potential is there, even in the context of poverty or vulnerability, but it must be protected and empowered to be asserted. It also suggests the notion of a constituent as it is elicited in one of the theoretical approaches on vulnerability. Participant D, at some point, brought the term resilience in the context of the question of potentiality as he worded it:

Sometimes they struggle to realise like, I have resilience, I stand firm even against all difficulties against me ... perhaps, the role of CADI, perhaps it is something like that, like: mate, you will be able to achieve your things, will be able to dream and achieve it. CADI is here to serve, even as a steppingstone, for children to grow, reach, aim their dreams, not only for themselves, but as family too.^l

(Participant D).

It is interesting to see this notion of resilience in the midst of need. Participant D recognises that they have resilience in the plights they face. CADI can be presented as a bridge to achieve potential, perhaps the strong capacity and resilience of the poor public should be highlighted better. These vast populations in Brazil are not only a burden for the country, but they make the nation together and are a force working daily in the course of the history of the country. The poor are holders of great potentiality as well as resilience, despite all misfortunes they face. This resilience also points to the fact that there is agency, not only passivity with the poor and vulnerable.

5.5.3 Local leaders

In this section, we have the answers provided by the third group of informants. They are the same Participants F and G from the previous subchapters.

Participant F is the local leader of Gaibú, in the suburb of Recife. Under the topic of potentiality, he answered:

We believe every child, themselves, has the potential that must be discovered, explored, strengthened. There is no one child, the poorest one may be, that is useless.

They must discover their talents, their capacity and learn to explore them in a way to strengthen their own confidence, self-stem. And their will to dream and live their dreams, keep fighting till the dream is reached. Each one of them must know, perceive themselves as an individual of rights as well as an individual that can play a role in the community in which they are.^{li}

(Participant G).

This informant brought forth the idea of potential to be discovered, explored and strengthened. Everyone has got an inherent potential. Also, he mentioned they are individuals of rights and must be aware of this fact. This alludes to the question of rights to be guaranteed. Certainly, in Brazil there is a rich and developed framework of rights; however, they must be enforced to take place in reality, perhaps that is the greatest challenge for CADI and society in general. In this sense, even more action is needed in the context of poverty and vulnerable groups.

Participant G brings another demand from the countryside folk when she responded the question on potentiality:

The *sertanejo* is seen in the city as a useless. I go to the open market and observe the people, they are mistreated. So, we want to empower these women, these elderly people. We say: aren't you 60 years or older, so you will skip the queues.^{lii}

(Participant G).

This sentence must be read in the context. She mentioned the struggles of the *sertanejo* when the one goes to the city, for instance, she explains that they are not respected. Then, she relates to empowering women and elderly people, even though the main target public of CADI are children and teenagers. At some point, she mentioned the effort to convince to dress up well, which is a cultural element in Brazil that signifies dignity, and perhaps a self-feeling of empowerment. Participant G worded:

Empowering for women is because she is important, I always tell them to dress well.^{liii}

(Participant G).

This short sentence alludes to the fact the even dressing well is an act of empowering. The context of this leader of CADI is in the context of isolated communities in the countryside. As explained before she and her husband work with poor families in the context of CADI Aratuba. She has been working with the mothers of the youngsters that participate at CADI programmes. It can be apprehended by her lines that this is one aspect of line that has to be developed. They must know who they are and be what they know they are. This is also a process of empowering in putting forth their reality that demonstrates, somehow, physically, what is internal. It seems

this undertake is overlying with the lines above mentioned by Maurício Cunha, which alludes to the potential to flourishing indeed.

Dressing well is a way to empower and show dignity in the culture of Brazil. This notion can be ambiguous; in one hand, it is a dimension of the human experience, the aesthetic sphere. On the other hand, if this dimension is prioritised in detriment of other dimensions at any cost, it can become a problem, since one will be judged by the appearances. That is a problem in the country too.

5.5.4 National leaders

In this part, we have the responses for the theme potentiality given by the national president of CADI, Maurício Cunha and Marcel Camargo.

Marcel started saying:

About potentiality, we believe radically that the resources needed for overcoming the situation of poverty is in the own community. In this sense, we don't expect great solutions, from great investors, that will solve all the problems of poverty. Our leaders are instructed to humbly find out what God has already placed in the community.^{liv}
(Marcel Camargo).

This idea overlays with the assertion on the potentiality given by Maurício when he describes:

Empowering means to ascribe power, you know, to accredit potential, to make the most of the potential of these children. What we perceive like, many of these children. I mean mainly the children and teenagers who are our main focus, we can see the whole potential for a full life, a whole development, for a profession, for example, but they don't have the opportunity to explore such potential. I mean flourishing indeed.^{lv}
(Maurício Cunha).

Maurício Cunha was explaining the idea behind the heading on their website “potentializing dreams and vocations”. The notion that the potential is there, it has to be explored and developed, seems to inspire what these informants believe and dream on the work of CADI. This is important as it remits to the notion of empowering in order to make this happen. It layers

with the theoretical notion that poverty entangles mentioned in the other chapter where empowering the people in situation of poverty is a way to tackle poverty in place of only serving. Certainly, assistance is necessary, but it also requires the way ahead envisioning empowerment in the different levels of necessity.

Maurício Cunha and Beth Wood in *The Kingdom among us* assert that:

Every community, regardless of how precarious it is, has several good things that God has already planted there: resources, people, talents, capacities, attitudes of solidarity, cooperation, openness for changes, vocation for work, hope etc. The wise development agent identifies these qualities and builds the work based on them, maximizing the potential of the people⁶⁶ (Cunha and Wood, 2019, p.121) (my translation).

They clarify that they learned this principle with the work of CADI throughout the years, and now one of the principles for the work of CADI is “starting with what they already have”. They argue that often social programmes tend to arrive at a certain community thinking they will bring everything that is needed; however, their experience has proved them this paradigm must be inverted. Even when the organisation has many resources, it must resist the temptation to bring everything ready and formatted to the community when it is (Ibid.).

They argue that one of the notions of potential to be boosted is present in the lines of all the participants. It seems that they see potentiality to be protected, discovered, explored and strengthened. This has a significance in relation to the term empowering.

Marcel also relates to the biblical grounds for potentiality and empowering, in his words:

Various biblical stories inspire our reflection. For example, Jesus was in the midst of a situation of a hungry crowd. So, his disciples said: Jesus, send them away since we do not have money to solve their problem.

⁶⁶ “Toda comunidade, por mais precária que seja, tem muitas coisas boas que Deus já plantou ali: recursos, pessoas, talentos, capacidades, atitudes de solidariedade, cooperação, abertura para mudanças, vocação para o trabalho, esperança etc. O agente de desenvolvimento sábio identifica essas qualidades e edifica o trabalho baseado nelas, maximizando o potencial do povo.”

So, one of the disciples finds out a boy with a bunch of 5 loaves of bread and 2 fishes. From this little resource of a lad among the hungry crowd, Jesus works a miracle and feed the crowd. The gospel, it is this gospel that finds out this potential associated to the communities and it is this very mainstay of this story that we want to operate our methodology of development.^{lvi}
(Marcel Camargo).

These lines show the approach of potentiality taken by CADI as they source from the Bible this connection to develop the potential of the people with whom they work. This is overlying with the theological theory on the intrinsic valour accredited to humans in whatever situation they are. He also makes this connection between the gospel and potentiality.

Marcel furthers his idea claiming the vocation of the communities, in his words:

Finding out in God, with the community the potential that it has got. What is the vocation that these communities have. And from this, to bring along the input that CADI would have to boost the effects of this, bringing benefits, and overcoming poverty in these communities.

In light of that, the projects of CADI are results of a communitarian diagnostic, where we hear the community. The community has always an active role, an agent, they are a clear agent building the solution.^{lvii}
(Marcel Camargo).

It seems that the viewpoint of Marcel about potentiality relates to an endogenous factor. This is related to the approach that Maurício uses in his book on the attitude of not coming with the motivation: “they need us”. He suggests in accordance with Marcel that it is only efficient if there is a mutual experience and learning attitude that CADI must watch itself to be grounded on. Another notion is that potentiality relates to nurturing abilities to have a dream and vocations taking place, developing.

The agency of the beneficiaries is presented somehow in the lines by participants. They need for promoting and exploring the potentiality is clear too. Perhaps a better term is needed instead of beneficiary since this gives a bit of an idea of passivity, only receiving services. That can

hurt more than help since the poor populations are seen only as a burden to the society, while, indeed, they are resilient agents in the processes of the nation.

6. Discussion

In chapter 5, I gave a presentation of the data collected through the interviews and written material from CADI and discussed the connections between them and how they layer with theories too. The data were organised according to groups of participants and themes such as poverty, vulnerability, potentiality and protection in the context of the work of CADI.

In this chapter, I continue the discussions that started in the findings of the data in relation to the theories earlier discussed in chapter 3, as well as supplement relevant literature. Certainly, there is no room to discuss every single finding. Therefore, I will focus on the issues that emerge from the research questions and try to answer them as the chapter unfolds.

The first research question I want to discuss is: How are the concepts of poverty, vulnerability, protection, and potentiality understood by the participants of CADI, at different levels?

6.1 Poverty

One of the main concerns of this theses is how the participants of CADI understand the phenomenon of poverty in the context where they are. As presented earlier in this thesis, poverty is a systematic problem in Brazil which has been perpetuating throughout the history of the country. The trend of decreasing poverty seems to be stagnated in recent years in Brazil. Recent relevant reports presented in the Background chapter shows that poverty increased in the country lately, opposing the trend of decreasing observed in years before. The paradox and outrageous fact are that Brazil as a wealthy nation does not seem to manage to make the wealth of the country an efficient instrument to tackle poverty and improve the lives of the poorest portion of the population.

Consistently, all the participants expressed their views mentioning different dimensions where poverty is manifested. They see poverty as lack of something; however, all the answers go beyond the notion of low income. The understanding of economic poverty is also interchangeable in the answers. However, it looks like they operate better the comprehension of different aspects and dimensions of poverty.

The informants were quick to answer giving examples, stories of what they understand as poverty. Usually, the notions mix different causes and consequences of poverty.

6.1.1 Poverty as a multidimensional phenomenon

Poverty as a multidimensional phenomenon was interchangeably present in words of all participants. Themes like lack of access to health service, violence, exposure to drugs and sexual abuses, lack of educational opportunities were brought to the conversation more often than the economic aspect of poverty. Themes such as health, education, and security are often in the conversations and concerns of the populations in Brazil, and they are present in the Federal Constitution, in the laws and regulations about the welfare policies. They are also often used as political rhetoric or populist approaches in the public space. These themes have a specific effect on the attention of people; it is like a discourse desired to be heard.

Participant E and Participant G mentioned the problem of violence of the drug gangs in the country and how the criminal organisations are present in different states. For instance, Participant E is from the state of Rio de Janeiro, while participant G is in the state of Ceará. The locations are far away from each other, but the criminal organisations' activities still disturb the daily lives of the populations, in particular, the most vulnerable ones, who suffer under the violence of these outlaw organisations. Their example shows how they strike, forcing people out of their houses or when someone is hit by a stray bullet, as often happens in poor communities in Rio de Janeiro.

On this theme of violence, Participant G used the wording: "they are starting to dominate there, hiding themselves there". The verb *dominate* that she applies here comes with the connotation of violence, tension and undesired enforcement. Participant E makes clear that in their community they have the "violence because of the war of these factions that move throughout the year, sometimes they overtake a certain community, so there is such a fight for the territory". This participant also uses words like *war*, *overtake* and *fight*. These terms express the violence present in the poor neighbourhoods in the country. Despite different levels and ways, such violence is common.

Participant G answered directly that "we can reflect on poverty in its various dimensions". He claims the question of deprivation from "the minimal conditions of quality of life" which is

overlying with not only the notion of multidimensional poverty but also the deprivation of basic capabilities. He raises the problem of lack of access to culture, education and health too. This participant points out, however, that "economic poverty is, of course, one of the most serious, since it deprives the child, the adolescent from food, health, education and to have a life with quality". It appears that the aspects are interconnected, one provokes the other at the same time.

The psychological and spiritual dimension of poverty is also mentioned by the participants. These dimensions are contemplated in the theories on development and the multidimensional aspect of poverty. In fact, it seems that evading the psychological and spiritual sphere is a way to disregard the feelings of the poor populations. This problem is recognised and addressed in the development thinking evolution, and a human factor important to be taken into serious consideration. Neglecting the subjective factor suppresses the expressions of the human experience. It has somehow relations to giving face, human face to the ones that are often unseen, avoided. Perhaps a bridge between hearing and giving heed to the voices of the poor is a way to empower, protect, even making lives grievable, ones that once were invisible — assigning value of life as a way to humanise humans.

Participant A mentioned that there are people who are poor in spirit. Participant B claimed that "it is not even the lack of money that will determine whether the child is happy or not ... there are types of poverty. Sometimes, you have everything, but the soul is poor". Participant C and D mentioned the spiritual aspect of poverty, poverty in spirit and poverty in the soul.

The participants Marcel and Maurício spelt out a theological dimension when answering about poverty. They said that poverty is the consequence "of a breaching of relationship concerning the original plans of God for the whole creation". These words are from Marcel Camargo. The other national leader Maurício Cunha answered that "we understand poverty as an outcome of the fall". Those claims have profound theological roots. Also, it seems that poverty in the material dimension is connected to the spiritual dimension, in the lines by these two participants.

These last answers show a theological logic for understanding the origins of poverty. In the case of the leaders of CADI, they grounded it from one of the Christian perspectives that since the creation is corrupted by sin, the solution is the Christian narrative of redemption. Maurício Cunha in one of his books spells out that since the sin has affected all the dimensions of creation,

therefore, the way of creation to be redeemed is through the gospel (Cunha, 2018, p.13). This notion refers to a public theology on which CADI bases its work.

The Oxford Poverty & Human Development Initiative argues that one of the advantages of the multidimensional approach is that “different indicators can be chosen to reflect the needs and priorities of a nation, as well as its constituent regions, districts, provinces, etc.”⁶⁷ The flexibility to contextualise the ways to measure poverty is also a way of the multidimensional approach. In this research, for instance, while most of the concerns are commonalities, there are differences between the contexts, culture, risk exposure; thus, the approaches must also be different in order to be efficient. Indeed, the cultures in Brazil are diverse between South to North, urban and rural contexts.

It also seems that this multicultural undertake encompasses different levels; therefore, it helps better to see the problem of poverty, in a broader and complete take.

The situation of Brazil also shows that measuring poverty only by economic means does not provide a full picture of the phenomenon of poverty. While according to the World Bank list in 2018, Brazil is the 9th largest economy in the world⁶⁸, and a richer economy comparing to other economies in Latin America, extreme poverty affects 13.5million people and has hit the highest level in the comparison to the last seven years⁶⁹. It seems that the situation demands not only addressing improving the economy but also addressing the inequalities of opportunities, resources and the rich of the nation. There are probably several different explanations for this; nevertheless, the inequality is one of the major challenges to tackle the question of poverty. The UN warns that level or inequality of Brazil is the second highest in the world, below only Qatar⁷⁰, as it is pointed out in the Background chapter.

The 5th article of the Federal Constitution of Brazil upholds the principle of equality for all the population. Equality is received as part of the fundamental and immutable clause in the Constitution; however, the application of this institute is a challenge not met yet. Inequality in

⁶⁷ <https://ophi.org.uk/policy/multidimensional-poverty-index/>

⁶⁸ <https://databank.worldbank.org/data/download/GDP.pdf>

⁶⁹ <https://www.worldbank.org/en/country/brazil/overview>

⁷⁰ <http://hdr.undp.org/sites/default/files/hdr2019.pdf>

Brazil is not just situational but systemic; it has historical, cultural and political backgrounds in the society which must be addressed.

6.2 Vulnerability, Protection and Potentiality

All the participants were also asked to comment their understanding on the terms vulnerability, protection and potentiality. While poverty is the broader context and the poor is the reason for the work of CADI, according to what is well explicit at the presentation of this faith-based organisation, the expressions vulnerability and potentiality emerge as hot topics in this discussion.

In this part, I aim to show the interconnection of these elements in the development work in Brazil where CADI is engaged. Perhaps, at first glance the interconnection between these factors is not so straightforward. Nevertheless, I claim that the interdependence I propose can be a tool for the benefit of comprehending the challenges in the context of poverty and enhance the debate once put in parallel.

The mission of CADI renders that they aim to "promote access to rights as well as facilitate the integral development of people and families in context of social vulnerability, promoting transformation". They also state that the scope of their social interventions aims to prioritise the communities in condition of vulnerability and social risk. This is, indeed, an important priority, not only in terms of addressees but also in social, geographical, political terms, to name a few.

The terms vulnerability and social risk are often connected in the language of the Social Assistance Policies in Brazil. The comments on the 2nd article of the Organic Law of Social Assistance (*LOAS*)⁷¹ prescribe the term '*carentes*', which translates needy or poor in Portuguese, is to be replaced by the expression 'in situation of vulnerability and social risk. It seems, however, to be a mistake to generalise the word vulnerability too much. While the notion relates to the poor who are vulnerable, however it is not only the poor who are vulnerable.

The semantic aspect of the word is a significant question to be addressed. As explained before, words have peculiar levels of significance in different languages. Even though the primary

⁷¹ https://www.mds.gov.br/webarquivos/publicacao/assistencia_social/Normativas/LoasAnotada.pdf

meaning is the same in English and Portuguese, the language of the interviews, the significance and the weight given to it can vary. This peculiarity was evident in the interviews and translations. Meanings of terms are connected to cultures and contexts.

6.2.1 Protecting the Potentiality of the Vulnerable

Robert Chamber warns about the problem of the use of the term vulnerability as the common understanding of poverty. In his own words, "vulnerability is not the same as poverty. It means not lack or want, but defencelessness, insecurity, and exposure to risk, shocks and stress" (Chambers, 1989, p.1). In making this differentiation Chambers orient the concept out of the notion of "lack or want" as he puts it, but towards a different condition which aligns better with the root of the word which refers to the exposure to be wounded as well as the notion of exposure.

Martin Prowse highlights three tendencies present in the studies regarding the notion of vulnerability, as it was presented in the theoretical chapter 3. Some would approach it as susceptibility to poverty. The notion encompasses everyone, since all humans are susceptible to contingencies, in a low or high level. The other tendency relates to vulnerability as a symptom of poverty, and in this sense, there is a limit to vulnerability for the ones in the context of vulnerability. The third tendency relates vulnerability as one of the multiple dimensions of poverty which also gives a hint of limiting vulnerability to the spectrum of poverty; however, it is only a part of the whole (Prowse, 2003, p.6-8).

Judith Butler proposes a new approach to vulnerability. Her approach criticises the conventional conception of vulnerability as they are expounded above and in the theory chapter arguing that vulnerability is not in the spectrum of the exposure, weakness, lack of agency or inability to cope. Butler asserts that while elements of the precarity of the human life such as injustice, poverty and its consequences are a situational factor, the vulnerability is not situational, it is rather constituent of the human experience. On the other side, she spells out that while precarity refers to woundedness, precariousness refers to the vulnerability which is ontological; thus, it must be protected. Precariousness is then an aspect of what is apprehended in what is living, therefore a common condition of humans. In the philosopher own words, "indeed, there ought to be recognition of precariousness as a shared condition of human life", even further

“precariousness implies living socially, that is, the fact that one’s life is always in some sense in the hands of the other” (Butler, 2016, p.2,3,13-14). Vulnerability in this sense is an asset for life in society. Butler gives then a new meaning vis-à-vis the conventional significance above mentioned.

The ambiguity in the significance of vulnerability, is especially what makes the matter move forward. While there are elements to be eliminated, there are elements which are precious in the context of poverty and vulnerability. This notion relates to the view of the responders when they pointed out the potentiality of the poor who are assisted by their institution while the reason for the institution is to protect and potentialize the dreams and vocations of the poor communities where they are.

The tension in these definitions, perhaps is that it might give the perception of passivity of the vulnerable, in the case at stake, the poor populations. While in fact, the poor portion of the Brazilian society seems to be quite strong agents of the daily motion of the country throughout history. Despite the fact that they are treated as unprivileged and exploited, they are essential actors in the social fabric of the country. Even though the poor are unfairly often portrayed as a negative part of the society, they are *sine que non* for the country.

This matter is alluded by the Brazilian authors Walquiria Rego and Alessandro Pinzani, as it was presented in chapter two about the background in Brazil. “The poor in Brazil live continually under a strain: on the one hand, they are excluded and humiliated by part of an economical and legal system that undermine them; on the other hand, they receive the appeal to see themselves as part of this same system, on the other hand, they respect their rules, as well as social and legal norms” (Rego and Pinzani, 2014, p.39) (my translation)⁷². It is necessary to break this unfair undermining attitude towards the poor in Brazil. The poor are rather needed and dignified citizens of the country.

In this claim, I do not romanticise poverty and the circumstances of the poor. They suffer tremendously under the oppressiveness of society as a whole. Still, they are essential people for

⁷² “Os pobres no Brasil vivem continuamente em uma tensão: por um lado, são excluídos e humilhados por parte de um sistema econômico e legal que os prejudica; por outro, recebem o apelo a se considerarem parte do mesmo sistema e, assim, respeitarem suas regras e normas sociais e legais.”

the flourishing of the country. It is a blatant injustice towards the poor what continually happens in the economic and legal system with their ramifications in the tributary, labour and urban structures, to name a few. Part of the mistake is also to generalise the peoples in poverty as poor wretched, a lazy group when they are daily operative persons, in general, a hardworking portion of the society.

Participant G, for instance, does not hesitate to comment on the resilience of the *sertanejo*, in her own words: “They are not, as people say, that the Northeaster is lazy, they suffer in the land, he is friendly, he is a person that adjust himself to anything, and he works”. On the other hand, the *sertanejos* live from subsistence farming families and are, in the interior of the Northeast, the largest concentration of poverty in Brazil, consequently in Latin América as it is explained by Michael Reid. This author also denounces that among the causes of poverty in this region of Brazil are “landholding, frequent droughts, political corruption and backwardness, poor transport infrastructure and lack of education (Reid, 2014, p.165).

Participant D also mentioned the struggle that the addressees of CADI have to realise the resilience they are endowed with and the role of CADI is to serve them, be even a steppingstone, for them to grow and reach their latent potentiality for the benefit of themselves and their families too.

This potentiality of the poor is recognised by all the participants in their responses. It seems that the poor are endowed with a potential that must be acknowledged, protected and developed for them to flourish.

It is very interesting to see that if the poor are vulnerable, on the other hand, they are not unable to cope, nor victims of lack of agency and weakness. On the contrary, they are human lives constituted with resilience.

As I described in chapter 5, the interviewee Marcel spelt out in one of his responses that “we believe radically that the resources needed for overcoming the situation of poverty is in the own community. In this sense, we don’t expect great solutions, from great investors, that will solve all the problems of poverty. Our leaders are instructed to humbly find out what God has already placed in the community”

In chapter five, I described that Maurício Cunha and Beth Wood assert that:

Every community, regardless of how precarious it is, has several good things that God has already planted there: resources, people, talents, capacities, attitudes of solidarity, cooperation, openness for changes, vocation for work, hope etc. The wise development agent identifies these qualities and builds the work based on them, maximizing the potential of the people⁷³ (Cunha and Wood, 2019, p.121) (my translation).

They clarify that they learned this principle with the work of CADI throughout the years, and now one of the principles for the work of CADI is “starting with what they already have”. They argue that often social programmes tend to arrive at a certain community thinking they will bring everything that is needed; however, their experience has proved them this paradigm must be inverted. Even when the organisation has many resources, it must resist the temptation to bring everything ready and formatted to the community where they are located (Ibid.).

Recognising the potentiality of the poor communities is a way of protection, and show the strength present even in the context of social vulnerability.

The findings from the interviews suggest that most of the participants have somehow the notion of vulnerability related to the idea of exposure. They mentioned a range of different factors that usually happened in the communities they are present and how the people are exposed to those.

Participant F shared that the theme of vulnerability is related to the exposure to situations that compromise one’s own well-being. He also shared that “vulnerability is related to the idea that this will never happen to you”. He gave examples such as burglary, sexual violence, diseases. The question is that not only the poor are exposed to such eventualities but the society in general. However, in the context of Brazil, the poor communities are where the statistics of occurrences like those are the highest.

This claim by Participant F outstood among the answers. He addressed it as a psychological element in relation to reality. He explained that when a person has the mentality to think that one is invulnerable to any contingency, they show that they are vulnerable. He furthered

⁷³ “Toda comunidade, por mais precária que seja, tem muitas coisas boas que Deus já plantou ali: recursos, pessoas, talentos, capacidades, atitudes de solidariedade, cooperação, abertura para mudanças, vocação para o trabalho, esperança etc. O agente de desenvolvimento sábio identifica essas qualidades e edifica o trabalho baseado nelas, maximizando o potencial do povo.”

mentioning that “we all can at some point be victims of a rape, a burglary, a stray bullet, a harassment by a drug dealer etc”, concluding the no one is completely free of being affected by types of violence, even environment problems.

This notion overlays with the understanding of vulnerability as a human life constituent factor. The social experience of bodily being, as the humans are, put them all in the spectrum of vulnerability. In chapter 3, the contributions by Judith Butler demonstrates that the fact the people live in a social context implies that the bodies experiences happen in a social framework, in exposure to the other. In her own words, “one’s life is always in some sense in the hand of others. It implies exposure both to those we know and to those we don’t know; a dependency on people we know, or barely know, or know not at all” (Butler, 2016, p.13). Perhaps awareness of the other is a way to address the vulnerability. Since we are exposed to the other, in dependency and reciprocity in relationships, there is then, a great opportunity to responsiveness towards the other, acquainted or not. The space for solidarity depends on vulnerability.

6.2.2 Protection and Potentiality - Hearing the Voice of the Poor

The perception of poverty and development have been subject to an evolution which takes into serious consideration of the religious factor, as I explained in chapter 3. This flux is a process which came to the debates for several reasons. One of them is the fact that development endeavours took into consideration the voice of the people, and in this case, the voice of the poor.

The predictions of secularisation theory asserted that most societies would be modernised, they would become more and more secular. In this vein, religion would be regarded to the private, subjective sphere, and consequently fade away from the public sphere. However, several events in different places over the globe have been showing a different turn.

Deneulin and Bano raise the point that since development thinking emerges from the perspective of peoples, religion was considered as a factor in the development effort. Certainly, one the greatest improvement in the development thinking is the disposition to give voice to the poor populations and hear their own claims on the matter (Deneulin and Bano, 2009, p.52-53).

Experiences and aspirations of the poor populations came to the public discussion with the project *Voices of the poor*, as I explained in chapter 3. Hearing the voices of the poor peoples is a crucial factor in the effort to tackle poverty. Indeed, the poor provoked the debate, and helped to develop the notion of the reality of poverty in various dimensions. My claim here is that this event is also a sign of agency, thus potentiality. It has improved the development thinking

Perhaps a parallel can be made here. It seems that there are similarities between the way the poor people had been considered before by the development thinking when their perspectives were not brought to the dialogue and the way they are still undermined by the public policies in Brazil today, as it is denounced by Rego and Pinzani.

My point here is that for sustainable changes to happen in Brazil, it is necessary to change the mentality regarding the poor. Their voice must be heard, and their agency must be acknowledged and appreciated. The poor is more than mere subjects to social assistance policies; they are agents in society. More than receptors of service deliverance they are capable of progressing to the next stage in order to achieve sustainable development.

Vulnerability towards one another as a human social experience in community is a constituent of human life. Therefore, it cannot be eliminated. Responsiveness to the other, in good times as well as in suffering and plights, is, therefore, a virtue much needed for the human flourishing. The potentiality of the vulnerable is to be protected; after all, it is a resourceful frame for solidarity.

6.3 Faith-Based Organisation Typology

As the development thinking recognises that religion is a relevant factor not only in its discourse but in actual movements of the social development endeavour, the theories regarding the nature of FBOs emerge in the debates.

CADI introduces itself as a coalition of Christian organisations and bases their principles and actions on a Christian confessionality. As it states in their presentation “we understand that

social development is part of the full purposes of God in his redemptive action”⁷⁴ (my translation). Therefore, CADI is clearly an FBO.

Having said so, I aim to place CADI within the typologies given by Gerald Clarke, which were presented in chapter 3. The first typology put forward by Clarke focuses on the organisational aspect of the FBO, their scope, context and the impact they provide.

According to this typology, CADI can be classified as a “Faith-based charitable or development organizations which mobilize the faithful in support of the poor and other social groups, and which fund or manage programmes which tackle poverty and social exclusion” (Clarke, 2008, p.25).

The second typology presented by Clarke classifies FBOs concerns more than just the service delivering. It focuses on the way FBOs deploy their respective “faith through social or political engagement or link faith to developmental or humanitarian objectives” (Clarke, 2008, p.32). The focus here is directly in the application of the faith in the public sphere, in this vein, social development. The types outlined are Passive, Active, Persuasive, and, Exclusive.

In light of this typology, CADI can be classified as an Active FBO. In this category:

Faith provides an important and explicit motivation for action and in mobilizing staff and supporters. It plays a significant role in identifying, helping or working with beneficiaries and partners, although there is no overt discrimination against non-believers and the organization supports multi-faith cooperation. (Clarke, 2008, p.32).

It seems from the responders’ perspective that faith is the main motivation for CADI to be engaged in the development effort in Brazil. CADI also has strong relations with churches in general and is known in the protestant milieu in Brazil. When it comes to identifying beneficiaries, CADI bylaws state the non-discrimination on basis of religion. The view of the responders also underlines more or less the importance this non-discrimination rule too. With regards to establishing partnerships, CADI is quite open to the public administration, public

⁷⁴ Enquanto Coalizão temos uma confessionalidade cristã e entendemos que o desenvolvimento social é parte dos plenos desígnios de Deus em sua ação redentora.

councils of rights and administration, and the Network of Protection policies. CADI is also open to cobelligence with religious or non-religious entities in the developmental endeavours and fights for rights.

6.4 Public Theology

At this stage, I aim to put forward discussion about research question: Which role can a Public Theology play for interpreting these concepts?

As described in previous chapters, CADI does not hesitate to employ the Christian faith tenets in their way to motivate, apprehend, manage and run their programmes. It seems that they understand that faith has to do with the public movements in society and the ways they operate in social development.

Both leaders Marcel and Maurício express their understanding of poverty as a consequence of sin, and the social development to tackle poverty and its repercussion as part of God's redemptive actions. The language is religious and theological, as explained in chapter 2. I would argue that the motivation and the hope for the development work are related to the redemption that God will fulfil; therefore, they see their action under the auspice of this eagerness. The notion that development work is part of it now, but the redemption is yet to come. This notion seems to connect with the proposal put forward by Rudolf von Sinner concerning the ambiguities of the reality of the human experience in life. He abstracts this idea from Martin Luther's expression *simul justi et peccatores* which is explained in the theory chapter. This theological statement could be applied for the complexities of the society today. At the same time that there are hope and motives for development work, the complexities of the society must raise the awareness of the reality in the development work (Sinner, 2019, p.182). Von Sinner asserts that "for Christians, there is always the mistrust before human beings, as much of ourselves as of others, given our awareness of the power of sin. Knowing this, but not falling into despair because of our trust in God, we are able to endure ambiguity, a lack of clarity (...) this is why we are able to persevere" (Ibid.). Development effort must not be triumphalist nor hopeless or pessimist; but rather hopefully aware of the reality of the human experience of poor populations which is in the context of injustices, poverty, as well as vulnerability and potentiality to be protected.

Kjetil Fretheim argues that there is “qualitative distinction between God’s salvation and all human efforts”. I would claim that humans cannot redeem the society; however, they can be part of God’s purpose for redemption. Redemption is a work of God, achieved in Jesus Christ, provided as a gift to humans. “God’s redemption is a gift, pure and simple” (Fretheim, 2016, p.53). In this vein, the participation in the redemptive motion must be conscious of the total dependency of God, thus religious and theological.

If redemption is an exclusive work of God, perhaps a better term to be applied in the social development context is to reform a community, reform a society, instead of redeeming. While redemption gives an idea of a permanent fulfilment, reform connotes to improvements, but conscious of the constant need of improving, thus the ambiguity applies to development work.

David Tracy relates these arguments asserting that “the Christian focus on the event of Jesus Christ discloses the always-already, not-yet reality of grace”. This notion of “always-already, not-yet reality of grace” (Tracy, 1981, p.446) is also a reminder towards realism of the sinful reality which produces poverty as argued by the responders Marcel Camargo and Maurício Cunha.

I would argue that these voices of public theology relate to the responses of the informants help the social development agent, and social development organisations to be realistic. They help towards avoiding an attitude of apathy and indifference towards the social engagement and presence, and at the same time having a realistic approach to the action in the civil society, in the public sphere with responsiveness and solidarity to the other without any triumphalism.

When it comes to the matter of the theological basis for Christian engagement on social development, Séverine Deneulin presents some basic theological arguments which more or less can be related to the understanding of the findings and the voices of the public theologian above mentioned.

Her first argument is the notion that human dignity is related to the material and spiritual dimensions of life which are inseparable (Deneulin, 2013, p.52). This conception is also connected with the outcome from hearing the voice of the poor; they brought to the debate the spiritual dimension of social development and poverty tackling. This holistic approach, more

or less, appears in all the responders' comments as well as the evolution of the development thinking debate as presented in the theory chapter.

The second notion brings about that humans are conceived to live in communion with God and with each other, "therefore human dignity is inseparable from solidarity and concern for the good of all" (Ibid.). It seems that this notion has relations to the communitarian reality of the Trinity as a "communion of three persons, the Father, Son and Holy Spirit" (Ibid.). The analogy can be abstracted to the human experience as a body social experience. We are vulnerable to each other, and that is the condition of possibility for love, solidarity and even social development. The sense of community and friendship can be apprehended from the answers, mainly from the beneficiaries, staff workers and local leaders.

The third feature that Deneulin argues reads: "Human actions are marked by sin, there the struggles for justice and human dignity are inseparable from conversion to God" (Ibid.). It seems that conversion to God, which is very rooted in the narrative of the gospel for Christians, is a constituent part of the struggle of justice and human dignity. This claim can be overlaid with the understanding of Marcel and Maurício as shown with their own words in the findings. Marcel expressed that "it is the gospel that finds out this potential associated to the communities and it is this very mainstay of this story that we want to operate our methodology of development". Maurício in his words: "the gospel is the power that comes from above to the transformation of individual, community and nations". The gospel refers to the news of display and accomplishment of the plans of God in Jesus Christ. It is notorious the way the responders expressed the flux of poverty as a consequence of sin, therefore the work of development tackling poverty must give an answer. Maurício words expressed his audacious belief that the gospel is a gift from above that can transform not only individuals but expand into larger circles as communities and even nations.

The dynamic from the individual to community to nations is certainly a picture of progression often present in the Christian discourse. It also relates to what Fretheim asserts on the theme of the dimension of civil society and the public sphere as mentioned in the theoretical chapter, "local processes affect the global level, and global processes affect the local level". Those interactions are dynamic and "*glocal*" (Fretheim, 2016, p.22). It seems that the national leader Maurício Cunha understand the potential for a progression in the local processes of

development that can impact further than the community where CADI is present, from the individual transformation to society levels.

6.5 Summary

This chapter has discussed the views from the participants of the interviews in chapter 5 in the interaction with the theoretical framework of this thesis, together with information from the background chapters. The argumentation emerged from the connections between the themes and within the scope of the research questions.

The discussion has been focused around the four main themes of poverty, vulnerability, protection and potentiality, as well as the instance of CADI as a FBO and how a public theology can be useful for the interpretation of the main themes and the mission of CADI as a FBO engaged with the social development effort. As the next chapter unfolds, I will make a general conclusion for this thesis.

7. Conclusion

This thesis has examined the relationship between the themes of poverty, vulnerability, protection, and potentiality in the framework of the work of CADI in Brazil. As CADI is a Christian FBO, the Christian faith is a key element motivator of their work, therefore voices from public theology were heard in order to correlate with the incidence of faith in the civil society. This was done by analysis and discussion of the data obtained with the sharing of the experience from the participants of the interviews. I examined their contributions in the light of the theoretical approach in the attempt to answers the following research questions:

1. How are the concepts of poverty, vulnerability, protection, and potentiality understood by the participants of CADI, at different levels?
2. How does CADI exemplify the role of faith-based organisations in social development in present day Brazil?
3. Which role can a Public Theology play for interpreting these concepts?

7.1 Main Conclusions

Concerning poverty, most of the responders understand poverty more or less in terms of low income. Nevertheless, all the participants repeatedly brought forward notions of different aspects of poverty. Dimensions such as lack of access to health services, education, security or violence were found in the answers of all participants. A specific interest has been laid on the concerns for health, education and security. These are hot topics in the public debate in Brazil. They are often used as a tool in the political discourses too since they catch the attention of the wider society in general.

An important part of their understanding of violence was the examples of domestic violence. Gender based abuses, domestic theft and bad parenting were identified by the responders as recurrent ways of domestic violence. On the other hand, there is also violence outside the home. Performed by the criminal organisations which are known in Brazil as commands, these organisations function as militias that control the illegal narcotic trade. Since they are rivalling confrontations among themselves or with the police are quite violent, often resulting in

casualties. Violence is also caused by the own society they are in. The women emphasised the problem of the violence outside perpetrated by individuals or gangs in the neighbourhood. The need for protection is therefore eminent, in the domestic and external level.

Emotional poverty is also understood as a dimension. One of the responders relates bad parenting towards the child as a cause of emotional poverty. Spiritual poverty came about in a few answers too.

The national leaders pressed on the theological perception of poverty as a consequence of the fall and sin, therefore they related the solution for poverty in the answer that the gospel provides for a fallen world. A specific interest has been laid on the agency in social development as participating in the acts of redemption that are done by God. Therefore, the church is seen as an agent of transformation. Fall, sin, and redemption are recurrent themes of Christian theology applied in the leaders' interpretation of the work of CADI.

It seems that the concept of multidimensional poverty is present in the mentality of the participants as they related poverty to aspects such as low income, health, education, violence, even emotional and spiritual dimensions.

When it comes to vulnerability, all the participants understand it as exposure to risks either in domestic environment or in the wider society. The lack of awareness of the risks in the social context one might face was presented as vulnerability too. The term vulnerability is often present in the language of the public institutions such as the Ministry of Citizenship, as well as the Institute for Applied Economic Research in reference to of exposure to social risks.

Most of the respondents did not mention vulnerability as a constituent part of the human experience, even though the majority seems to have some notion that everyone is vulnerable. They are challenged by the theory that points out to this direction of vulnerability as constituent element of the human experience. Under the experience of vulnerability, it is possible to engage to the neighbour in a way that is often proposed in the Biblical narrative. Vulnerability catalyses solidarity and communal responsiveness.

The study finds that the poor in Brazil are a persistent example of resilience. The respondents made explicit the potentiality of the poor. This finding can relate to the idea by Rego and Pinzani (2014, p.39) presented in chapter two, they argue that the poor are often under a systemic

tension in Brazil. The poor are excluded and humiliated by the legal and economic system that undermine them, on the other hand they are drawn to be part of this same system which does not operate without the poor as contributors of the society.

Findings suggest the idea of protection related to two stages in face of risks and harms. The first stage regards the prevention to avoid situations, while the other stage sees protection as restoring after occurrences. The responders also highlight the importance of cooperating with the Network of Protection, which is a broader public instrument that gather public and private institutions for the benefit of the ones exposed to social risks. An organisation such is CADI is not allowed to operate outside this policy regulated by the Social Assistance Policy.

The analyses of the findings suggest the understanding of poverty refers to a wider framework or an objective factor, and at the same time it also refers to a consequence of sin, implying a personal factor too.

The potentiality of the poor is evident on the fact that, their voices were and are an instrument of constant transformation for the development theory, their agency contributed for a holistic approach shift therein. There is no condition of possibility for development without their agency and participation. This is precious and indispensable to tackle poverty in a sustainable way.

I would argue that there are such potential and strength with the poor. Poverty cannot be romanticised at all; it is a harmful phenomenon. However, I would assert, there are great values witnessed among the poor, which must be appreciated, even more by themselves. It seems that it is implied that the poor populations where CADI works are entitled to develop dreams and vocations, therefore implying potentiality and agency. The manner CADI works them out are grounded on protection.

The findings from Maurício Cunha's books underline this notion that the poor are resourceful and the FBO must have this approach to deal with them in a high stem of their potentiality to be flourished. This potentiality can grow from individual to communities and nations. It seems that this expansion movement has to do with the Christian notion of growth. In this same vein, findings underline that God made his ways to dwell in the earth in a poor context.

While the prospect of CADI points out to its influence as a religious agent the public sphere, public theology must serve as a referential to any faith-agency in society. The temptation to

have a triumphalist discourse, triumphalist attitude or paternalism on social transformation is always present. Public theology serves to provide a realistic awareness. The present reality puts everyone as vulnerable to each other, this is not optional but conditional, thus beyond the bound of possibility to be eliminated.

The people in eminent need must be aided as soon as possible, not neglected in their needs. This requests identification only possible when the one who offers assistance sees oneself as vulnerable too, identification with the other which is akin. The ambiguities of public theology, as it is pointed out in the theory chapter, serve very much to prompt organisations and individuals, against attitudes of triumphalism, despair or passivity in the development effort in Brazil. There is no magic formula to fix the problems regarding poverty in Brazil. Populists have been offering rescues for the poor they cannot deliver. On the other hand, the poor must not be abandoned, on the contrary, the need for action is urgent, this tension is also ambiguous. By drawing on a variety of critical, self-critical and constructive perspectives from the Christian faith. I believe public theology can be a crucial force in this endeavour.

As a FBO, CADI explicitly poses their Christian motives and tenets in the way they run their work in the civil society. CADI is an example of a practical expression of public theology in their actions, inventions, public material and social media discourses present in the public sphere in Brazil. In this capacity they partake in the processes of protecting the potentiality of the vulnerable in the context of poverty.

7.2 Suggestion for Further Research

Often researches raise new questions on the themes expounded. The shortage of available resources on FBO in Brazil is notorious. Since the influence of religion in the public sphere is evident in the country, there is room and need for a public theology addressing the themes of poverty, vulnerability and the role of FBOs from a Brazilian perspective and background aiming advancements in the civil society. Resources on public theology have been growing in Brazilian context in the last years, it seems, however, that there is room for more recognition and exposition into the wider public.

References

- Bailey, J. P. (2010). *Rethinking Poverty – Income, Assets and Catholic Social Justice Tradition*. Indiana: University of Notre Dame Press.
- Banik, D. (2006). *Poverty, Politics and Development*. Bergen: Fagbokforlaget.
- Bryman, A. (2012). *Social Research Methods*. (4th ed.). Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Butler, J. (2016): *Frames of war – when life is grievable?* London and New York: Verso.
- Cavalcanti, R. (2011): A Teologia da Missão da Igreja no Brasil. In Padilla, C. R. & Couto, P. (Eds.), *Igreja Agente de Transformação* (p. 19 – 39). Curitiba: Missão Aliança.
- Chambers, R. (1989). Editorial Introduction: Vulnerability, coping and policy. *Institute of Development Studies Bulletin, Vol. 20*(2), pp. 1–7.
- Chaplin, J. (2008). Civil Society and the State. In J. H. Schinder (Ed.), *Christianity and Civil Society: Catholic and Neo-Calvinist Perspectives* (p. 67 – 96). Lanham MD: Lexington Books.
- Coleman, J. A. (2008). A Limited State and a Vibrant Society. In J. A. Coleman & S. J. (Eds.), *Christian Political Ethics* (p. 22 – 53). Princeton NJ: Princeton University Press.
- Clarke, M. (2013). Understanding the Nexus Between Religion and Development. In Clarke, M. (Ed.), *Handbook of Research on Development and Religion*. Cheltenham: Edward Elgar Publishing Limited.
- Clarke, G., & Jennings, M. (2008). Introduction. In Clarke, G., & Jennings, M.(Eds.). *Development, Civil Society and Faith-Based Organizations – Bridging the Sacred and the Secular* (p. 1 – 17). New York: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Clarke, G. (2008). Faith-Based Organizations and International Development: An Overview. In Clarke, G., & Jennings, M.(Eds.), *Development, Civil Society and Faith-Based Organizations – Bridging the Sacred and the Secular*. New York: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Concise Oxford English Dictionary* (12th ed.). (2011). Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Cunha, M. (2018). *O Reino de Deus e a transformação social: fundamentos, princípios e ferramentas*. Viçosa: Ultimato.
- Cunha, M., & Wood, B. (2019). *O Reino entre nós: transformação de comunidades pelo evangelho integral* (3rd ed.). Viçosa: Ultimato.
- Deneulin, S. (2013). Christianity and international development. In Clarke, M. (Ed), *Handbook of Research on Development and Religion* (p. 51 – 65). Cheltenham: Edward Elgar Publishing.

- Deneulin, S., & Bano, M. (2009). *Religion in Development: Rewriting the Secular Script*. London: Zeb Books Ltd.
- Deneulin, S., & Rakodi, C. (2011). Revisiting Religion: Development Studies Thirty years on. *World Development*, Vol. 39 (1), pp. 45 – 54.
- Freston, P. (2008). Introduction: The Many Faces of Evangelical Politics in Latin America. In Freston, P. *Evangelical Christianity and Democracy in Latin America* (p. 3 – 36). New York: Oxford University Press.
- Fretheim, K. (2016): *Interruption and Imaginations: Public Theology in times of crisis*. Eugene OR: Pickwick Publications.
- González, O. E., & González, J. L. (2008): *Christianity in Latin America: A History*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Habermas, J. (1996): *Between facts and norms: contributions to a discourse theory of law and democracy*. New Baskerville: MIT Press.
- Habermas, J. (2006). Religion in the Public Sphere, in Habermas, J., *Between Naturalism and Religion*. Cambridge: Polity Press.
- Have, H. t. (2014). *The principle of vulnerability in the UNESCO Declaration of Bioethics and Human Rights*. In Tham, J., Garcia, A., Miranda, G. (Eds.), *Religious Perspectives on Human Vulnerability in Bioethics* (p. 15 – 28). London: Springer.
- Haynes, J. (2007). *Religion and Development – Conflict or Cooperation?*. New York: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Hefferan, T., Adkins, J., & Occhipinti, L. (2009). Faith-Based Organizations, Neoliberalism, and Development: An Introduction. In Hefferan, T., Adkins, J., & Occhipinti, L. (Eds.). *Bridging the gaps – Faith-Based Organizations, Neoliberalism, and Development in Latin America and the Caribbean* (p. 1 – 34). Lanham: Lexington Books.
- Hopper, P. (2012). *Understanding Development*. Cambridge: Polity Press.
- Jolliffe, D., & Lugo, M. A. (2018). *Poverty and Shared Prosperity - Piecing together the poverty puzzle*. (Report 2018). Retrieved from <http://www.worldbank.org/en/publication/poverty-and-shared-prosperity>
- Luther, M. (1972): *Luther's Works, Lectures on Romans* (volume 25). Saint Louis: Concordia Publishing House.
- Moltmann, J. (1999): *God for a secular society: The Public Relevance of Theology*. London: SCM.

- Myers, B. L. (2011). *Walking with the poor: principles and practices of transformational development*. Maryknoll: Orbis books.
- Narayan, D., Patel, R., Schafft, K., Rademacher, A., & Korch-Schulte, S. (2000). *Voices of the Poor: Can anyone hear us? (English)*. New York: Oxford University Press for the World Bank. Retrieved from <http://documents.worldbank.org/curated/en/131441468779067441/Voices-of-the-poor-can-anyone-hear-us>
- Norris, P., & Inglehard, R. (2011): *Sacred and Secular: Religion and Politics Worldwide*. (2nd. Ed.). New York: Cambridge University Press.
- Payne, A., & Phillips, N. (2010). *Development*. Cambridge: Polity Press.
- Prowse, M. (2003). Towards a clearer understanding of ‘vulnerability’ in relation to chronic poverty. Chronic Poverty Research Centre, University of Manchester.
- Rego, W. L., & Pinzani, A. (2014). *Vozes do Bolsa Família: autonomia, dinheiro e cidadania*. (2nd ed.). São Paulo: Editora UNESP.
- Reid, M. (2014). *Brazil The Troubled Rise of a Global Power*. New Haven and London: Yale University Press.
- Schindler, J. H. (2008). Resources for a New Public Philosophy. In J. H. Schindler (Ed.), *Christianity and Civil Society: Catholic and Neo-Calvinist Perspectives* (p. 67 – 96). Lanham MD: Lexington Books.
- Schultz, A. (2000). Estrutura Teológica do Imaginário Brasileiro. In Bobsin O. [et. al] (Ed.), *Uma religião chamada Brasil* (p. 27 – 60). São Leopoldo: Oikos.
- Schweiker, W. (2000). Responsibility in the World of Mammon. In Stackhouse, M. L. & Paris, P. J. (Eds.), *God and Globalization: Religion and the Powers of the Common Life* (Vol. 1, p. 105 – 139). Harrisburg: Trinity Press International.
- Sen, A. (1999). *Development as Freedom*. Oxford University Press.
- Sinner, R. v. (2011). Teologia Pública: um Olhar Global. In Cavalcante, Ronaldo., and Sinner, R. v: *Teologia Pública em Debate*. São Leopoldo: Sinodal/EST.
- Sinner, R. v. (2019). The Diaconal Church in the Public Sphere. In Dietrich, S., Jørgensen, K., Korslien, K. K., & K. Nordstokke. (Eds). *The Diaconal Church*. Oxford: Regnum Book International.
- Smith, A. (1990). *An inquiry into the Nature and Causes of the Wealth of Nations* (2nd ed.). Chicago: Encyclopaedia Britannica, Inc.
- Stackhouse, M. L. (1991): *Public Theology and Political Economy: Christian Stewardship in Moder Society*. Lanham MD: University Press of America.

Stackhouse, M. L. (2007): *God and Globalization: Religion and the Powers of the Common Life* (Vol. 4). New York: The continuum International Publishing Group.

Stalker, P., and Ross-Larson, B. (1997). *Human Development Report*. United Nations Development Programme. New York: Oxford University Press.

Stålsett, S. J. (2018) Prayers of the Precariat? The Political Role of Religion in Precarious times. *Revista Estudos Teológicos*. Retrieved from http://periodicos.est.edu.br/index.php/estudos_teologicos/article/view/3439/pdf

Thacker, J. (2017). *Global Poverty – A Theological Guide*. London: SCM Press.

Tracy, D. (1981): *The Analogical Imagination: Christian Theology and the Culture of Pluralism*. London: SCM Press.

Volf, M., & McAnnally-Linz, R. (2016). *Public Faith in Action – How to Think Carefully, Engage Wisely, and Vote with Integrity*. Grand Rapids: Brazos Press.

Wolterstorff, N. (2008). *Justice: rights and wrongs*. New Jersey: Princeton University Press.

Internet Sources

Azevedo, J. (24.01.2010). *Negros do Mundo*. Retrieved from <https://www.ufjf.br/ladem/2010/01/24/negros-do-mundo/>

Barbosa, A. d. F. (2012). *The Real Brazil: The Reality Behind the Statistics*. Christian Aid. Retrieved from <https://www.christianaid.org.uk/sites/default/files/2017-08/the-real-brazil-may-2012.pdf>

CADI. (retrieved on 05.09.2019). *Quem Somos*. Retrieved from <https://cadi.org.br/quem-somos/>

Claves Brasil. (retrieved on 29.10.2019). *Claves Brasil*. Retrieved from <http://www.clavesbrasil.org/claves-brasil/>

Federal Constitution of Brazil. (1988). *Constituição da República Federativa do Brasil de 1988*. Retrieved from http://www.planalto.gov.br/ccivil_03/Constituicao/Constituicao.htm

Federal Government of Brazil - Ministry of Citizenship. (Retrieved on 29.10.2019). Retrieved from <http://cidadania.gov.br>

Harvard Divinity School. (Retrieved on 27.11.2019). *The Catholic Church in Brazil*. Retrieved from <https://rlp.hds.harvard.edu/faq/catholic-church-brazil>

IBGE. (29.06.2012). *Censo 2010: número de católicos cai e aumenta o de evangélicos, espíritas e sem religião*. Retrieved from <https://agenciadenoticias.ibge.gov.br/agencia-sala-de->

imprensa/2013-agencia-de-noticias/releases/14244-asi-censo-2010-numero-de-catolicos-cai-e-aumenta-o-de-evangelicos-espiritas-e-sem-religiao

IPEA. (Retrieved on 26.10.2019). Atlas da Vulnerabilidade Social. Retrieved from <http://ivs.ipea.gov.br/index.php/pt/>

IPEA. (Retrieved on 26.10.2019). Início. Retrieved from <http://www.ipea.gov.br/portal/>

Libreria Editrice Vaticana. (Retrieved on 25.11.2019). Catechism of the Catholic Church. Retrieved from http://www.vatican.va/archive/ENG0015/___P6G.HTM

Ministério do Desenvolvimento Social e Combate à Fome (Retrieved on 29.10.2019). LOAS Anotada: Lei Orgânica de Assistência Social. https://www.mds.gov.br/webarquivos/publicacao/assistencia_social/Normativas/LoasAnotada.pdf

Ministério do Desenvolvimento Social e Combate à Fome Secretaria Nacional de Assistência Social. (2005). Política Nacional de Assistência Social PNAS/2004. Retrieved from http://www.mds.gov.br/webarquivos/publicacao/assistencia_social/Normativas/PNAS2004.pdf

Nery, C. (06.11.2019) Extreme poverty affects 13.5 million persons and hits highest level in seven years. <https://agenciadenoticias.ibge.gov.br/en/agencia-news/2184-news-agency/news/25895-extreme-poverty-affects-13-5-million-persons-and-hits-highest-level-in-seven-years>

Oxford Poverty & Human Development Initiative. (Retrieved on 30.08.2019). About. Retrieved from <https://ophi.org.uk/about/>

Oxford Poverty & Human Development Initiative. (Retrieved on 30.08.2019). Policy - A Multidimensional Approach. Retrieved from <https://ophi.org.uk/policy/multidimensional-poverty-index/>

Secretaria Especial do Desenvolvimento Social. (Retrieved on 02.10.2019). Bolsa Família - O que é. Retrieved from <http://mds.gov.br/assuntos/bolsa-familia/o-que-e>

Pew Research Center. (18.07.2013). Brazil's Changing Religious Landscape. Retrieved from <https://www.pewforum.org/2013/07/18/brazils-changing-religious-landscape/> retrieved on 27.11.2019.

Secretaria Especial do Desenvolvimento Social. (22.06.2015). Centro de Referência de Assistência Social - CRAS. Retrieved from <http://mds.gov.br/assuntos/assistencia-social/unidades-de-atendimento/cras>

Tael, I. (18.11.2019). CADI Brasil Esta Entre as 100 Melhores ONGs do Brasil pelo Instituto Doar <https://cadi.org.br/cadi-brasil-esta-entre-as-100-melhores-ongs-do-brasil-pelo-instituto-doar/>

Türk, V., Riera, J., & Poirier M.- C. (2014). Partnership Note: On Faith-Based Organizations, Local Faith Communities and Faith Leaders. Geneva: UNHCR. Retrieved from <https://www.unhcr.org/en-au/539ef28b9.pdf>

UN. (Retrieved on 25.11.2019). Civil Society. Retrieved from <https://www.un.org/en/sections/resources-different-audiences/civil-society/>

UNDP. (2019). Human Development Report 2019. Retrieved from <http://hdr.undp.org/sites/default/files/hdr2019.pdf>

UN Sustainable Development Goals. (Retrieved on 10.12.2019). About the Sustainable Development Goals. Retrieved from <https://www.un.org/sustainabledevelopment/sustainable-development-goals/>

UN Sustainable Development Goals. (Retrieved on 06.09.2019). Goal 1: End poverty in all its forms everywhere. Retrieved from <https://www.un.org/sustainabledevelopment/poverty/>

World Bank. (02.10.2019). Poverty. Retrieved from <https://www.worldbank.org/en/topic/poverty/overview>

World Bank. (14.10.2019) The World Bank In Brazil: Overview. Retrieved from <https://www.worldbank.org/en/country/brazil/overview>

World Development Indicators database. (2019). Gross domestic product 2018. World Bank. Retrieved from <https://databank.worldbank.org/data/download/GDP.pdf>

Appendix A: Interview Guide

INTERVIEW GUIDE

During the interview I will use questions like these:

1. How did you get to know the work of CADI?
2. How are you involved with CADI? Can you share experiences, stories, examples.
3. How long have you been participating with CADI?
4. Can you tell about your motivation to participate with CADI?
5. What does the work of CADI mean to you?
6. How does/did CADI help to improve your life or your community?
7. How do you understand the concepts poverty, vulnerability, protection and potentiality?
8. How does CADI inform about religion in their work?
9. Are you member in religious organisation like church, mosque..., if so, how often do you attend the gatherings? How long have you been participating?
10. Can you share about CADI's religious tenets?
11. Do you want to add any comment, questions on what we have been talking about or do you want to add something else?

Appendix B: Interview Quotations in Original Portuguese

ⁱ Tem a pobreza sim. Pobreza que eu te falo é a pobreza assim de saúde, tem muita gente que é pobre de espírito, vou te falar a verdade, têm muitos né. Têm também drogas, pobreza da droga também ... problema muito sério.

ⁱⁱ Não tem um posto 24 horas aqui né, que precisava muito pra esse lado aqui. Tem, mas é lá pro outro lado de lá

ⁱⁱⁱ A gente tem a questão da pobreza que é a falta de recursos mesmo, falta de dinheiro, falta de comida. A gente tem isso, muitas crianças atendidas pelo CADI, realmente precisam de apoio na questão de cesta básica ... têm casos que a gente precisa dar. E a gente encaminha pro CRAS, pra através da Assistência Social a família seja ajudada nisso.

Mas existe também a pobreza da criança que tem tudo, tem carro né, chega de carrão, mas não tem pai, e não tem mãe presente, as vezes com os dois dentro de casa. Então a criança é depressiva, a criança é triste que chega aqui no CADI primeiro nem olha pra cara da gente né, não fala com a gente ... Não é a falta de dinheiro que vai dizer que, se ela é feliz ou não, se ela é vulnerável ou não, pra mim existe tipos de vulnerabilidade, tipos de pobreza. Às vezes tem tudo, mas a alma é pobre.

Pra mim têm dimensões diferentes. Não posso dizer por que mora numa casa pequena, numa casa humilde que é pobre. Às vezes é muito mais rico do que eu, muito mais rico em alegria.

^{iv} Eu entendo pobreza como essa falta de alguma coisa, falta de alimentação, falta de moradia, de encontrar as necessidades básicas dela. Eu vejo que pobreza se encontrar em todas as áreas da vida da pessoas, eu acho que tem muito, entre aspas, rico que é pobre no seu espírito, na sua alma, no seu conviver com outras pessoas, sabe, então pra mim o conceito de pobreza é um pouco mais amplo do que a falta física.

A gente encontra aqui muitas pessoas que são pobres aqui na sua vida integral, sabe, fisicamente, das necessidades materiais, mas também seu espírito. Pessoas que chegam aqui completamente destruídas e a gente consegue, a partir dos grupos, a partir das respostas que têm na bíblia, mostrar pra ela que ela pode se reerguer né.

^v Hoje o CADI atende a maior parte das crianças, assim, em vulnerabilidade, assim, é, financeira, e não só financeira quando a gente fala da pobreza, mas é pobreza no geral. Em várias dimensões porque tem criança que no caso, nem valor à vida dela ela dá mesmo. Então isso é uma pobreza de eu acredito até, de ensinamento de certa parte, mas ela não dá valor à vida dela. Quer dizer que muitas coisas não foram atribuídas à vivência que ela já teve. Então, tanto a área espiritual quanto a financeira tem a sua influência, mas às vezes as crianças acabam se tornando pobres espiritualmente, financeiramente, ou até emocionalmente devido ao que ela tem sofrido ou à ausência de alguma coisa na vida dela ..., mas quando se fala desse conjunto assim.

^{vi} Quando eu comecei a trabalhar com as crianças da igreja. Meu olhar sempre foi praquela que era o mais desprotegido, mais vulnerável, aquele que no meu entender precisava de um maior cuidado. Quando comecei a trabalhar com as crianças na comunidade, ainda com a igreja, eu olhava o contexto da família que tinha, pobre, mas uma família estruturada. E eu olhava tantas crianças que eram pobres como eu, mas não tinha estrutura familiar ... num contexto vulnerável, dentro dum contexto de drogas.

Agora eu olhava praquela que fica bem à margem, aquela que ninguém olhava. Crianças de rua, você sabe, aquelas crianças invisíveis, crianças que ninguém quer ver. Então essas crianças eu passei a enxergar. A questão do pobre não é da pobreza financeira, é da pobreza na questão da vulnerabilidade. Pobre na questão de que requer cuidado, requer um olhar, requer uma atenção.

^{vii} A gente atua ali no Complex da Maré, no Morro do Timbau, umas das 17 comunidades do Complexo da Maré. São 17 comunidades em torno de 150 mil habitantes. Só o Morro do Timbau, ele tem em torno de 7 mil e 500 habitantes.

...a gente hoje vive num contexto onde temos 17 comunidades, sendo que num determinado ponto tem uma divisão de comandos. Daqui pra cá e Comando Vermelho, e daqui pra cá onde abrange a nossa comunidade é Terceiro Comando. A gente tem violência por conta dessa Guerra de facções que ao longo dos anos ela vai mudando, às vezes eles ocupam determinada comunidade, aí tem aquela briga, a briga pelo território. Muito violenta, por exemplo quando você vai nessa divisa entre essas duas comunidades, as casas que têm ali, já viu um queijo suíço? Elas são todas, a casa, é toda furada de bala, são armamentos pesados né, fuzis. As comunidades, a parte do Morro do Timbau que fica do lado de cá, aqui tem a comunidade onde tem a divisa com essa, aqui fica o morro. O tiro dessa comunidade rival que joga pra essa vai lá em cima nas casas do morro.

^{viii} Nós podemos refletir pobreza em suas diversas dimensões. Mas num conceito mais técnico é estar desprovida de condições mínimas de qualidade de vida. Então pobreza está ligada não só a questão econômica, como também à cultura, como também na formação da educação, como também à saúde, e, em suas diversas formas que ela se manifesta. Mesmo que a criança tenha terminado seus estudos de ensino fundamental, mas se ela não tiver acesso a outros bens que possam colocar nela a proteção, a segurança, a qualidade de vida, ela está sujeita à pobreza. A pobreza econômica, claro, é uma das mais graves, por tirar da criança ou do adolescente as condições de alimento, de saúde, de educação e de viver uma vida de qualidade.

^{ix} A realidade da pobreza, ah, ele, o sertanejo não é pobre como o paulista, o carioca, como o mineiro. Essa é uma parte de pobreza, diferente de São Paulo, em São Paulo, o pessoal vai morar na rua.

Ele tem a terra dele, mesmo que não chove, ele tem auxílio do bolsa família, ele tem vários auxílios que o governo deu. Mas a principal renda no sertão, só pra te dizer assim o que eu vejo que é pobreza, é a aposentadoria dos idosos. Uma fonte de renda muito grande.

A única fonte de renda que não acaba são os velhos, é os idosos, que não morreram. Mas, como é uma família muito unida, os idosos, eles sempre ajudam seus filhos, mesmo que, ou vão morar perto no mesmo terreno ou vão morar do lado, então é uma ajuda além do bolsa família, e todos eles plantam. Ele não tem, falam que o nordestino é preguiçoso. Ele sofre na terra, ele é acolhedor, ele é uma pessoa assim que se adapta a qualquer coisa, ele trabalha.

Mas ele não tem as coisas ... não tem mais distribuição de remédio, antigamente tinha. A saúde é um problema.

^x A pobreza lá é na área da saúde, educação que é muito ruim. A parte de segurança é uma pobreza, eu vejo isso também. Segurança é muito difícil porque o PCC se escondeu em Aratuba (...). Eles expulsaram as pessoas de casas, a prefeita não pode fazer nada. Ela pediu oração. Muita gente já morreu se não sai de casa. Tão começando a dominar, se escondendo lá. O pobre sofre porque ele é roubado. O pobre, pobrezinho, amarraram a velhinha, o velhinho, roubaram o dinheiro deles que fica na gaveta, e rouba a televisão e as coisas. É uma coisa que vejo assim, que eu vejo como pobreza também, falta de segurança.

^{xi} ...tem uma pobreza que mesmo que tenha o Bolsa Família, gasta dinheiro errado, ganha roupa joga fora, num lava porque tem preguiça, que eu creio que é a subnutrição que faz efeito, eu não acho que seja só caráter, pouco caso é caráter, a subnutrição dá muitos problemas. ... têm drogas, junto com o PCC entrou as drogas muito forte, e pega as pessoas, dá mesmo e vão nos lugares pobres.

^{xii} Aqueles que acreditam que a maior expressão de Deus no universo veio através de uma família pobre, uma mulher solteira que engravida numa sociedade machista, mobilizada pela máquina do império greco romano e Deus escolheu o jeito mais ridículo de se manifestar na história que era uma criança. A gente tem que entender que a nossa razão de ser é a pessoa pobre, porque Deus se fez homem na pobreza. Então há algo de Deus para as populações pobres e a gente aprende ao servir o pobre mais de Deus.

^{xiii} Os pobres têm algo a ensinar sobre o Reino, os pobres e humildes é que são relevantes na história de Deus para o universo, não os poderosos cheio de glória ... A gente quer operar nessa visão de mundo, aprender com eles.

^{xiv} Pra mim significa que o CADI está aqui pra realmente mostrar que o pobre, não é “não é tão pobre assim”. Tem gente que fala, ah é pobre, miserável. Num é assim.

^{xv} a fé cristã opera como se fosse um grande framework. É o nosso pano de fundo. Lembre que toda nossa conversa parte da perspectiva de que o Cristianismo é uma cosmovisão, então nós acessamos a problemática da pobreza e as consequências dela pela visão de mundo do Cristianismo.

^{xvi} a pobreza é decorrência direta de uma quebra de relacionamento a respeito das intenções originais de Deus para o todo da criação.

^{xvii} Nós existimos para atuar em contextos de pobreza física material mesmo, porque a gente entende que isso tem a ver, de novo, com os plenos desígnios de Deus, nós entendemos pobreza como fruto da queda. É, não era o desígnio original da criação, ontológica, da ordem criacional. A questão do pobre nós vemos como um dos desígnios de Deus mesmo que na ordem criacional haveria provisão para todos né, dizia lá né, será tudo para seu mantimento, em Gênesis 1 e 2. Mesmo Depois com o estabelecimento de Israel, tá lá, para que entre ti não haja pobre.

^{xviii} A gente tá muito alinhado com a ideia da realidade da pobreza multidimensional, que é uma noção que o brasileiro, até tecnicamente opera isso, a pobreza ela é multidimensional. Ela tem expressões estéticas, sociais, psicológicas e também econômicas. Logo, nós podemos empreender ações de enfrentamento à pobreza, pela perspectiva da estética: quais são os efeitos estéticos da pobreza? Quais são os efeitos culturais? Etc. Por isso que o CADI empreende com as ações na arte, na cultura, etc.

^{xix} Ah sim, são vulneráveis. Esses dias aqui até o CADI telefonou pra polícia que tava um cara tirando os cornos pra fora e mostrando pras crianças. Estão sempre, tem sempre tem um ou outro. A gente quando começa a ficar parado, passa perto da gente pra pedir informação, a gente já assim sabe, estão tem essa preocupação. Aqui é muito arriscado andar a noite ... agora tá dando aula pra adultos ali a noite. E ali sempre tem a numeração de rapaziada fumando maconha, sabe, tipo crack, então sempre o camburão tá passando pra lá e pra cá ali, sabe a noite, e quando é a noite mesmo a rapaziada sai dali gritando, berrando sabe, fazendo escândalo no meio da rua, jogando as coisas, lixo que deixam ali, jogam na rua, então a polícia sempre tá por ali.

^{xx} Vulnerabilidade, ah, estar vulnerável, pra mim estar vulnerável a todo tipo de situação. Vulnerabilidade tem a ver com falta de cuidado, com abandono, com crianças que ficam, às vezes, o dia inteiro na rua porque os pais precisam trabalhar. Outros pais não querem cuidar, porque às vezes podem e não fazem, então é estar à mercê, sabe. Estar a mercê do que tem aqui no bairro, droga, violência, já existiram gangues ... a gente sabe que tem a turminha do fervo que vai pra né, pra bagunçar, inclusive nas escolas. Então assim, é você estar a mercê disso. Sem cuidado, muitas vezes dos pais, sem o cuidado da sociedade.

^{xxi} Vulnerabilidade é alguém estar vulnerável a algo né. Pra mim é isso, então aqui dentro a gente tem muitas crianças que são vulneráveis em relação às suas próprias famílias, por exemplo. Em relação à violência que sofrem dentro de casa. Em relação à falta de alimentação, falta de atenção, sabe. É dentro de suas casas, que elas são vulneráveis. Porque a criança e adolescentes, eles não têm completa responsabilidade sobre si, né, obvio, então a falta de atenção para eles ali, pra mim os torna vulneráveis assim. Toda essa violência que a gente vê aqui.

^{xxii} Vulnerabilidade, no nosso contexto, é a criança estar propícia ao que a sociedade está oferecendo. Ser vulnerável na questão de estar rodeada da violência e muitas vezes a violência parta de dentro de casa mesmo. [Ser] vulnerável a ter que negociar com o traficante, o passador que a gente fala né; se eu quero ter um futuro então vou vender isso pra mim ter um dinheiro fácil; [Ser] vulnerável nesse risco de se envolver com drogas, ou armas, então tem sempre esse risco. Então, a gente trabalha influenciando tantas crianças, prevenindo elas de serem tão vulneráveis, mesmo as maldades mesmo que escondido.

^{xxiii} ... eles me deixavam ficar, porque entendiam que na época eu era também uma criança vulnerável, assim né. Por mais que eu tinha condições de ter uma vida tranquila, não tinha necessidade físicas na minha casa, mas meus pais estavam longe de mim, então tinha essa vulnerabilidade também que não tava o tempo todo sendo cuidado.

^{xxiv} ...a gente fez 300 visitas domiciliares e comerciais, né, de comerciantes na comunidade. É, visitamos equipamentos públicos, outros projetos. E a gente perguntava pra comunidade o que ela esperava de mais um projeto social ali. Quando foi em novembro de 2015, a gente teve a devolutiva, e aí pra enfrentar nosso maior problema que é a vulnerabilidade de criança e adolescente.

^{xxv} Então, você imagina essa criança, eh, ela teve 53 dias a menos sem aula, a menos de aula no ano letivo. Aí, você imagina, ela hoje não foi porque teve confronto, e no dia seguinte ela vai, mas como que é essa criança dentro da sala de aula, né. A gente já tem uma criança aí bem comprometida assim emocionalmente, cognitivamente, então isso acaba influenciando até mesmo no desenvolvimento dessa criança cognitivo.

A gente tem a questão do tráfico, por exemplo, lá de frente ao projeto, ao CADI, a gente tem o ponto de venda de drogas. Isso eu tô falando da questão do confronto entre as facções, fora quando tem a polícia, né, quando a polícia entre também tem o confronto, mas mortes, inocentes morrem.

Então quando o diagnóstico, ele orientou pra gente que as nossas ações deveriam ser pra combater essa vulnerabilidade, por conta do tráfico, da violência.

^{xxvi} Nós trabalhamos o tema vulnerabilidade quando a gente leva a criança e o adolescente a refletir se eles estão expostos ou não a uma situação que comprometa sua segurança. E, geralmente vulnerabilidade está relacionada com a ideia de que algo nunca vai acontecer com você. Quer seja um assalto, quer seja uma violência sexual, quer seja uma infecção pelo HIV, uma gravidez.

Qualquer um de nós somos sujeitos a um estupro, a um assalto, a uma bala perdida, a um assédio com um traficante de drogas, e ninguém está livre de ser afetado por esse tipo de violência ... também os problemas de meio ambiente, mudanças climáticas, todas essas questões sejam naturais ou não, os colocam em situação de vulnerabilidade.

^{xxvii} A vulnerabilidade é que a pessoa, tanto na pobreza, ela, eu vejo assim ela entra mais na pobreza ainda, porque ela não consegue sair por causa da mente, por causa da subnutrição, a mente dela não se desenvolveu, o emocional não se desenvolveu. E, aí pode também ter, e isso é uma coisa, ela não consegue se desenvolver tipo, não sabe gastar um dinheiro se ganha, não sabe comprar, ter o negócio ... o problema da doença mental, muito problema da doença mental ... é, os fatores de risco né, quem são os fatores de risco; são as crianças, eu ponho as mulheres, mães, eu coloco os idosos porque têm filhos que roubam os idosos ... e também as grávidas, e as adolescentes.

Risco social, eu acho que eles são vulneráveis.

Mas todo o pessoal que tá em fator de risco no sertão é vulnerável, tá.

Então, essa família que tá melhorando financeiramente, o marido sei pra beber outras coisas na cidade, ele é vulnerável, tá. Então, existem definições, mas eu vejo nesse sentido.

^{xxviii} Vulnerabilidade é uma noção técnica; é o risco que as comunidades estão expostas aos efeitos da pobreza.

^{xxxix} A vulnerabilidade é um conceito mais abrangente pra mim do que a própria pobreza, porque você pode ter, por exemplo, um adolescente que é milionário que é vulnerável em vários sentidos, a tipos de relacionamento abusivos, a carência afetiva. Então quando a gente tá falando em territórios de vulnerabilidade, a gente tá falando de territórios onde as pessoas estão mais sujeitas a terem direitos violados, a sofrerem violência, a sofrerem privação, tá, vulnerabilidade tem a ver com isso, com essa maior probabilidade de sofrer os efeitos da violação de direitos e da privação em todos os sentidos.

Hoje ser criança e adolescente no Brasil, independente da condição social é estar numa condição de vulnerabilidade, não importa o nível, por isso o conceito de vulnerabilidade vai para além da questão da renda. Pra mim, ele é mais amplo do que pobreza.

^{xxx} Eu escrevi pra [Assistente social do CADI], pelo amor de Deus, por favor, preciso falar com você ... aí eu com fé em Deus rezando, pedindo pra Deus que [Assistente social do CADI] que me ajudasse naquela hora que eu tava desesperada ... pedindo uma solução.

Aí ela [Assistente social do CADI] pegou o carro, tadinha, já de manhã cedo, pegou o carro e me levou lá na delegacia, como tava tudo fechado voltamos lá no conselho. Aí chegou lá daí o rapaz pediu pra me acalmar, levei a documentação deles, o que eu tinha papel que o juiz tinha me dado e tudo, daí fui lá, me ajudou muito a funcionária, também ela vem sempre praqui.

^{xxxii} Primeiro, proteção pra gente é o que a gente tem feito. É mostrar pras crianças que existe um lugar seguro, que o CADI é um lugar seguro pra elas. É um lugar onde elas podem conversar, um lugar onde elas podem falar das dificuldades, dos problemas.

Pra eles poderem falar, de poderem pedir socorro, de poderem ensinar também aonde e pra quem eles podem pedir socorro porque muitas vezes eles não sabem.

O Conselho Tutelar que é um parceiro do CADI, nós trabalhamos em rede também é pra eles irem lá pedir socorro.

^{xxxiii} ... ensinar pra eles isso, que eles podem se proteger, a gente tem um tema específico ... isso é o Claves. Então são as partes públicas e privadas, como que a criança pode se defender.

A gente trabalha com a questão do adulto, a gente tem alguns casos de mães né, que a gente precisa prestar socorro. A gente precisa ensinar também né, teve um caso de uma mãe que a gente teve que conversar, instruir até ela chegar a abrir um BO pro marido ser afastado da casa porque ele agredia não só as crianças, mas agredia a mãe também.

Ele foi retirado da casa, ele se tocou que tava perdendo ... pediu socorro. Ele conhecia nossos pastores porque ela é membra da nossa igreja. Pediu ajuda, foi colocado numa clínica de recuperação, se recuperou mesmo hoje.

^{xxxiiii} Proteção, eu entendo proteção como você livrar alguma pessoa, ou cercar ela de cuidados, né, eu vejo assim. Então é, olhando pra como o CADI agi em Fazenda Rio Grande hoje, eu percebo que a nossa luta é pra proteger a criança e o adolescente e pra garantir os direitos dela. Eu acho que quando a gente garante esses direitos, informando e dizendo pra elas, informando mesmo sabe, deixando elas conhecerem seus direitos e seus deveres a gente tá protegendo, porque ela vai saber pra onde correr, o que falar.

Então pra mim a proteção é isso, é quando você informa, quando você também luta contra o que tá deixando a criança em algum risco. Então pra mim, a proteção é isso, é cercar de tudo que a gente puder assim né.

^{xxxiv} A gente tem mesmo parceria com a Rede de Proteção né, então, como eu preciso fazer vários encaminhamentos. A gente não vai conseguir atender todo mundo ... a política de assistência fala que a gente precisa estar na Rede de proteção, porque a gente precisa uns dos outros pra resolver os problemas. Não só um órgão vai resolver tudo.

^{xxxv} Proteção é tomar algumas escolhas difíceis até nessa questão de tirar o filho da própria família porque a família tem sido negligente ou a família tem causado alguma coisa à criança.

^{xxxvi} Então proteção é você se colocar em risco por uma vida ... digamos assim, pra proteger uma criança, um adolescente, uma vida em si.

^{xxxvii} É o olhar que a gente tem pra cada uma delas, você recebe muitas crianças e assim ... eu gosto de reconhecer cada uma delas. E essa proteção, esse olhar é o olhar que traz a proteção, né, eu vejo ali onde há vulnerabilidade, onde há demanda em que a gente pode contribuir pra que essa criança, essa família esteja protegida.

^{xxxviii} Então, a gente tinha até o ano passado, a gente iniciou um grupo chamado Maré jovem que é um grupo de jovens e adolescentes, onde a gente trazia alguns assuntos e a gente começou um olhar a partir da nossa comunidade, e a gente identificou na época uma comunidade muito vulnerável que a gente tem lá, que é a Maclarem, que era um antigo estaleiro, e é uma comunidade em baixo de um viaduto, muito muito pobre, é, e aí a gente identificou, a gente sabe que aquele espaço é um espaço de ocupação e que não teria como a gente, ah, fazer casa, porque é um lugar provisório ... e aí a gente conseguiu doação de caixas d'água ... o mínimo que a gente pode fazer é dar um pouco de dignidade pra essa população. Em torno de 100 pessoas moram lá em barracos e a água vem num cano e é próximo ao esgoto ... a mesma água que fala o pé e lava louça é a água que se bebe.

Hoje o CADI, ele tem uma metodologia chamada Rede Polis que é de políticas públicas. Um trabalho pra gente poder aplicar com os nossos jovens e adolescentes

^{xxxix} Todo o esforço do CADI, é também no sentido de tornar a criança protegida dos riscos que a própria sociedade, a própria comunidade impõe sobre ela. Mesmo que sejam riscos naturais como enchente, como risco de incêndio, de desmoronamento de barreiras. Então, ela tem que estar, é, em condições de minimizar riscos.

A proteção, tanto na questão da violência comunitária, como a questão da proteção nas situações do meio ambiente, mais situações da má alimentação ... Então, a criança, a ela tem que ser oferecida as condições melhores possíveis e que ela se sinta segura no espaço em que ela frequenta.

Também, a proteção e a segurança passam por essa questão. Nós trabalhamos com a criança a socialização de que a sua alimentação deve ser o mais saudável possível ... como geralmente, o alimento mais é comercializado nos mercados e a maioria não tem qualidade, por conta do excesso de elementos que prejudicam a saúde, então nós trabalhamos a criança na segurança alimentar, onde ela começa a gostar e fazer opção pelo que é mais saudável possível pra ela. Nós trabalhamos também uma oficina de segurança alimentar, trabalhamos oficinas de preparo do alimento, do armazenamento do alimento.

^{x1} A proteção é, ah, a criança ela tá na casa dela, ela pode, ela é estuprada, abusada, alguma coisa geralmente é pai, pai, tio, avô, primo, é doméstico.

Outro de proteção, apanhar né, a mulher apanhando do marido, agressão, nós não temos na nossa área, mas assim, no CRAS eu tive muitos casos.

De idosos que precisam ser protegidos, lá no meu CRAS, porque é sertão, só tô falando isso porque nós não temos muito idoso no Pindoba, lá é mais jovem, é um povoado pequeno, os filho tomavam o dinheiro dos pais.

Aí vcs precisam proteger mesmo, a gente protege e faz a denúncia, agora eu tenho muito preocupação com denúncia ... eu falo pra você eu não confio muito no conselho tutelar, eu trabalhei no CRAS.

^{xli} ...proteção é mais uma noção técnica na área da assistência social, que a gente opera.

O governo tipifica no marco regulatório da política pública de assistência a noção de proteção, de assegurar acesso aos direitos. Tudo isso está no arcabouço teórico do trabalho do CADI que desemboca em ações concretas. Por exemplo, a nossa organização tem uma política de proteção à criança. O voluntário vai fazer um serviço voluntário no CADI, ele tem que assinar um compromisso com a legislação do Brasil a respeito dos direitos da criança e do adolescente, isso é uma medida prática que eu asseguro que alguém acessa nossas crianças conhecendo que ela tem direitos específicos. Então é uma noção técnica.

^{xlii} A noção de proteção, que é uma noção técnica, aqui é e aplicar medidas preventivas. No Brasil a gente tem medida preventiva e protetiva. Protetiva é quando o direito já foi violado, então eu tenho que é, assegurar que a violência não devesse acontecer com aquela pessoa, família ou comunidade. Então essa é a noção técnica de proteção à criança, por exemplo. Então eu tenho medidas que garantem que não haverá violação dos direitos. É, o CADI pretende ser uma organização que protege, cria ambientes seguro pra criança, adolescente e a comunidade. É nesses termos que a gente tá falando de proteção. Talvez o diferencial aqui é que a gente faz isso a partir da noção do caráter de Deus para cara criança e adolescente e comunidade.

^{xliii} Por exemplo, temos metodologias de prevenção ao abuso e a violência onde a própria criança conhece sobre seus direitos. Esse é uma das metodologias que o CADI usa. Temos uma política de proteção da infância, nas nossas unidades, onde a criança, os colaboradores, eles tem que, é, tem que conhecer essa política, não expor a criança a comportamentos e situações de risco, por exemplo, ela não ficar não dormir na casa de um educador, uma criança apadrinhada não receber a visitar de uma padrinho diretamente sem a intermediação da nossa equipe, porque pode ser um pedófilo, várias questões.

E de fortalecimento das competências familiares também. Na proteção da criança, algumas unidades trabalham até com geração de renda por exemplo. A questão da proteção, é, não é o nosso forte, mas algumas unidade trabalham com isso né.

A questão da proteção, é o empoderamento de crianças e adolescentes até, por exemplo, na questão do monitoramento de serviços e políticas públicas.

^{xliv} Geralmente são rodas de conversa onde a gente extrai da Bíblia, é, elementos que vão contribuir com a transformação daquela vida com empoderamento, com a criação de capacidades protetivas praquela família à partir das escrituras também. Ela não tem uma preocupação proselitista, mas ela passa princípios bíblicos pra comunidade.

^{xlv} Eles têm potencialidade, agora que eu falei, se tivesse canto aqui pra eles era uma maravilha porque eles cantam bem mesmo ... eles são muito inteligentes, sabe, são inteligentes, lógico que a criança é assim ele sempre tem um pouco de rebeldia, cada um tem o jeito de ser, a [assistente social] falou: todos eles têm uma maneira de agir né, tem um jeito dele né. Então a gente tem que focar nesse tipo aí, e tentar entender eles né.

^{xlvi} ...é mais fácil falar isso com uma situação específica, tinha um, a situação de um menino que ele era péssimo na escola, com déficit de aprendizagem, comportamento terrível, em nenhuma oficina ele se adaptava, e ele foi fazer robótica.

Foi fazer robótica, e ele começou a se identificar, começou a trabalhar com várias coisas, e foi melhorando, melhorou o comportamento dele no colégio, melhorou o comportamento dele na casa, então assim, já mudou a questão da educação dele ... ele começou a ajudar em casa, começou a mexer com coisas, montava um negócio e consertava, sabe e mostrando pra ele que ele, e muito inteligente, muito inteligente. Então assim, mostrando pra ele que ele poderia ser algo diferente do que o pai era, do que o meio dele tava mostrando né.

^{xlvii} Potencializar é dar poder né, é dar potencial, aproveitar o potencial dessas crianças. O que que a gente percebe assim, muitas dessas crianças, falo principalmente crianças e adolescentes que é o nosso maior foco. A gente percebe todo o potencial pra uma vida plena, um desenvolvimento pleno, pra uma profissão, pra enfim, mas elas não têm a oportunidade de, de explorar esse potencial. De florescer verdadeiramente.

^{xlviii} Potencialidade pra mim é quando a pessoa entende o que ela tem de melhor, ou o que ela tem pra oferecer, ou o que ela algo que ela não conhecia e que ela desenvolve, pra mim é o potencial dela. Mas aqui dentro, eu acho que o potencial do CADI é desenvolver essas pessoas. Desenvolver no sentido, por exemplo, as crianças que a gente tem aqui, elas não sabem que elas são boas no esporte, então quando elas entram a gente vai desenvolver o potencial dela naquilo. Algumas vão desenvolver o potencial, vão realmente despontar pro esporte outras não. Eu acho que nosso papel aqui pra desenvolver, isso é, abrir o caminho pra essas crianças, né, e pra essas mães que nós atendemos aqui também. Pra que se encontrem, pra que se descubram, né.

^{xlix} Potencialidade é algo que fica sempre guardado no coração de muitas pessoas dentro dela. Então, é, como CADI gerar potencialidade, é uma coisa muito essencial.

¹ Tem, mas muitas vezes ele não consegue se descobrir desta forma, tipo assim, ah, eu tenho resiliência, eu permaneço firme, mesmo contra todas dificuldades contra mim, talvez o papel do CADI, talvez uma das coisas seja isso, tipo: cara, você pode conseguir independente do que aconteça, possa vir te derrubar ou te tirar do caminho, você vai conseguir conquistar suas coisas, vai poder sonhar, vai poder alcançar. O CADI tá aqui pra servir mesmo de trampolim pras crianças crescerem alcançar e almejar os seus sonhos e não só pra eles, mas como a família em si.

^{li} Nós acreditamos que toda criança por si mesmo tem seu potencial que precisa ser descoberto, explorado, fortalecido. E nenhuma criança, por mais pobre que seja, ela é um zero a esquerda. Ela tem que descobrir seus dons e talentos, sua capacidade e aprender e explorar isso de maneira que isso fortaleça a sua autoconfiança, a sua autoestima, e a sua vontade de sonhar e de vivenciar seus sonhos e de continuar lutando até chegar alcançar esses sonhos. Cada uma delas precisam saber, se perceber como um sujeito de direito como um protagonista da comunidade em que está inserida.

^{lii} O sertanejo é visto na cidade como um nada. Eu vou na feira e vejo as pessoas sabe, sendo mal tratadas. Então a gente dá empoderamento pras mulheres, pros idosos. A gente fala, não você tem 60 anos, você vai passar na frente.

^{liii} Empoderamento pra mulher é porque ela é importante, eu sempre falo pra ela ir bem vestida.

^{liv} Potencialidade é, nós acreditamos radicalmente que os recursos necessários para a superação da situação da pobreza estão na própria comunidade. Nesse sentido a gente não tem uma expectativa de que as grandes soluções, dos grandes investidores vão resolver todos os problemas da pobreza.

^{lv} Potencializar é dar poder né, é dar potencial, aproveitar o potencial dessas crianças. O que que a gente percebe assim, muitas dessas crianças, falo principalmente crianças e adolescentes que é o nosso maior foco. A gente percebe todo o potencial pra uma vida plena, um desenvolvimento pleno, pra uma profissão, pra enfim, mas elas não têm a oportunidade de, de explorar esse potencial. De florescer verdadeiramente.

^{lvi} várias histórias bíblicas inspiram nossa reflexão. Por exemplo, Jesus estava no meio de uma situação e uma multidão esfomeada. E aí os discípulos de Jesus dizem: - Jesus manda embora essa multidão esfomeada porque a gente não tem dinheiro pra resolver o problema delas. E aí um dos discípulos descobre que tem um menino com uma marmita, 5 pães e 2 peixes. E a partir do pequeno recuso de um menino no meio de uma multidão esfomeada, Jesus opera um milagre e alimenta a multidão. O evangelho é o evangelho que descobre o potencial inerente das comunidades e é bem o esteio dessa história que a gente quer operar nossa metodologia de desenvolvimento.

^{lvii} Descobrir em Deus, com a comunidade o potencial que ela tem. Qual é a vocação que essas comunidades têm. E a partir de ali, trazer o input que o CADI tem pra alavancar o efeito disso, trazendo benefício de superação da pobreza nessas comunidades. Daí os projetos do CADI são resultados de um diagnóstico comunitário, onde a gente escuta a comunidade. Sempre a comunidade tem um papel ativo, um agente, é um agente claro da construção da solução.